

Erin Roeder, Treasurer Susan Kent, Secretary Elaine Young, Assistant Secretary

## COMMUNITY BOARD NO. 2, MANHATTAN

3 WASHINGTON SQUARE VILLAGE NEW YORK, NY 10012-1899 www.cb2manhattan.org

P: 212-979-2272 F: 212-254-5102 E: info@cb2manhattan.org
Greenwich Village • Little Italy • SoHo • NoHo • Hudson Square • Chinatown • Gansevoort Market

May 10, 2011

Robert B. Tierney, Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission One Centre St., 9<sup>th</sup> Floor North New York, New York 10007

Dear Chairman Tierney:

At its Full Board meeting on April 21, 2011, CB#2, Manhattan (CB#2-Man.), adopted the following resolution:

# **1**<sup>ST</sup> LANDMARKS MEETING

1 - LPC Item:11 - 84 Wooster Street (s.e. Spring) – SoHo-Cast Iron Historic District
A Beaux-Arts/Classical style mercantile building designed by Albert Wagner, built in 1895-96.
Application is to replace diamond plate at the sidewalk with concrete.

**Whereas,** the applicant asserted – without a shred of evidence – that diamond plating is a safety concern due to slipping hazards. However, a long-time SoHo resident affirmed that the claim is patently untrue. If anything, the raised diamond design serves as treads, which provide traction, the way the treads of a good rain tire provide stability and traction in the street; and

Whereas, further, the assertion by the applicant that the diamond plating is a maintenance problem was similarly contradicted by resident testimony. The glass vault lights that were originally placed in the metal lattice may indeed have leaked. That is why diamond plating was: it works well and is much easier to maintain than the glass crystals. The resident reported that he has lived in two different buildings in SoHo over a thirty-five year period, and that these diamond plates require little or no maintenance once they are laid properly, nor has he witnessed or heard of a single person slipping on any of the many diamond plates that abound in this district; and, further

Whereas, it is commonplace for property owners in the Cast-Iron Historic District to add or replace this plating. The element is iconic to the neighborhood, and reflects the presence of the unique vault lights that it covers; and

**Whereas,** replacement of the diamond plating is a common practice with numerous approvals by the Commission; now

**Therefore, be it resolved** that CB#2, Man. recommends denial of this application.



Erin Roeder, Treasurer Susan Kent, Secretary Elaine Young, Assistant Secretary

## COMMUNITY BOARD NO. 2, MANHATTAN

3 WASHINGTON SQUARE VILLAGE NEW YORK, NY 10012-1899 www.cb2manhattan.org

P: 212-979-2272 F: 212-254-5102 E: info@cb2manhattan.org
Greenwich Village • Little Italy • SoHo • NoHo • Hudson Square • Chinatown • Gansevoort Market

May 10, 2011

Robert B. Tierney, Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission One Centre St., 9<sup>th</sup> Floor North New York, New York 10007

Dear Chairman Tierney:

At its Full Board meeting on April 21, 2011, CB#2, Manhattan (CB#2-Man.), adopted the following resolution:

## 2 - LPC Item:12 - 20 Bond Street (n.e. Lafayette)— NoHo Historic District

A Romanesque Revival/Renaissance Revival style store and loft building, designed by Cleverdon & Putzel and built in 1894-95. Application is to install a painted wall sign.

**Whereas,** the applicant presented historical photos of signage on this wall; indeed, some ghost signs remain. However, signs were added to the façade in the early 20<sup>th</sup>-century, after Lafayette Street was gashed and widened, exposing some secondary façades. No evidence was presented to show signage prior to the widening of Lafayette Street; and

**Whereas,** this neighborhood actually had little or no signage until about fifteen years ago, just prior to designation, when first one, and then other, gross, super-sized, unattractive signs appeared that now detract from the character of this historic district. The last thing it needs is more signage, post designation; and

Whereas, the applicant provided no photos of a sign in this location in many, many decades; and

Whereas, the pretense that this is a work of art to benefit the community was not supported in any way; and

Whereas, the applicant, to his credit, did not try to hide the fact that this sign is just a precursor to a commercial sign in the not too distant future; now

Therefore, be it resolved that CB#2, Man. recommends denial of this application.



Erin Roeder, Treasurer Susan Kent, Secretary Elaine Young, Assistant Secretary

## COMMUNITY BOARD NO. 2, MANHATTAN

3 WASHINGTON SQUARE VILLAGE NEW YORK, NY 10012-1899 www.cb2manhattan.org

P: 212-979-2272 F: 212-254-5102 E: info@cb2manhattan.org
Greenwich Village • Little Italy • SoHo • NoHo • Hudson Square • Chinatown • Gansevoort Market

May 10, 2011

Robert B. Tierney, Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission One Centre St., 9<sup>th</sup> Floor North New York, New York 10007

Dear Chairman Tierney:

At its Full Board meeting on April 21, 2011, CB#2, Manhattan (CB#2-Man.), adopted the following resolution:

**3 - LPC Item:13 - 306 Bowery** (Bleecker/Houston)— NoHo East Historic District A Federal Style house built in 1820. Application is to legalize the replacement of dormers in noncompliance with Certificate of Appropriateness 06-7270

Whereas, it is rare to see a group of disparate owners take such great care and diligence in preserving an old building's historical features; and

Whereas, accidents happen. In this case, a dormer replacement looks a little flatter than the one approved. That is regrettable; but

Whereas, the error is so slight, so barely visible to the average pedestrian, and so costly to rectify, as to be a non-issue; now

Therefore, be it resolved that CB#2, Man. recommends approval of this application; and,

**Further, be it resolved** that CB#2, Man. highly commends the degree of excellence this small realestate partnership of creative people applied in maintaining this old Federal gem, not to benefit their bottom line, as we see so often on the Bowery, but because their building and the NoHo Historic district deserve it.

Vote: Unanimous, with 41 Board members in favor.

4 - 16 Jane Street (Christopher) - Greenwich Village Historic District LAID OVER



Erin Roeder, Treasurer Susan Kent, Secretary Elaine Young, Assistant Secretary

## COMMUNITY BOARD NO. 2, MANHATTAN

3 WASHINGTON SQUARE VILLAGE NEW YORK, NY 10012-1899 www.cb2manhattan.org

P: 212-979-2272 F: 212-254-5102 E: info@cb2manhattan.org
Greenwich Village • Little Italy • SoHo • NoHo • Hudson Square • Chinatown • Gansevoort Market

May 10, 2011

Robert B. Tierney, Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission One Centre St., 9<sup>th</sup> Floor North New York, New York 10007

Dear Chairman Tierney:

At its Full Board meeting on April 21, 2011, CB#2, Manhattan (CB#2-Man.), adopted the following resolution:

**5 - LPC Item:16 -** 75 Christopher Street, aka 116-18 7th Avenue, aka 218-224 West 4th Street – Greenwich Village Historic District

A two-story commercial building designed by Phelps Barnum and built in 1932.

Application is to install storefront infill.

Whereas, the proposal will improve the existing condition, and the design resembles the bank infill and facade located around the corner in the same building, which was recently approved by the Commission; now

**Therefore**, be it resolved that CB#2, Man. recommends approval of this application.



Erin Roeder, Treasurer Susan Kent, Secretary Elaine Young, Assistant Secretary

## COMMUNITY BOARD NO. 2, MANHATTAN

3 WASHINGTON SQUARE VILLAGE NEW YORK, NY 10012-1899 www.cb2manhattan.org

P: 212-979-2272 F: 212-254-5102 E: info@cb2manhattan.org
Greenwich Village • Little Italy • SoHo • NoHo • Hudson Square • Chinatown • Gansevoort Market

May 10, 2011

Robert B. Tierney, Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission One Centre St., 9<sup>th</sup> Floor North New York, New York 10007

Dear Chairman Tierney:

At its Full Board meeting on April 21, 2011, CB#2, Manhattan (CB#2-Man.), adopted the following resolution:

**6 - LPC Item:17 - 9 West 11th Street** (Fifth Ave)- Greenwich Village Historic District by Joseph G. Wells, and built in 1844-46; the Gothic Revival style chapel, designed by McKim, Mead and White, and built in 1893-94; and the Prairie School style church house, designed by Edgar Tafel, and built in 1958-60. Application is to replace bluestone sidewalks

Whereas, this grand church was designed by the noted architect, Joseph Wells, who, incidentally, along with his colleague, Richard Upjohn, the architect for the Church of the Ascension directly across the street as well as Trinity Church, were both founding members of the AIA in 1857; and

Whereas, when queried by board members, the applicant revealed that this violation was initiated because a lawsuit by someone who filed a claim with the City, alleging that they tripped on the old bluestone. Apparently, this may be the first reported serious tripping-incident in almost 200 years; and

**Whereas,** the lawsuit against the City precipitated a violation from a sister agency, the Department of Transportation, which noted that the 19<sup>th</sup>-century sidewalks abutting the church property no longer met the agency's standards; and

**Whereas,** even if this lawsuit were to have merit, surely the Department of Transportation has a mechanism for these special cases, like a waiver for minor irregularities-in-grade of historic sidewalks; and

**Whereas,** old churches with weathered bluestone paving are iconic with Olde New York. We think of Trinity, St. Paul's and others; and

Whereas, the applicant noted that there was roughly a \$100,000 difference in repairing the bluestone versus installing new concrete. We recall it being something like \$350,000 vs. \$250,000; but

Whereas, the applicant provided no financial evidence that the church was unable to come up with that additional dollar amount, nor was the possibility of seeking financial incentives available for these types of preservation efforts discussed; and

Whereas, there is significant amount of bluestone remaining that indicates an incremental introduction of concrete over the years. Board members wondered why isn't more of the bluestone being preserved, other than the small amount proposed in front of the entrance gates; now

Therefore, be it resolved that CB#2, Man. recommends denial of this application; and

**Further, be it resolved** that CB#2, Man. urges the DOT to cooperate with LPC to waive minor irregularities-in-grade, and to replace only those portions where difference in grade present a severe hazard; and

**Further, be it resolved** that CB#2, Man. recommends a compromise: namely, the applicant gather all the remaining bluestone, and run a long, unbroken stretch of it, with the remainder of the sidewalk then filled in with concrete.



Erin Roeder, Treasurer Susan Kent, Secretary Elaine Young, Assistant Secretary

## COMMUNITY BOARD NO. 2, MANHATTAN

3 WASHINGTON SQUARE VILLAGE NEW YORK, NY 10012-1899 www.cb2manhattan.org

P: 212-979-2272 F: 212-254-5102 E: info@cb2manhattan.org
Greenwich Village • Little Italy • SoHo • NoHo • Hudson Square • Chinatown • Gansevoort Market

May 10, 2011

Robert B. Tierney, Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission One Centre St., 9<sup>th</sup> Floor North New York, New York 10007

Dear Chairman Tierney:

At its Full Board meeting on April 21, 2011, CB#2, Manhattan (CB#2-Man.), adopted the following resolution:

**7 - LPC Item:18 - 12 West 12th Street** (Fifth Ave) - Greenwich Village Historic District A Gothic Revival style church complex, comprised of the church, designed by Joseph G. Wells, and built in 1844-46; the Gothic Revival style chapel, designed by McKim, Mead and White, and built in 1893-94; and the Prairie School style church house, designed by Edgar Tafel, and built in 1958-60. Application is to construct additions on the ground floor and roof of the church house, and alter an existing ramp and a path in the garden between the church and church house. Zoned R10

Whereas, the proposed ramp and the path do not detract from the site; but

Whereas, the church house, designed by the recently deceased Edgar Tafel, collaborator with Frank Lloyd Wright, is one of the few Prairie School style buildings on the East Coast. It is unique and special. It adds not only to the building and the historic district, but to this city and

Whereas, the applicant claimed that the fifty-year old windows of the church house were not as energy-efficient as modern windows. However many buildings, some centuries old, continue to maintain their original windows by installing adequate insulation. Or else the owners install new, efficient, replacement windows identical in historical style; and

**Whereas,** the proposed gate disturbs the line, as well as some of the original fabric, of the old iron fence that surrounds the church grounds, as well as dramatically altering the streetscape of West 12<sup>th</sup> Street; and

Whereas, we wonder why the applicant just doesn't simply modify the existing fence to accommodate a new gate in the same style as the existing old fence; and

Whereas, this building's primary facades are of exceptional historical, architectural and aesthetic importance. The enclosure of the arcade and destruction of the facade on the west side of the arcade and the removal of a portion of the iron fence and the construction of a new masonry fence on the north side are unacceptable alterations to this valuable building; and

Whereas, the applicant presented no convincing evidence that any these alterations were necessary in order for the church to fulfill its charitable purpose; now

**Therefore, be it resolved** that CB#2, Man. recommends denial of the portion of the application that seeks to modify the existing fence; and, further, urges the applicant and LPC to come to an arrangement that preserves the fence's integrity; and,

**Further, be it resolved** that CB#2, Man. recommends denial of the portion of the application that seeks to modify Tafel's design for the church house;



Erin Roeder, Treasurer Susan Kent, Secretary Elaine Young, Assistant Secretary

## COMMUNITY BOARD NO. 2, MANHATTAN

3 WASHINGTON SQUARE VILLAGE NEW YORK, NY 10012-1899 www.cb2manhattan.org

P: 212-979-2272 F: 212-254-5102 E: info@cb2manhattan.org
Greenwich Village • Little Italy • SoHo • NoHo • Hudson Square • Chinatown • Gansevoort Market

May 10, 2011

Robert B. Tierney, Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission One Centre St., 9<sup>th</sup> Floor North New York, New York 10007

Dear Chairman Tierney:

At its Full Board meeting on April 21, 2011, CB#2, Manhattan (CB#2-Man.), adopted the following resolution:

**8 - LPC Item:19 - 139 West 13th Street** (Sixth/Seventh)- Greenwich Village Historic District A Greek Revival style rowhouse built in 1845. Application is to legalize the installation of a stoop gate without Landmarks Preservation Commission permits.

Whereas, the gates are not historical; but

Whereas, we are concerned with selective enforcement. The applicant stated that there are other fences on the block installed without LPC permits, yet she is the only one cited; and

**Whereas,** a spokesman for the 100 Block Association as well as several neighbors appeared in support of the applicant's request for legalization, and talked of the problems that block has with people sleeping on the steps. It is close to 14<sup>th</sup> Street; now

**Therefore, be it resolved** that CB#2, Man. recommends that the Commission reach a determination for all the illegal gates on this block, not on a case-by-case basis, but instead strive for a cohesive policy.



Erin Roeder, Treasurer Susan Kent, Secretary Elaine Young, Assistant Secretary

## COMMUNITY BOARD NO. 2, MANHATTAN

3 WASHINGTON SQUARE VILLAGE NEW YORK, NY 10012-1899 www.cb2manhattan.org

P: 212-979-2272 F: 212-254-5102 E: info@cb2manhattan.org
Greenwich Village • Little Italy • SoHo • NoHo • Hudson Square • Chinatown • Gansevoort Market

May 10, 2011

Robert B. Tierney, Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission One Centre St., 9<sup>th</sup> Floor North New York, New York 10007

Dear Chairman Tierney:

At its Full Board meeting on April 21, 2011, CB#2, Manhattan (CB#2-Man.), adopted the following resolution:

**9 - LPC Item:20 - 149 West 13th Street** (Sixth/Seventh)- Greenwich Village Historic District A Greek Revival style house built in 1847-48, and altered c. 1920's. Application is to reconstruct the stoop, install a new entrance, areaway, ironwork, and a new cornice, and construct a rooftop addition. Zoned R6

Whereas, the rooftop addition is barely visible; and

Whereas, the restoration proposed is tasteful and contributes to the building; now

Therefore, be it resolved that CB#2, Man. recommends approval of this application.



Erin Roeder, Treasurer Susan Kent, Secretary Elaine Young, Assistant Secretary

## COMMUNITY BOARD NO. 2, MANHATTAN

3 WASHINGTON SQUARE VILLAGE NEW YORK, NY 10012-1899 www.cb2manhattan.org

P: 212-979-2272 F: 212-254-5102 E: info@cb2manhattan.org
Greenwich Village • Little Italy • SoHo • NoHo • Hudson Square • Chinatown • Gansevoort Market

May 10, 2011

Robert B. Tierney, Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission One Centre St., 9<sup>th</sup> Floor North New York, New York 10007

Dear Chairman Tierney:

At its Full Board meeting on April 21, 2011, CB#2, Manhattan (CB#2-Man.), adopted the following resolution:

**10 - LPC Item:21 - 765 Greenwich Street** (- Greenwich Village Historic District A Greek Revival style rowhouse built in 1838. Application is to install a roof deck and railings

Whereas, adjacent buildings display verdant rooftops; and

Whereas, the railing and roof deck are not clearly visible from the street; now

**Therefore, be it resolved** that CB#2, Man. recommends approval of this application.



Erin Roeder, Treasurer Susan Kent, Secretary Elaine Young, Assistant Secretary

## COMMUNITY BOARD NO. 2, MANHATTAN

3 WASHINGTON SQUARE VILLAGE NEW YORK, NY 10012-1899 www.cb2manhattan.org

P: 212-979-2272 F: 212-254-5102 E: info@cb2manhattan.org
Greenwich Village • Little Italy • SoHo • NoHo • Hudson Square • Chinatown • Gansevoort Market

May 10, 2011

Robert B. Tierney, Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission One Centre St., 9<sup>th</sup> Floor North New York, New York 10007

Dear Chairman Tierney:

At its Full Board meeting on April 21, 2011, CB#2, Manhattan (CB#2-Man.), adopted the following resolution:

11 - LPC Item:22 - 28 7th Avenue South (Leroy/Morton) - Greenwich Village Historic District A one-story brick building built in 1921.

Application is to enlarge masonry openings, install new storefront infill and alter the roof.

Whereas, it seemed that the applicant wanted to put his brand on the building: for instance, the proposal for rustic, barn-wood doors to match the doors of his other restaurant around the corner, those doors being installed prior to the designation of the Greenwich Village 2 Historic District incidentally; and

Whereas, we thought the fenestration was too high; but the architect was amenable to lowering the glass back to the height of the existing lintel; and

Whereas, the proposed design doesn't reflect the character of this historic district or this block of brick buildings; and

**Whereas,** what we are offered is just as confused as what exists presently. The proposal is a mixing of styles, like a Greek-Revival lamp next to oversized modern windows, flanked by salvaged, farmhouse doors; now

**Therefore, be it resolved** that CB#2, Man. recommends denial of this application.



Erin Roeder, Treasurer Susan Kent, Secretary Elaine Young, Assistant Secretary

## COMMUNITY BOARD NO. 2, MANHATTAN

3 WASHINGTON SQUARE VILLAGE NEW YORK, NY 10012-1899 www.cb2manhattan.org

P: 212-979-2272 F: 212-254-5102 E: info@cb2manhattan.org
Greenwich Village • Little Italy • SoHo • NoHo • Hudson Square • Chinatown • Gansevoort Market

May 10, 2011

Robert B. Tierney, Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission One Centre St., 9<sup>th</sup> Floor North New York, New York 10007

Dear Chairman Tierney:

At its Full Board meeting on April 21, 2011, CB#2, Manhattan (CB#2-Man.), adopted the following resolution:

**12 - LPC Item:23 - 48 Carmine Street -** Greenwich Village Historic District Extension II An altered Renaissance Revival style tenement building with a commercial ground floor designed by Marshall L. Emery and built in 1894. Application is to replace storefront infill and a bracket sign.

**Whereas** the Landmarks Preservation Commission's publication *The Certificate of Appropriateness Public Hearing: Information for Applicants* states that "applicants are strongly encouraged to contact the Community Board to arrange for review of the proposal before the public hearing"; and

**Whereas** the applicant did not contact the Community Board or appear before the Landmarks Committee to present this application; now

**Therefore, be it resolved** that CB#2, Man. recommends denial of this application in the absence of this important step in the review process.



Erin Roeder, Treasurer Susan Kent, Secretary Elaine Young, Assistant Secretary

## COMMUNITY BOARD NO. 2, MANHATTAN

3 WASHINGTON SQUARE VILLAGE NEW YORK, NY 10012-1899 www.cb2manhattan.org

P: 212-979-2272 F: 212-254-5102 E: info@cb2manhattan.org
Greenwich Village • Little Italy • SoHo • NoHo • Hudson Square • Chinatown • Gansevoort Market

May 10, 2011

Robert B. Tierney, Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission One Centre St., 9<sup>th</sup> Floor North New York, New York 10007

Dear Chairman Tierney:

At its Full Board meeting on April 21, 2011, CB#2, Manhattan (CB#2-Man.), adopted the following resolution:

**13 - LPC Item:24 - 1-3 Little West 12th Street** – Gansevoort Market Historic District A neo-Grec style store and loft building, designed by Peter J. Zabriskie, and built in 1887, and a vernacular style warehouse, designed by John G. Michel, and built in 1918-19. Application is to modify parapets and install storefront infill

Whereas, the parapet modification is compatible with the style of the building; and

Whereas, there was no lighting or signage schemes presented; and

Whereas, removing the security gates and retaining the cast iron is commendable; but

Whereas, we felt that the doors' glazing had too many lights, and that metal doors and muntins would be preferable to the proposed wooden material. Our suggestion seeks to harmonize the proposed fenestration with the original cast-iron pilasters of the building, as well as honoring the historic district's industrial feel; now

**Therefore, be it resolved** that CB#2, Man. recommends approval in general, but suggests that metal be used instead of wood for the fenestration.



Erin Roeder, Treasurer Susan Kent, Secretary Elaine Young, Assistant Secretary

## COMMUNITY BOARD NO. 2, MANHATTAN

3 WASHINGTON SQUARE VILLAGE NEW YORK, NY 10012-1899 www.cb2manhattan.org

P: 212-979-2272 F: 212-254-5102 E: info@cb2manhattan.org
Greenwich Village • Little Italy • SoHo • NoHo • Hudson Square • Chinatown • Gansevoort Market

May 10, 2011

Robert B. Tierney, Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission One Centre St., 9<sup>th</sup> Floor North New York, New York 10007

Dear Chairman Tierney:

At its Full Board meeting on April 21, 2011, CB#2, Manhattan (CB#2-Man.), adopted the following resolution:

#### 14 – Nomination of the Bowery to the State and Federal Register of Historic Districts

Whereas, nomination to, or inclusion in, the Registers does not subject a property to the restrictions of New York City's Landmarks Law. Indeed, the Register really has no restrictions regarding what an owner can do with property in these districts; but

Whereas, it does seek to preserve historic buildings by offering incentives for their restoration, which is admirable and should be encouraged; and

**Whereas,** the nomination is supported by civic groups Cooper Square Committee and the Bowery Alliance of Neighbors; now

**Therefore, be it resolved** that CB#2, Man. supports the nomination of the Bowery in the State and Federal Register of Historic Districts.



Erin Roeder, Treasurer Susan Kent, Secretary Elaine Young, Assistant Secretary

## COMMUNITY BOARD NO. 2, MANHATTAN

3 WASHINGTON SQUARE VILLAGE NEW YORK, NY 10012-1899 www.cb2manhattan.org

P: 212-979-2272 F: 212-254-5102 E: info@cb2manhattan.org
Greenwich Village • Little Italy • SoHo • NoHo • Hudson Square • Chinatown • Gansevoort Market

May 10, 2011

Robert B. Tierney, Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission One Centre St., 9<sup>th</sup> Floor North New York, New York 10007

Dear Chairman Tierney:

At its Full Board meeting on April 21, 2011, CB#2, Manhattan (CB#2-Man.), adopted the following resolution:

# 2<sup>ND</sup> LANDMARKS MEETING

**15. - Item 18 - 50 Howard Street** (Mercer/Bdwy) - SoHo-Cast Iron Historic District An Italianate style store and loft building built in 1860. Application is to install flagpoles.

Whereas, the applicant presented an historical lithograph depicting the New York State Soldier's Depot, a government building at that time with an American flag. This a precedent for a flag, but not necessarily for a commercial banner; and

Whereas, for commercial signage, we usually prefer to see blade signs of modest scale, not large banners; but

**Whereas,** this is quite a large building with a 50-foot frontage, so the proposed commercial banner at 16 square feet would not overpower the building nor detract greatly from it. Further, the flagpole and banner do not extend beyond the sidewalk ramp, which is a nice touch; and, further,

Whereas, presently, this is a relatively desolate backwater of the Historic District, and it could be reasonably argued that the business has a stronger basis for requesting more aggressive signage announcing its presence than a store on a busy street in the core of the district would have; and

Whereas, the installation of the flagpole does not destroy historical material; and

Whereas, the proposal for a small blade sign on the Mercer Street side is a reasonable request; and

Whereas, the vinyl lettering on the windows are modest and in scale; but

Whereas, the request to cover the transom lights with red and black, horizontally striped, vinyl detracts from the building and is without precedent. The rationale that the applicant offered - that the pattern represents the design style that the clothier chooses to be in vogue this year - was not convincing. To wit: If striped transoms are in vogue and permitted this season, will we permit polkadot transoms if the designer feels that is to be the trend next year?; now

**Therefore, be it resolved** that CB#2, Man. recommends approval of the blade sign on Mercer Street, and the flagpole and commercial banner on Howard; but,

**Further, be it resolved** that CB#2, Man. recommends denial of the request for vinyl-covered transoms, and suggests traditional transparent transoms be used.



Erin Roeder, Treasurer Susan Kent, Secretary Elaine Young, Assistant Secretary

## COMMUNITY BOARD NO. 2, MANHATTAN

3 WASHINGTON SQUARE VILLAGE NEW YORK, NY 10012-1899 www.cb2manhattan.org

P: 212-979-2272 F: 212-254-5102 E: info@cb2manhattan.org
Greenwich Village • Little Italy • SoHo • NoHo • Hudson Square • Chinatown • Gansevoort Market

May 10, 2011

Robert B. Tierney, Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission One Centre St., 9<sup>th</sup> Floor North New York, New York 10007

Dear Chairman Tierney:

At its Full Board meeting on April 21, 2011, CB#2, Manhattan (CB#2-Man.), adopted the following resolution:

**16. - Item 19 - 560 Broadway** (Prince through to Crosby)- SoHo- Cast Iron Historic District A store building designed by Thomas Stent and built in 1883-84. Application is to remove fire escapes.

Whereas, the fire escapes are not original, not exceptionally attractive, and no longer required by Code; and

Whereas, their removal would expose more of the façade of this grand building; now

**Therefore, be it resolved** that CB#2, Man. recommends approval of this application.

Vote: Unanimous, with 41 Board members in favor.

17. – Item 20 – 103 Prince Street LAID OVER



Erin Roeder, Treasurer Susan Kent, Secretary Elaine Young, Assistant Secretary

## COMMUNITY BOARD NO. 2, MANHATTAN

3 WASHINGTON SQUARE VILLAGE NEW YORK, NY 10012-1899 www.cb2manhattan.org

P: 212-979-2272 F: 212-254-5102 E: info@cb2manhattan.org
Greenwich Village • Little Italy • SoHo • NoHo • Hudson Square • Chinatown • Gansevoort Market

May 10, 2011

Robert B. Tierney, Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission One Centre St., 9<sup>th</sup> Floor North New York, New York 10007

Dear Chairman Tierney:

At its Full Board meeting on April 21, 2011, CB#2, Manhattan (CB#2-Man.), adopted the following resolution:

**18. - Item 21 - 240 Mercer Street aka 667-681 Broadway and 2-6 West 3rd Street -** NoHo H.D. A Modern style residence hall designed by Benjamin Thompson & Associates and built in 1979. Application is to install a flagpole.

Whereas, the banner at 6' by 8' is very large, but so is the building; so the banner is not out of scale; and

Whereas, it is placed high off the ground and will not block the view of a pedestrian; now

Therefore, be it resolved that CB#2, Man. recommends approval of this application



Erin Roeder, Treasurer Susan Kent, Secretary Elaine Young, Assistant Secretary

## COMMUNITY BOARD NO. 2, MANHATTAN

3 WASHINGTON SQUARE VILLAGE NEW YORK, NY 10012-1899 www.cb2manhattan.org

P: 212-979-2272 F: 212-254-5102 E: info@cb2manhattan.org
Greenwich Village • Little Italy • SoHo • NoHo • Hudson Square • Chinatown • Gansevoort Market

May 10, 2011

Robert B. Tierney, Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission One Centre St., 9<sup>th</sup> Floor North New York, New York 10007

Dear Chairman Tierney:

At its Full Board meeting on April 21, 2011, CB#2, Manhattan (CB#2-Man.), adopted the following resolution:

#### 19. - Item 22 – 69 Washington Place (MacDougal/Sixth)

A Greek Revival style house built in 1842.

Application is to construct a rear yard addition and replace a window. Zoned R7-2

Whereas, the proposed addition is barely visible from the street; and

Whereas, the materials proposed are appropriate; and

Whereas, the proposed window for the walk-in closet would just be one more of many on that secondary façade, and not will detract from the building; now

Therefore, be it resolved that CB#2, Man. recommends approval of this application

Vote: Unanimous, with 41 Board members in favor.

20. - Item 23 - 16 Jane Street - Greenwich Village Historic District LAID OVER



Erin Roeder, Treasurer Susan Kent, Secretary Elaine Young, Assistant Secretary

## COMMUNITY BOARD NO. 2, MANHATTAN

3 WASHINGTON SQUARE VILLAGE NEW YORK, NY 10012-1899 www.cb2manhattan.org

P: 212-979-2272 F: 212-254-5102 E: info@cb2manhattan.org
Greenwich Village • Little Italy • SoHo • NoHo • Hudson Square • Chinatown • Gansevoort Market

May 10, 2011

Robert B. Tierney, Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission One Centre St., 9<sup>th</sup> Floor North New York, New York 10007

Dear Chairman Tierney:

At its Full Board meeting on April 21, 2011, CB#2, Manhattan (CB#2-Man.), adopted the following resolution:

#### 21. - Item 24 - West 4th Street at Jane Street and 8th Avenue - Greenwich Village H.D.

An irregular street grid laid out c. 1790.

Application is to extend the curb line and install plantings, paving and seating.

Whereas, members of the community attended the presentation and joined us in thanking the Department of Transportation and Speaker Quinn for seeking to beautify this little triangular patch of land; but

**Whereas,** the street grid of Greenwich Village is its oldest element, preceding any of the extant buildings in the historic district, a district whose quirky and historical street grid is renowned, giving us the oddity, for example, of the intersection of West 4<sup>th</sup> and West 10<sup>th</sup> Streets; and

Whereas, this location may well have been part an old Indian path even before it was a Colonial trail; and

Whereas, this section of West 4<sup>th</sup> Street has not been de-mapped; and

Whereas, the proposal does little to honor and highlight the fact that this public plaza is actually built on the roadbed of this old trail; and

**Whereas,** the applicant was reluctant to consider inserting a clearer delineation for the old roadbed than what is currently proposed: that is, a thin granite band. It would be regrettable if future generations would think that West 4<sup>th</sup> ended at Jane Street and did not continue beyond that point; and

Whereas, the applicant was not receptive to our suggestions to mark the old roadbed in a better defined, yet inexpensive, manner, say, by using tinted vs. non-tinted pavers, or different shaped blocks, or different colored paving, or scored concrete; and

Whereas, we found it ironic installing a sitting area in the middle of an old roadway, which installation would only further erase any trace or memory of what had existed there for centuries; and

Whereas, the members of the public who attended the meeting objected to having a seating area in that location, not only because it was out of context with its historical use, but because the seating would draw people late at night from the many bars in the area, and could cause great disruption of their peace, quiet and sleep; and

Whereas, these citizens included the president, as well as an officer, of the co-op building right next to this proposed public plaza, the 31 Jane Street Corp, a building with some 100 units, and with windows a mere 13 feet from this seating proposal. In fact, forty tenants took the time and effort to email the community board expressing their opposition to this seating proposal.

Additionally, the co-op has written a letter to Chairman Tierney expressing strong disfavor with the planned seating.

Further, the vice-president of the Jane Street Block Association also appeared before the community board, rejecting the proposed seating plan. No one from the public testified that having seating in the middle of an historical old roadbed made any sense, or that the proposed granite-block seating contributed anything to the Historic District; and

Whereas, the granite-block seating is massive, clunky, and inappropriate to the historic district in style and material, adding nothing except detraction of the Greenwich Village aesthetic; and

Whereas, the reasons offered by the applicant for the unattractive seating arrangement - the need for public seating - is belied by the presence nearby of not one, but two, public parks (Abingdon Square and Jackson Square) with ample seating just a block away in either directions; and

**Whereas,** perhaps in an attempt to justify the obfuscation of the remnants of a native American roadway, the applicant stated that "native plants" are planned for the landscaping. However, only one of the six plants proposed is native, the coneflower. The rest are imports – mostly from Asia; for example, Russian Sage, daffodils, liriope and fountain grass; now

**Therefore, be it resolved that,** we would like to see more of a nod from the applicant that West 4<sup>th</sup> is a timeworn, centuries-old road, as well as recognition that this proposal is not consistent with the concept of an historical roadway that we would like to see remembered, and,

**Further, be it resolved** that the seating incorporates a style and material disharmonious with the Greenwich Village Historic District; and,

Further, be it resolved that CB#2, Man. recommends denial of this application unless the applicant:

1) more clearly defines and delineates the historical roadway that existed in this location for centuries, and not sweep it away as proposed, and

2) remove the unappealing granite-block seating that is out of context in style and material with the aesthetic of the Greenwich Village Historic District, as well as being incongruous when placed in the middle of a road.

The above resolution that was sent to the LPC from the Landmarks Committee on May 2, 2011 should be disregarded. It was ruled out of order at the April Full Board meeting because a separate resolution regarding the Jane Street Triangle had already been passed at CB#2, Man.'s March Full Board meeting and sent to the LPC.



Erin Roeder, Treasurer Susan Kent, Secretary Elaine Young, Assistant Secretary

# COMMUNITY BOARD NO. 2, MANHATTAN

3 WASHINGTON SQUARE VILLAGE NEW YORK, NY 10012-1899 www.cb2manhattan.org

P: 212-979-2272 F: 212-254-5102 E: info@cb2manhattan.org
Greenwich Village • Little Italy • SoHo • NoHo • Hudson Square • Chinatown • Gansevoort Market

May 10, 2011

Robert B. Tierney, Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission One Centre St., 9<sup>th</sup> Floor North New York, New York 10007

Dear Chairman Tierney:

At its Full Board meeting on April 21, 2011, CB#2, Manhattan (CB#2-Man.), adopted the following resolution:

- 22.- Item 25 15 Little West 12th Street Gansevoort Market Historic District LAID OVER
- 23. Item 26 410 West 13th Street Gansevoort Market Historic District LAID OVER



Erin Roeder, Treasurer Susan Kent, Secretary Elaine Young, Assistant Secretary

## COMMUNITY BOARD NO. 2, MANHATTAN

3 WASHINGTON SQUARE VILLAGE NEW YORK, NY 10012-1899 www.cb2manhattan.org

P: 212-979-2272 F: 212-254-5102 E: info@cb2manhattan.org
Greenwich Village • Little Italy • SoHo • NoHo • Hudson Square • Chinatown • Gansevoort Market

May 10, 2011

Robert B. Tierney, Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission One Centre St., 9<sup>th</sup> Floor North New York, New York 10007

Dear Chairman Tierney:

At its Full Board meeting on April 21, 2011, CB#2, Manhattan (CB#2-Man.), adopted the following resolution:

**24.** – **Item 27 - 803-807 Washington Street** (Gansevoort/Horatio)- Gansevoort Market H.D. Three Greek Revival style rowhouses, built ca. 1841 and altered in 1922 by Charles H. Briggs. Application is to install storefront infill and signage.

Whereas, the proposal will improve the building, unifying the storefronts and removing awnings and security gates; and

Whereas, the material and style were consistent with the district's character; but

Whereas, the proposed lighting fixture was too modern; and

Whereas, the storefront bulkhead, at 8 inches, was too low for a building of this age and style; now

**Therefore, be it resolved** that CB#2, Man. recommends approval of this application, but recommends more traditional lighting fixtures, and a bulkhead more in keeping with that in the tax photo, that is, one about 18" high.

Please advise us of any decision or action taken in response to this resolution.

Sincerely,

Jo Hamilton, Chair Community Board #2, Manhattan

to Hamlh

Sean Sweeney, Chair Landmarks & Public Aesthetics Committee Community Board #2, Manhattan

JH/fa

cc: Hon. Jerrold L. Nadler, Congressman

Hon. Sheldon Silver, State Assembly Speaker

Hon. Thomas K. Duane, NY State Senator

Hon. Daniel L. Squadron, NY State Senator

Hon. Deborah J. Glick, Assembly Member

Hon. Scott M. Stringer, Man. Borough President

Hon. Christine C. Quinn, Council Speaker

Hon. Margaret Chin, Council Member

Hon. Rosie Mendez, Council Member

Lolita Jackson, Manhattan Director, CAU

Andrew Berman, Greenwich Village Society for Historic Preservation

Jenny Fernandez, Director of Government & Community Relations,

**Landmarks Preservation Commission** 

David Reck, Land Use & Development Committee, CB#2, Man.