

1 **MANHATTAN COMMUNITY BOARD 4**

2 July 23, 2014

3 Fulton Center Auditorium, 119 Ninth Avenue (17/18)

5 **PUBLIC HEARING**

7 **Public Comment** – FY16 District Needs Statement - Annual statement of the Community District's needs
8 for use in preparation for the Fiscal Year 2016 budget

10 **MEETING AGENDA**

12 Public Session	Hugh Weinberg
13 Adoption of Agenda	Christine Berthet
14 Adoption of Last Month’s Minutes	Christine Berthet
15 Manhattan Borough President	Diana Howard
16 Local Elected Officials	Various
17 District Manager Report	Robert J. Benfatto, Jr.
18 Chair Report/Committee Reports	Christine Berthet

22 Chair Christine Berthet called the meeting to order at 6:45 p.m.

24 **PUBLIC HEARING:**

25 Chair Berthet introduced Burt Lazarin to present for public comment the FY16 District Needs Statement
26 -- an annual statement of the community district's needs for use in preparation of the Fiscal Year 2016
27 budget. Mr. Lazarin explained that, as part of the budget process, CB4 annually prepares a statement of
28 needs and is beginning to work on the statement for FY 2016. He noted that the statement for FY 2015 is
29 available on the CB4 website. Mr. Lazarin invited public comments for the FY16 statement. There were
30 no public comments. He stated that he would continue to report on this process at subsequent meetings
31 and closed the public hearing,

34 **PUBLIC SESSION:**

35 Hugh Weinberg called on the members of the public who signed up to speak. The public spoke on the
36 following topics:

- 38 1. *Agenda Items 1 and 39 (Clinton Towers, 790 Eleventh Avenue)*. Four individuals, all residents of
39 this building, spoke in opposition to this application for an O/P license at a planned restaurant in
40 Clinton Towers, with adjoining outdoor space. They thanked the Board for its efforts on behalf
41 of their community and its quality of life. They stated that residents opposed the restaurant and
42 that it would seriously harm their quality of life.
- 43 2. *Agenda item 45 (sidewalk café at Barchetta, 461 West 23rd Street)*. Four individuals, including
44 the president of the London Terrace Tenants Association, spoke against this sidewalk café, stating
45 that it was not a community amenity, was an unacceptable precedent on a residential block, and
46 would lower quality of life and property values for nearby residents. They urged the Board to
47 defer voting until the zoning issues regarding the proposed café had been resolved. One

1 individual spoke in favor of the applicant, stating that the applicant was a good operator and that
2 the café would barely extend beyond the fenced garden to the east. The attorney for the
3 applicant, Donald Bernstein, noted that the applicant had twice revised its sidewalk café plans in
4 response to community and Board concerns and that the hours and size of the present proposed
5 café were well below those recommended by CB4 guidelines.

- 6 3. *Agenda Item 38 (Affordable Housing Plan)*. Three individuals spoke regarding this plan. One
7 urged the Board to consider the effect of the plan on SRO buildings. A second asked if
8 affordable housing was principally in rental buildings and was told that was case. A third asked
9 the Board to defer consideration of the plan until there had been community outreach. In
10 response to this last comment, Chair Berthet noted that the plan had previously been presented
11 and discussed at four separate public meetings of three different CB4 committees, all announced
12 in advance to the entire CB4 mailing list.
- 13 4. *Agenda Items 6 and 41 (Highline Hotel, 180 Tenth Avenue)*. Two individuals representing the
14 West 400 Block Association spoke regarding these two items. With respect to Item 6, to alter the
15 hotel's liquor license in connection with the hotel's outdoor space, they urged the denial of the
16 application unless the applicant satisfied the stipulations agreed to with the BLP Committee,
17 including no music or amplified sound outdoors and a stand-up bar only. With respect to Item
18 41, they expressed their appreciation for the draft letter from the Quality of Life Committee and
19 hoped this would help resolve the noise issues.
- 20 5. *Agenda Item 48 (St. Joseph's Immigrant Home)*. One individual, a tenant organizer, spoke
21 regarding the Saint Joseph's Immigrant Home. She noted that residents there were facing
22 draconian rent increases and thanked the Board for its efforts to date.
- 23 6. One individual spoke about a bus problem at West 37th Street and Tenth Avenue, noting that
24 buses abuse the layover spaces added to West 37th Street and block the intersection.
- 25 7. One individual spoke about the lack of sidewalk cleaning on West 37th and 38th Streets between
26 Ninth and Tenth Avenues. He noted that the blocks were undeveloped and therefore up to the
27 city to clean, which was not happening. He added that the homeless have taken up residence on
28 these blocks, which have a high amount of foot traffic. In response, Chair Berthet stated that a
29 new Business Improvement District would encompass these blocks and should be providing an
30 additional source of cleaning beginning in September or October.
- 31 8. One individual spoke in favor of efforts to maintain and improve Clement Moore Park.
- 32 9. One individual spoke about the "pooper scooper" law and urged community members to clean up
33 after their dogs.

34 35 36 37 **LOCAL ELECTED OFFICIALS:**

38
39 **Assemblymember Dick Gottfried** stated that, after 17 years of effort, medial use of marijuana is now
40 legal in New York. He stated his dissatisfaction that the city approved two separate entrances for a
41 building containing affordable housing, noting that HPD had approved this saying that the technical
42 zoning language gave them no choice.

43
44 **State Senator Brad Hoylman** congratulated Assemblymember Gottfried on the passage of the medical
45 marijuana bill, noting that Senator Hoylman's predecessor Tom Duane had also championed the bill. He
46 stated that Port Authority today voted to approve \$90 million for renovation of the terminal and noted that
47 the community really wants a new terminal with bus swing space to get buses off the streets. With
48 respect to illegal bus stops, Senator Hoylman stated police were cracking down on them in Chinatown
49 and that he wanted the police to do the same in this district. He noted the loud construction noise on West

1 25th Street, stating that the city had revoked the site's permit for weekend work, but that he was still
2 working to end the after-works weekday work.
3
4

5 **ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA AND THE MINUTES OF THE MAY 2014 FULL BOARD**
6 **MEETING:**
7

8 With respect to the agenda, Chair Berthet stated that Item 32 would be broken up into Items 32A and
9 32B, with the letter labelled and distributed as Item 49 now being considered as Item 32B. Sarah
10 Desmond stated that Item 39 consisted of two letters -- one to the Department of Housing Preservation
11 and Development and a second letter to the Department of City Planning -- with a related letter to the
12 SLA appearing at Item 1. With those changes, the agenda was adopted.
13

14 The Minutes of the June 2014 Full Board Meeting were adopted without amendment.
15
16

17 **REPORTS OF ELECTED OFFICIALS:**
18

19 **Diana Howard, for Borough President Gale Brewer**, stated that the Borough President's monthly
20 report was available in the back of the meeting room. She called attention to the summer meals program
21 for school-age children and the Arts Forward report (also available at the meeting).
22

23 **Jacqueline Blank, for Congressman Jerrold Nadler**, stated that the congressman's newsletter was
24 available in the back of the meeting room or on-line. She stated that the congressman was disappointed
25 by the Supreme Court decision in the Hobby Lobby case, regarding the use of religious beliefs to deny
26 aspects of health care coverage, and had introduced legislation to prohibit for-profit employers from using
27 religious beliefs to deny health care coverage.
28

29 **David Baily, for State Senator Adriano Espailat**, reported that the state has allowed NYC to reduce its
30 speed limit to 25 mph and to expand the use of speed cameras. The state senate also passed a bill that
31 seeks to reduce paperwork in the office of victim services to allow that office to focus on helping victims.
32

33 **Jeffery LeFrancois, for Councilmember Corey Johnson**, stated that participatory budgeting is coming,
34 with the next informational session scheduled for July 29th. Together with Borough President Brewer,
35 Councilmember Johnson has launched the Westside Senior Supported Agriculture Food Bag Program,
36 which supplies a mixed bag of fresh, locally-grown produce every other week for \$8.00.
37

38 **Ed Sullivan, for Public Advocate Letitia James**, noted that, although special education programs take
39 place all year, some buses used for those programs are not air-conditioned, a problem for children with
40 issues like asthma. The Public Advocate is working on this, as well as looking into voting facilities that
41 are not good for the disabled.
42
43

44 **AFFORDABLE HOUSING PLAN (AGENDA ITEM 38)**
45

46 Prior to considering the committee letters and resolutions, Chair Berthet called on Joe Restuccia to
47 present the CB4 Affordable Housing Plan, which will be discussed and voted on as Agenda Item 38.
48 Mayor de Blasio has announced he wants more affordable housing, with the locations and details still to

1 be worked out. To get out in front on this issue, CB4 has been working on an affordable housing plan.
2 Mr. Restuccia and the Clinton Housing Development Company volunteered to work on the plan, together
3 with Sarah Desmond and the CB4 Land Use Committees.
4

5 Mr. Restuccia stated that CB4 will be the first community board to develop a specific plan to implement
6 the city's general plan. The goal was to take all of CB4's and the community's knowledge in this area
7 and assess where things stood and what direction they should move in. Three CB4 committees --
8 Housing, Health and Human Services; Chelsea Land Use; and Clinton/Hell's Kitchen Land Use -- were
9 involved in the development of the plan.
10

11 The key themes of the plan, consistent with CB4 past positions are:

12 1. Inclusionary housing should be 30% affordable, not 20%. This is consistent with CB4's position
13 in 2004 with respect to Hudson Yards. Unlike Mayor Bloomberg, Mayor de Blasio will support
14 requirements rather than incentives. CB4 also seeks to broaden income bands, with affordable housing
15 for low-moderate and middle income residents.
16

17 2. Many HPD sites have been around for years, with their development held up. Under Mayor de
18 Blasio, CB4 wants to bring these sites to fruition.
19

20 3. Publicly-owned sites should be identified and brought into the affordable housing arena, often
21 while preserving their original use (such as building housing on top of a bus garage).
22

23 Mr. Restuccia stated that CB4 has the largest number of affordable housing units in the city, with 1,947
24 units added since 2004. There should be proposals like tax incentives to make expiring affordable
25 housing permanently affordable.
26

27 Mr. Restuccia then outlined several major issues regarding affordable housing:

28 The mayor favors studios and one bedrooms. CB4 seeks more family-sized apartments, with at least 50%
29 of the affordable units being two bedrooms or bigger.

30 We are one city and therefore seek equality in how these buildings are built. Developers want lesser
31 finishes in the affordable units, and today's regulations only require that affordable units be on 65% of the
32 floors. The law needs to be changed so that people are truly living together.

33 The environmental review process looks at buildings individually and does not look at the cumulative
34 impact of all the projects in an area. There should be changes in how the city looks at these issues.

35 Illegal hotels are a destabilizing influence in small buildings and residential blocks. The city should
36 develop specific procedures to enforce regulations against illegal hotels.
37

38 Mr. Restuccia then went through the PowerPoint presentation that had previously been presented to three
39 CB4 committees: Housing, Health and Human Services; Chelsea Land Use; and Clinton/Hell's Kitchen
40 Land Use.

41 The presentation groups affordable housing sites into several categories: sites under construction; sites
42 with completed public review; sites under public review; sites in the HPD development pipeline; and sites
43 for proposed development. Mr. Restuccia reviewed the number of buildings and total potential affordable
44 units in each category in the district. He then discussed proposed rezoning and zoning text amendments
45 to promote affordable housing goals.
46

47 Mr. Restuccia stated that, if the plan were achieved, 10,000 affordable apartments would be added in the
48 district. He noted that the plan makes clear to the city that CB4 has used its experience and expertise to
49 produce a thoughtful, unified plan. He thanked all who worked on the plan, who are listed at the end of

1 the plan.

2
3 Chair Berthet thanked Mr. Restuccia for all his work on this comprehensive plan.

4
5 **REPORT OF DISTRICT MANAGER ROBERT J. BENFATTO:**

6 No report.

7
8 **REPORT OF MCB4 CHAIR CHRISTINE BERTHET:**

9 No report.

10
11
12 **COMMITTEE LETTERS AND RESOLUTIONS:**

13
14 **Business Licenses and Permits Committee (BLP)**

15 The following items were bundled: 2-5, 7-17 (**APPROVED WITH AMENDMENTS, AS BELOW:**)

- 16 Item 2: Letter to DCA re 654 Ninth Avenue - Cara Mia
17 Item 3: Letter to SLA re 75 Ninth Avenue - Friedmans
18 Item 4: Letter to SLA re 169 Eighth Avenue - Coopers Craft and Kitchen
19 Item 5: Letter to SLA re 176 Eighth Avenue - Fat Tiger
20 Item 7: Letter to SLA re 197 Seventh Avenue - El Coco
21 Item 8: Letter to SLA re 226 West 23rd Street - El Quijote
22 Item 9: Letter to SLA re 228 West 18th Street - El Cocotero
23 Item 10: Letter to SLA re 305 West 52nd Street - Melt Shop
24 Item 11: Letter to SLA re 314 West 53rd Street - Room 53
25 Item 12: Letter to SLA re 318 West 23rd Street - Patsys Pizzeria
26 Item 13: Letter to SLA re 364 West 46th Street - Goggan
27 Item 14: Letter to SLA re 537 Ninth Avenue - Better Being
28 Item 15: Letter to SLA re 686 Ninth Avenue - Amarone
29 Item 16: Letter to SLA re 688 Tenth Avenue - Havana Social
30 Item 17: Letter to SLA re 764 Tenth Avenue - Crispin's Hell's Kitchen

31
32 *BLP Committee co-chair Frank Holozubiec noted that, although there were 19 items coming out of the*
33 *June and July BLP meetings, only one of those was a recommended approval for a fully new on-premises*
34 *liquor license. That one new on-premise license was for an establishment in Chelsea Market that was*
35 *already operating without serving liquor. The remaining items were transfers of ownership, alterations*
36 *to already-licensed premises, licenses to locations that had been previously licensed, or wine and beer*
37 *licenses.*

38
39 *Jay Marcus noted that two of the bundled items, Item 4 and Item 17, had stipulations requiring the*
40 *applicants to meet with the relevant block associations, and he asked if those meetings had occurred.*
41 *Because there was no confirmation that those meetings had taken place, he made a friendly amendment,*
42 *which was accepted, that votes in favor of Items 4 and 17 be subject to confirmation regarding the block*
43 *association meetings.*

1 Item 1: Letter to SLA re 790 Eleventh Avenue – An Entity in which Kurt Kalm is Principal
2 **(APPROVED)**

3 *Mr. Holozubiec explained that this was an application for a new restaurant with outdoor space that*
4 *sought to open in Clinton Towers, a Mitchell-Lama development on Eleventh Avenue between 54th and*
5 *55th Streets. The Housing, Health, and Human Services Committee, as well as elected officials, have*
6 *been involved with tenant complaints in this building, and tenants -- several of whom spoke in the public*
7 *session -- oppose and have serious concerns about a restaurant opening in this space. There are two*
8 *parallel letters (Item 39) coming out of the Housing, Health, and Human Services Committee, and Mr.*
9 *Holozubiec turned the discussion over to Sarah Desmond of that committee to present both letters. He*
10 *stated that the BLP Committee was recommending that the SLA defer consideration of this application*
11 *until zoning issues are resolved, issues which Ms. Desmond then discussed.*

12 *Ms. Desmond stated that research had revealed severe limitations on commercial uses in this building*
13 *and restrictions on the use of outdoor space, which may have been designated as required open space.*
14 *Item 39 involves two proposed letters: a letter to the Department of Housing Preservation and*
15 *Development (HPD), which must approve the applicant's lease, asking that HPD not approve the lease*
16 *because of the zoning issues and consider those issues and other tenant concerns when reviewing any*
17 *other lease for this space, and a parallel letter to the Department of City Planning (DCP). Ms. Desmond*
18 *stated that meetings on these issues were occurring as recently as two days ago, so that some clean-up of*
19 *the letters will be necessary.*

20
21 *JD Noland asked what letter would be sent to the SLA. Mr. Holozubiec responded that the SLA letter*
22 *would be a short letter asking that the SLA not act on the application until the zoning and other issues are*
23 *resolved and enclosing the HPD/DCP letter.*

24
25 *Betty Macintosh asked why we did not take the position with the SLA that the application should be*
26 *denied. BLP Committee co-chair Paul Seres responded that this application did not fall within the 500*
27 *foot rule and that our position could be weakened without rulings from the other agencies on the zoning*
28 *and other issues. Accordingly, asking the SLA to defer would be the more strategic choice. Mr.*
29 *Restuccia added that more due diligence would be necessary on the zoning issues before CB4 took a*
30 *definitive position with the SLA.*

31
32
33 Item 6: Letter to SLA re 180 Tenth Avenue - The Highline Hotel **(APPROVED)**

34 *Mr. Seres explained that this application was an alteration to an existing hotel license to increase the*
35 *capacity of the front outdoor space. He outlined the stipulations to which the applicant had agreed,*
36 *including no music or amplified sound in the outdoor space and outdoor closing hours of 11:00 p.m. on*
37 *Fridays/Saturdays and 10:00 p.m. on other nights. Mr. Seres stated that the applicant had begun*
38 *operating a bar in the outdoor space, but closed the bar when CB4 brought to the applicant's attention*
39 *that the bar was not permitted until the alteration was approved by the SLA.*

40
41 *Chair Berthet asked what was approved at the BLP Committee regarding the outdoor bar and was told*
42 *that the committee approved a service bar -- a bar at which drinks could be made for waiter service and*
43 *at which no customers could sit or stand.*

44
45 *Jay Marcus stated that he recalled prior discussion about public access to the outdoor space. He was*
46 *told in response that the backyard outdoor space at the hotel remained open to the public.*

1 *At this point, the applicant and BLP co-chair Mr. Seres left the meeting to discuss the applicant's method*
2 *of operation and possible additional stipulations. The meeting continued with the subsequent agenda*
3 *items, as outlined below. Upon the return of the applicant and Mr. Seres, the discussion continued as*
4 *follows:*

5
6 *Mr. Seres explained that, instead of a service bar, the applicant now wanted to have a food bar at which*
7 *10 customers could sit, but with no alcohol being served from behind the bar. All alcohol would be*
8 *served by waiters from inside the hotel.*

9
10 *Ms. Macintosh asked if the 10 food bar seats would be in addition to the 94 seats in the front yard as*
11 *presently stipulated and was told that the 10 food bar seats were included in the 94-seat total.*

12
13 *Ms. Nicosia asked if there was outdoor seating only in front of the building and was told there is also*
14 *outdoor seating in the back yard*

15
16 *David Holowka asked if the bar structure had been approved by the Landmarks Commission.*

17
18 *Mr. Marcus asked if certain tables and chairs in the front yard could be set aside for public use. Mr.*
19 *Seres responded that the applicant's position is that the front yard remains private property.*

20
21 *Tina DeFelicianantonio stated that the community had concerns about noise levels of events at the hotel,*
22 *which the hotel was attempting to ameliorate.*

23
24 *Ernest Modarelli noted that there had been a series of noise complaints since the hotel opened and that*
25 *the hotel had been nothing but a nuisance since it came into the community. He asked why the Board was*
26 *even considering an alteration to allow more outdoor use.*

27
28 *John Sharp stated that the hotel operator had been before the Board several times already regarding*
29 *things such as labor and noise issues. Given this history, he expressed concern whether the operator*
30 *would actually adhere to whatever stipulations that it agreed to now.*

31
32 *Brett Firfer asked if the hotel operator had previously agreed to public access for the outdoor space.*
33 *Chair Berthet responded that there was nothing in the prior CB4 letters regarding public access.*

34
35 *With respect to nature of the bar, Mr. Restuccia said that the agreement at the BLP Committee was for a*
36 *service bar and that that term had always been understand to mean no seats at the bar. Yoni Bokser*
37 *agreed that, at the BLP Committee, the understanding was that this would be a bar at which no customers*
38 *were seated or served. The applicant's attorney Donald Bernstein responded that, because there was no*
39 *alcohol at this bar, it was not a service bar.*

40
41 *Mr. Seres observed that the application was for an alteration to a hotel license, which the SLA*
42 *historically does not deny.*

43
44 *Mr. Holozubiec stated that, at the BLP Committee, his concern was that once patrons were allowed to sit*
45 *at the bar, whether for alcohol or food, it would be difficult to ensure that no patrons beyond the seated*
46 *10 patrons were standing at or around the bar. He expressed the concern that the bar could become a*

1 noise problem.

2
3 *Following this discussion, the applicant agreed that, for the present, they would maintain the bar as a*
4 *service bar with no patron seating or standing at the bar and no alcohol service directly to patrons from*
5 *the bar. If the applicant seeks to convert this service bar to a food bar or anything other than a service*
6 *bar, the applicant will bring that proposal to the BLP Committee.*

7
8
9 **Item 45: Letter to DCA re sidewalk café - 461 West 23rd Street - Barchetta (APPROVED)**

10 *Mr. Holozubiec explained that this application involved a sidewalk café at an operating restaurant in*
11 *London Terrace. The applicant had revised its sidewalk café plans twice, reducing the capacity and*
12 *hours of the sidewalk café. At the May 13, 2014 meeting of the BLP Committee, the committee voted 6-2*
13 *to deny a prior version of the application. The applicant then reduced the proposed café to the terms of*
14 *the present application: 2 tables and 8 seats, with the café closed and vacated by 9:00 p.m. That revised*
15 *application was presented at the June 10, 2014 BLP Committee meeting, where it was approved by a 6-3*
16 *vote, subject to a determination that relevant zoning permitted a sidewalk café at this location.*

17
18 *Walter Mankoff asked if the London Terrace board had approved the café. Mr. Lazarin responded that*
19 *the commercial spaces in the buildings were condos with their own condo board. That condo board had*
20 *approved the café.*

21
22 *Mr. Sharp, noting that the café was now reduced to two tables, asked why there was a great need for such*
23 *a small café. If the café was aimed at making the existence of the restaurant known, he suggested that*
24 *might be accomplished with an awning, as prior occupants of this space had used.*

25 *Mr. Lazarin noted that there was a threshold issue regarding whether zoning even permitted a sidewalk*
26 *café at this location, an issue apparently that no one has yet been able to answer. He expressed his*
27 *frustration that we could not get an answer from the city on the zoning issue.*

28
29
30 **Item 18: Letter to SLA re 852 Ninth Avenue - Kashkaval Garden (APPROVED AS AMENDED)**

31 *Mr. Holozubiec stated that this was an application for backyard use at an operating restaurant with an*
32 *existing O/P license for its indoor space. He noted that the outdoor space was surrounded by and in*
33 *close proximity to many residential apartments and that the BLP Committee in the past had refused to*
34 *approve use of the outdoor space due to concerns about the residential neighbors. The applicant has now*
35 *proposed a structure to enclose most of the backyard. At the BLP Committee, the applicant sought to*
36 *keep the windows of this new proposed structure open, which was opposed by the neighbors. The*
37 *applicant therefore stipulated to keep the windows closed, but would be allowed to test the noise levels*
38 *with the windows open -- upon notice to and agreement of the neighbors and the Board.*

39
40 *Mr. Restuccia stated his belief that the structure did not comply with applicable zoning, which required*
41 *that a certain amount of backyard space be kept open and free of any structures. He will provide the*
42 *relevant provisions to Mr. Benfatto, who will discuss the zoning issues with the applicant.*

43
44 *By friendly amendment, which was accepted, the letter was modified to recommend denial if zoning did*
45 *not permit the contemplated structure and unless the applicant agreed to the stated stipulations.*

1 **Clinton/Hell's Kitchen Land Use Committee (C/HKLU)**

2 Item 19: Letter to DCP re West 42nd Street Auto Showroom Text (**APPROVED**)

3 *C/HKLU Chair Mr. Noland explained that this location would be a 60-story mixed-use building and that*
4 *the applicant wanted to have an auto showroom at the base of the building.*

5
6 Item 20: Letter to DCP re Special Clinton District - midblock rezoning proposal (**APPROVED**)

7 Item 21: Letter to BSA re extension of variance - 428 West 45th Street (**APPROVED**)

8
9 **Waterfronts, Parks and Environment Committee (WPE)**

10 The following items were bundled: 22, 23 (**APPROVED**)

11 Item 22: Letter to DPR re Clement Moore Park

12 Item 23: Letter to FHL and PDC re Conceptual Design of Section 3, Phase 2 of the High Line

13 *Lisa Daglian suggested that Commissioner Mitchell Silver be copied on the letters.*

14
15 **Chelsea Land Use Committee (CLU)**

16 The following items were bundled: 24, 25 (**APPROVED**)

17 Item 24: Letter to Hotel Trades Council re special permits for hotels

18 Item 25: Letter to LPC re 210 Tenth Avenue

19
20 **Transportation Committee (TRANS)**

21 The following items were bundled: 26-33, 47 (**APPROVED**):

22 Item 26: Letter to DOT re Taxi Relief Stand Request – Tenth Avenue (49/50)

23 Item 27: Letter to Access-A-Ride re Signage Request at Penn South, Building 10

24 Item 28: Letter to DOT re Noise from late night construction

25 Item 29: Letter to DOT re Chelsea Star Hotel – 300 West 30th Street – loading zone request

26 Item 30: Letter to DOT re Yotel – 570 Tenth Avenue – adjustment to hotel loading zone

27 Item 31: Letter to DOT re Alternate side parking request – West 19th Street (Sixth/Seventh)

28 Item 32: Letter to DOT re Bus congestion and pedestrian safety in Hell's Kitchen

29 Item 33: Letter to NYPD re Intercity bus enforcement and pedestrian safety in Hell's Kitchen

30 Item 47: Letter to MTA Transportation Reinvention Commission re public comments

31
32 *Item 34 was withdrawn.*

33
34
35 **Budget and Jobs Task Force**

36 Item 35: FY16 Statement of District Needs (**APPROVED**)

37 *Mr. Lazarin and Delores Rubin will send emails to the committee chairs asking that the chairs review the*
38 *relevant sections of the statement and offer any suggestions.*

39
40
41 **Executive Committee (EXEC)**

42 Item 36: Letter to HPD re 525 West 52nd Street - Lower Income Housing Plan (**APPROVED**)

43 Item 37: Letter to HPD re 540 West 53rd Street - CHDC Lower Income Housing Plan (**APPROVED**)

1 **Housing, Health & Human Services Committee (HH&HS)**

2 Item 38: Letter to HPD, etc. re Affordable Housing Plan (jointly with CLU and C/HKLU) (**APPROVED**
3 **AS AMENDED**)

4 *Mr. Mankoff congratulated those who worked on the plan on an excellent job. He expressed one*
5 *concern: that the plan encouraged the building of residential spaces in non-residential zones. This could*
6 *lead to inappropriate uses (such as bars, clubs, layover space for buses) next to residences. He suggested*
7 *adding a statement that uses unacceptable in residential zones should not be permitted if residences are*
8 *added nearby.*

9
10 *Mr. Marcus observed that the homeless population has grown considerably and wondered if the plan*
11 *should request additional infrastructure for the homeless. Mr. Restuccia stated that could be added to the*
12 *section on infrastructure.*

13
14 *Maarten de Kadt stated that he has long wanted an inventory of affordable housing and therefore*
15 *appreciates the work that went into the plan. Noting that the “devil is in the details,” he asked about*
16 *some apparent inconsistencies in the summary table at the end. Given that the Board just received the*
17 *introduction to the plan, he wondered if we were rushing to approve the plan and should slow down. In*
18 *response, Mr. Restuccia noted that many people and three CB4 committees had reviewed the plan prior*
19 *to tonight’s meeting. Mr. Marcus added that all specific projects in the plan would come back to the*
20 *Board in ULURP proceedings, where the Board could deal with details.*

21
22 *Mr. Noland stated that the plan had been reviewed many, many times and that it was important to*
23 *approve the plan tonight. He noted it was better than anything the city would issue and that we could*
24 *state in the introduction that the plan is a “work in progress.”*

25
26 *David Solnick asked about the plan’s reference to the illegal hotel issue. Mr. Restuccia responded that*
27 *the plan was not supporting a particular law, but simply noting the concern. Ms. Desmond added that*
28 *there is a lot of minutiae surrounding this issue and that the underlying law is not new. Mr. Bokser*
29 *suggested that the plan not mention specific companies in the illegal hotel section.*

30 *Mr. Restuccia proposed that any comments on the introduction be sent to Mr. Benfatto. Ms. Macintosh*
31 *suggested that a deadline of 7 to 10 days be set for the submission of those comments.*

32
33 *Mr. de Kadt asked if, by voting yes, he would be supporting the precise distribution of units in the tables.*
34 *Mr. Restuccia responded that this is a plan or a guideline and suggested including something in the*
35 *introduction about the Board’s philosophy with respect to affordable housing.*

36
37 *Ms. Daglian stated that there appeared to be some issues still needing resolution and asked if there was a*
38 *deadline for issuing the plan. Mr. Restuccia responded that the plan reflected principles the Board has*
39 *held for the past ten years. He added there was no deadline, but that CB4 wanted to get its plan out there*
40 *first, a point reiterated by Mr. Firfer.*

41
42 *Mr. Mankoff suggested that we label the plan “preliminary,” and Mr. Restuccia agreed.*

43
44 *A motion to publish the preliminary plan was approved.*

1 Item 39: Letter to Clinton Towers re tenant issues (**APPROVED ABOVE, IN CONJUNCTION WITH**
2 **ITEM 1)**

3
4 Item 48: Letter to Catholic Charities, Archdiocese of New York re St. Joseph's Immigrant Home
5 (**APPROVED**)

6
7 **Quality of Life: ACES Committee (QoL)**

8 The following items were bundled: 41-43 (**APPROVED, WITH ITEM 42 APPROVED AS**
9 **AMENDED**)

10 Item 41: Letter to High Line Hotel re quality of life concerns

11 Item 42: Letter to Limon Jungle re Failure to abide by liquor license stipulations

12 Item 43: Letter to IESI Waste Management re pick-up times, etc.

13

14 *With respect to item 42, Mr. Seres proposed deleting the second paragraph of the letter, to which Ms.*
15 *DeFelicianantonio agreed.*

16

17 *Items 40 and 44 were withdrawn.*

18

19

20 **Housing, Health & Human Services (HH&HS) and Clinton/Hell's Kitchen Land Use (C/HKLU)**
21 **Committees**

22 Item 46: Letter to HPD re Harborview Terrace re RFP (**APPROVED**)

23

24

The meeting was adjourned at 10:05 p.m. Scribed by Frank Holozubiec.