

BUSINESS & CONSUMER ISSUES COMMITTEE

George Zeppenfeldt and Michele Parker, Co-Chairpersons

April 12, 2017

Present: Michele Parker, George Zeppenfeldt-Cestero, Linda Alexander, Christian Cordova, Paul Fischer, Marc Glazer, Seema Reddy. **Absent:** Brian Jenks

Non-Committee Members Present: Roberta Semer, Mark Diller

The meeting was called to order at 6:30 pm.

1. Review of CB7's FY2018 District Needs Statement and priorities for the NYC capital and expense budgets, and updates for FY2019.

District Needs Statement — Questions for the Committee to Answer

1a. What is/are the central theme(s) of your section of the FY18 DNS?

- Must visit destination.
- Banks and pharmacies vying for space.
- Banks used space for branding.
- Major shift in commerce.

1b. Will this change in the FY19 DNS?

- Yes.
- Banks are disappearing.
- Pharmacies no longer fighting for space.
- Another major shift in commerce.

2a. Are community needs in the FY18 DNS current?

- Mostly current.
- We still need to preserve spaces for small businesses.
- We need laundromats, shoe repairs, bodegas

2b. List any needs that are missing:

- Commercial rent stabilization.

3a. Do the FT18 Budget Priorities correspond to the community needs?

- Yes.

3b. List any needs that are missing

- Addition of information centers at cultural institutions like the American Museum of Natural History, Historical Society and others for advertising local restaurants.
- Copy and print businesses.
- Small business in Historic districts face to many regulations from different agencies that do not talk to each other. The process needs to be streamlined.
- Sidewalk sheds regulations.

4. Which needs and/or priorities would be enhanced if you had data and/or trend data?
 - Knowing which spaces are available. Who the landlord and broker are?
5. Which community groups/organizations could inform your section of the DNS and Budget Priorities? List and indicate if you consult with them now on community issues?
 - The BIDs.
 - The West Side Chamber of Commerce.
 - The NYC Hospitality Alliance.
 - Neighborhood Block Associations.

Applications to the SLA for new two-year liquor licenses:

2. **100 West 82nd Street** (Columbus Avenue) Flame West Inc. d/b/a To be Determined.

Presenting for the Applicant: Karen He.

- No changes to the method of operation.
- Shorter operating hours, closing at 12am instead of 1am.
- They know the regulations for the food delivery personnel.
- Asked to send us pictures of the delivery personnel.
- The sidewalk shed is still up.
- Background music.

After due deliberation the resolution to **approve** was adopted:

VOTE: 7-0-0-0

Non-Committee Members VOTE: 2-0-0-0

3. **566 Amsterdam Avenue** (West 87th Street) Le Petit Amelie LLC, d/b/a Amelie Wine Bar.

CB7 Comments:

- No one showed up for the applicant.

After due deliberation the resolution to **disapprove** was adopted:

VOTE: 6-0-0-0

4. **685 Amsterdam Avenue** (West 93rd Street) Jin's 88 Corp. d/b/a Kouzan.

Presenting for the Applicant: Yu Jin Shi and Arthur Shi.

- New owner.
- 2 motorized bicycles for delivery.
- Opened 7 days a week.
- Background music.
- The sidewalk shed is still up, more than 10 months in duration.

CB7 Comments:

- Mark Diller: Q: different corporation or added owners?
- A: new corporation with new partners.
- Mar Diller: Q: any court proceedings under previous ownership?
- A: no

- George Zeppenfeldt-Cestero: Q: do any employees are owed money from previous owner?
- A: no

After due deliberation the resolution to **approve** was adopted:

VOTE: 7-0-0-0

Non-Committee Members VOTE: 2-0-0-0

5. **Renewal SLA application for 20 West 72nd Street**, The Ribbon Worldwide LLC, d/b/a The Ribbon.

George Zeppenfeldt-Cestero:

- BCI did not have opportunity to review the original application.
- There have been noise complaints from the community.
- No conspicuous SLA license visible, which may show stipulations to the License agreement.

Presenting for the Applicant: Ken Sturn and Joey Simmons.

- The area is not zoned for a Sidewalk café.
- Agrees to add to the Method of operation that will not apply for a sidewalk café.
- Tried to replicate the original architect designed.
- LPC allowed for the changes to improve the looks of the restaurant, including the French Doors.
- The over 2 years long sidewalk shed has been detrimental to the restaurants business, including preventing them from finishing renovations.
- Have reduced the seating number.
- They close at 11pm.
- We provide fine dining.
- Introduced a noise survey done by a consultant firm, which indicated that the noise level is within NYC noise regulations.
- Have noise isolators on the ceiling and soundproof panels.
- No residents from 20West 72nd Street have complaint about noise.
- During the summer when we have air conditioner on, the French Doors remain closed.
- Estimate that the doors are open 18 weeks a year.
- An awning cannot be installed until the scaffolding comes down.
- Soft Sound panels have been installed. A sound blanket will be installed at the request of the building residents to reduce sound.
- The applicant has stated that the street side door is a legal door for entrance.

Public Comments:

Matthew Bondy, attorney from Montgomery and McCracken, representing Oliver Cromwell building:

- Here about noise concerns emanating from restaurants' open French Doors.
- Opposing the application unless French Doors remain closed year round.
- Strictly residential zoning district.
- Concerns about possible sidewalk café.

Al Salsano, President of Board of Oliver Cromwell:

- There is outside seating on SLA application.
- They are requesting on a DOB application for an eating and drinking establishment.
- Presented signatures from different buildings opposing application.

- Presented video from Sept 19, 2015 highlighting noise levels.
- Scaffolding up for 2 years. Estimated to be removed by mid-summer.
- Not opposing the restaurant, only the fact that the French Doors are open.

Jane Rosenthal, owner at 15 West 72nd Street since 1987.

- Ribbon has a crowd and noise problem.
- It is very popular which affects the quality of life of the neighborhood, including drunken patrons.
- Has issue with the way the conduct business which creates a lot of noise and a lot of people gather outside of it to the detriment of the neighborhood.
- George Zeppenfeldt-Cestero: Q: How often are there crowds outside?
- A: there are always people crowded outside the restaurant. Mostly the problem is the noise because of the open doors

Cristopher Roberts, resident of 12 West 72nd Street.

- They have installed accordion doors in front of the bar that generates noise.
- They should keep their doors closed.
- Should not have an outdoor café.
- The SLA application suggests an outdoor café.

Jan Levy, former CB7 member, resident of the Majestic building:

- 4 buildings including the Majestic and the Dakota have taken the position of opposing businesses on the block.
- Amazed that the LPC approved the French Doors.
- Restaurant has hard surfaces without any coverings to absorb the noise.
- We like the noise to be contained by having the French Doors closed all the time.
- The Street side door is illegal. The restaurant should only be entered from the Lobby.
- Will like to a solution to be found that allows the restaurant to be profitable without the noise.
- The SLA application suggests an outdoor café.

Steve London, resident of 15 West 72nd Street:

- When the French Doors are opened, the noise is cacophonous.
- Asks the French Doors to be closed.

Peter Arndtsen, Columbus-Amsterdam Avenues BID

- An awning will help reduce noise.

CB7 Comments:

- George Zeppenfeldt-Cestero Q: will you be amenable to closing the doors earlier?
- A: we can discuss it. Can close them at 10pm.
- George Zeppenfeldt-Cestero: 10pm is too late during the week.
- Applicant is proposing a 9pm closing of the doors Sun – Wed, and 10pm Thu – Sat; and agrees to install signage encouraging the patrons to respect the neighborhood.
- Representative of Oliver Cromwell disagrees with the proposed door hours.
- A call to 311 can provide for enforcement.
- Michele Parker: will disapprove the application unless they agree to changes to the Method of operation to be specified.
- Roberta Semer: the sidewalk door was approved at Preservation Committee.

After due deliberation the resolution to **disapprove unless the Method of Operation includes, a) the French Doors will always close Sunday – Wednesday at 9pm; b) the French Doors will always close Thursday – Saturday at 10pm; c) they will not apply for a sidewalk café; and d) when the awning is able to be installed they will include sound absorbing materials in the awning** was adopted.

VOTE: 6-0-0-0

Non-Committee Members VOTE: 2-0-0-0

New Unenclosed Sidewalk Cafés:

6. **2167 Broadway** (West 76th Street.) New application #3534-20 17-t\SWC to the Department of Consumer Affairs by Muginoho International, Inc., d/b/a Beard Papa's, for a four-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk cafe with 4 tables and 8 seats.

Presenting for the Applicant: Yasu Tabata and Charles Schmidt.

- The interior has been refurbished recently.
- An employee will make sure the outside tables remain clean after each use.
- No bicycle delivery.

After due deliberation the resolution to **approve** was adopted:

VOTE: 6-0-0-0

7. **2794 Broadway** (West 108th Street.) New application #3079-2017-ASWC to the Department of Consumer Affairs by Malaxiangguo Enterprise Inc., d/b/a Malaxianogguo 108 Food Dried Hot Pot, for a four-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 10 tables and 20 seats.

Presenting for the Applicant: Yin Hongwei, Shang Zhihan and Michael Song.

- Not open yet, maybe by next week, waiting for gas connection.
- Scaffolding up next door to the restaurant.

CB7 Comments:

- After examining the plans, it was determine that they were not correct.

After due deliberation the resolution to **disapprove unless the applicant submits prior to the Full Board meeting of May 2nd a revised architect plan showing tables, no more than 6 tables and 12 seats, in the Broadway frontage within the footprint of the restaurant south of the entrance doors** was adopted:

VOTE: 6-0-0-0

8. **933 Amsterdam Avenue** (West 106th Street.) New application #4260-2017-ASWC to the Department of Consumer Affairs by Hot Dawgz LLC, d/b/a NY Brat Factory, for a four-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 14 tables and 30 seats.

Presenting for the Applicant: Vincent DeCapua, expediter.

- Architect and owner could not be present today.
- There is an awning.

Peter Arndtsen, Columbus-Amsterdam Avenues BID

- It is a Kosher restaurant.

Community Board 7/ Manhattan

- Quiet place.

After due deliberation the resolution to **approve** was adopted:

VOTE: 6-0-0-0

9. **574 Columbus Avenue** (West 88th Street.) New application #2635-2017-ASWC to the Department of Consumer Affairs by B.L.T.G. Pizza Inc., d/b/a Bella Luna, for a four-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 15 tables and 30 seats.

Presenting for the Applicant: Turgot Valikci

- It has one bicycle for delivery. Pictures of the back of the delivery person are needed. Applicant to submit that info.
- Beloved restaurant operator.
- Doug Kleiman (neighbor) also spoke in favor of the applicant.
- Jeff Kadish – restaurant owner across the street, in favor of the application

CB7 Comments:

- Mark Diller: endorses the application.
- George: asked the applicant to submit via email a photo of the back of the bicycle delivery uniform.

After due deliberation the resolution to **approve** was adopted:

VOTE: 6-0-0-0

10. **573 Columbus Avenue** (West 88th Street.) New application #2435-2017-ASWC to the Department of Consumer Affairs by Bodega 88 LLC, for a four-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 6 tables and 12 seats.

Presenting for the Applicant: Jeff Kadish.

- Has a small kitchen, it is more like a sports bar with full food service.
- Indoor capacity under 60.
- Opened since last August.
- No complaints from the neighbors.
- Knows how to keep neighbors happy on the upper west side.
- Will operate sidewalk café until 11pm Sunday through Wednesday and 12pm Thursday thru Saturday.
- The restaurant is already insulated.
- Submitted 44 signatures from neighbors in favor of the application.
- Food delivery via Caviar.

CB7 Comments:

- There are elected officials that are concern that an unenclosed café at this location will adversely affect some of the neighborhood.
- The committee suggested an awning, but LPC denied the applicant the use of one.
- The applicant will explore using umbrellas to attenuate possible noise.

After due deliberation the resolution to **approve** was adopted:

VOTE: 6-0-0-0

11. Follow up with B2B Networking Event on May 1st: History of NYC Hospitality Industry & Forecasting its Future.

George Zeppenfeldt-Cestero:

- It will be Monday May 1st 6-8pm.
- You need to register on the CB7 website to attend.
- Co-sponsor with CB7 Business and Consumer Issues Committee, Office of Manhattan Borough President Gale Brewer, NYC Hospitality Alliance, Casa De Vinos, Restaurant Associates / Lincoln Center
- Open to All Manhattan Community Boards Members and business owners.
- Keynote Speaker: Steve Cuzzo, Restaurant Critic and “Realty Check” Columnist of the New York Post.
- See flyer on the website.

12. Commercial Rent Tax Legislation.

Doug Kleiman:

- Below 96th Street you have to pay a commercial rent tax on top of their rents, due to the fact that their rents are at a level that triggers the tax.
- There is movement to endorse raising the threshold that will trigger the tax.
- Peter Arndtsen agrees.
- E-commerce is destroying retail.
- Learned about this tax a year ago.
- Believes the market will experience a rent correction making it possible for more small vendors to come back.

CB7 Comments:

- They should use a percentage of the lease instead of the rent level to determine the tax.

13. New business.

- Michele Parker: Will like someone to chronicle “life and death of an enclosed sidewalk café” of one that will be removed by the building owner because it does not have a tenant to use the space.
- E-Bike Discussion should happen at the next meeting.

The meeting ended at 9:43 pm.

FULL BOARD MEETING

Roberta Semer, Chairperson

April 4, 2017

Community Board 7/Manhattan's Full Board met on Tuesday, April 4, 2017, at Goddard Riverside Community Center, 593 Columbus Avenue (West 88th Street), in the District. Chair Roberta Semer called the meeting to order at 6:36 pm after the Secretary confirmed the existence of a quorum.

The following matters were discussed and actions taken:

Minutes from the March 7, 2017, full Board meeting were **approved**.

VOTE: 26-0-0-0.

Chair's Report: Roberta Semer:

- CB7 is taking a fresh look at the process and content of our District Needs Statement. A facilitated discussion of the DNS will be a topic on every committee's agenda in April.
- CB7's Full Board meeting will be rescheduled for July 5th, since the usual first Tuesday will fall on Independence Day.
- Introducing Bob Jones, the newly appointed Executive Director of Goddard Riverside Community Center, succeeding Stephan Russo, who succeeded Bernie Wohl, both heroes of the Upper West Side.
- Bob Jones:
 - Goddard Riverside has been serving this neighborhood since 1883.
 - fighting so that everyone can participate in a just society.
- Goddard Riverside has grown to include programs and services from Wall Street to West 140th Street. Recently won the funding to serve the homeless through an outreach consortium that Goddard Riverside has led for generations.
- Goddard Riverside truly provides support and programming to enrich the lives of Upper West Siders from the cradle to the grave (e.g. from publicly funded child care and Head Start to Beacon and other afterschool programs to the College Options program to the SRO Law Project to protect affordable housing to senior residences and centers and programming).

Community Session:

Craig Trotta and Conor Greene – The Doe Fund (doe.org).

- Well known in the neighborhood and City for its "Ready, Willing and Able" program, which provides paid work for the "men in blue" cleaning the streets.
- The Doe Fund "men in blue" are paid from day 1 of their training, which makes the program expensive to run.
- Due to budget issues, the Doe Fund had to cut back on good will services to the Upper West Side.
- The Doe Fund is starting a "Campaign for Clean Streets" to raise the funds to reinstate the Upper West Side program. Contributions will go a long way to restoring the program.
- Craig is a graduate of the program. Formerly homeless, and was living on the streets until the Doe Fund program empowered him to take control of his life. He has now graduated from the Doe Fund program, and is actively working to promote it.
- Providing a path forward to those left behind or who have fallen victim to destructive forces. Their mottos include "Not a hand out – but a hand up," and "Work works."

- The increase in the minimum wage has made these sorts of programs more expensive. Seeking help.

Michael Keller – Redeemer Presbyterian Church, 150 West 83rd Street.

- New location at the New York Society for Ethical Culture.
- Attempting to respond to the needs of the community. Looking forward to being a part of the community.
- Redeemer started on the Upper East Side in the 1980s – partnering with the communities we serve.

Randy Schein – Resident of West 87th Street between Broadway and West End Avenue.

- A new ultra luxury building is under construction on the block.
- Construction begins in the early morning hours, and continues on Saturdays and after hours.
A: CB7, with Gale Brewer’s support, has sought to reform the Department of Buildings’ practice of granting After Hours Variances for years – welcomes additional voices to the fight.

Jennifer Merin – Crime Victim.

- Her family home since 1930 was stolen by means of a fraudulent deed.
- The thief squatted long after being discovered. It took herculean efforts to purge the fraudulent deed and regain possession of the home.
- Eventually the thief was convicted, and sentenced to 1 year via a plea bargain.
- Darryl Beady, the thief, is expecting early release. If his early release is granted, he would have been incarcerated a shorter time than the time he spent squatting via the fraud.
- Appealing for support to reconsider the practice of early release, especially where time off for “good behavior” does not ameliorate the impact on the victim.

Kathleen Crosby – GrowNYC.

- The “Stop and Swap” program is coming to the Upper West Side on Sunday, April 30th.
- The program revives the old practice of a swap meet – small, portable and reusable.
- Benefits of the program include reducing waste and offering items to those in need.
- Items not taken will be brought to the next swap meet or to Goodwill.

Nikhil Jain – Columbus-Amsterdam BID.

- Introducing a new member of the BID team – a Columbia Urban Planning intern.
- Upcoming events include a Bloomingdale walking tour 4/19.

Zhen Heinemann – Summer on the Hudson – NYC Department of Parks and Recreation.

- Department of Parks and Recreation festival – May through the end of September.
- 270 events included, from morning exercise to outdoor evening movies.
- New programming this year includes fitness classes at intervals between West 78th to West 116th Streets; a concert in collaboration with Barnard College in a space above West 96th Street; and a skate park clinic.
- Nycparks.gov/summeronthehudson.
- Still looking for non-profits or small businesses to claim a marketing table at festival events.

Win Armstrong – Park West Village Tenants Association.

- Still opposing the Jewish Home Lifecare relocation to West 97th Street on various bases, including the environmental hazards revealed in the Environmental Impact Statement to the inconsistency with the

Zoning Resolution. JHL should remain in the community and rebuild their existing facility on West 106th Street.

- Bloomingdale Neighborhood History Group – next event 4/17 on movies made on the Upper West Side.
- Trinity School history event 5/17 – celebrating 200 years of education.

Matthew Sheffler – 30 West 90th Street.

- Concerns about growing fleet of electric delivery bicycles.
- They are a public safety issue; their stealth surprises seniors and others, especially when driven in the wrong direction on a one-way avenue, and often operated at high speeds.
- Illegal under NYC Administrative Code.
- Identified 13 restaurants on Columbus and Amsterdam Avenues that continue to use them – should be ticketed.
- A: CB7's Business & Consumer Issues Committee conditions café renewals and liquor licenses on compliance.

Lourdes Camacho – Amsterdam Houses.

- Lost her mom of 88 years to COPD.
- Smoking should be banned in public housing – proposing Amsterdam Houses as a pilot.

Jennifer Zarr – New York Public Library.

- The St. Agnes branch library is hosting a conversation 4/22 on how to become a parent – fertility and assisted fertilization, adoption, fostering.
- Program presenters will include a pastor, a lawyer, and parents.
- AARP will offer tax preparation assistance at the Bloomingdale branch on 4/7 and 4/14.
- Assembly Member Daniel O'Donnell is partnering with the NYPL's "Our Voices" writing challenge. Students are invited to submit written or pictorial reflections on their own experiences. Submissions are due 4/21.

Reports by Elected Officials:

Helen Rosenthal, New York City Council Member (6th District):

- Will participate in an announcement 4/5 with Council Member Richie Torres relating to NYCHA elevators. NYCHA elevator maintenance is an acute problem in our District – De Hostos residents were stuck in an elevator last weekend.
- The issue requires an emergency meeting with NYCHA – inviting Madelyn Innocent from the CB7 Task Force.
- Overall, NYCHA faces a \$17B maintenance backlog. People should be livid about this issue.
- Press conference 4/5 at West 96th Street and West End Avenue calling for the Department of Transportation to study whether a "Barnes Dance" pedestrian interval could tame dangerous intersections, as has been successfully used in Shibuya-ku (a Tokyo neighborhood). The Department of Transportation's resistance to this element of street safety vocabulary is problematic.

Reports by Elected Officials' Representatives:

Marisa Maack, Office of Council Member Helen Rosenthal (6th District):

- Hosting a free mammogram screening with Goddard Riverside 5/11– sign up on the website or call the District Office.
 - Free bike helmet event 4/29 with the Department of Transportation.
 - Town Hall 4/25 with representatives of the most relevant City agencies. Email questions in advance.
 - Street safety rally 4/5 at West 96th Street and West End Avenue regarding lingering problems even after the redesign.
 - Jacob’s Pickles fundraiser 4/26 for residents displaced by the fire at 509-511 Amsterdam Avenue.
- Q: CB7 sponsored a comprehensive Nelson Nygaard street safety study with recommendations for West 96th Street at West End Avenue and Broadway. Should re-examine.
- A: The Council Member and the office have studied the report very carefully.

Sean Coughlin, Office of Council Member Corey Johnson (3rd District):

- Organizing a workshop 4/12 at 333 West 23rd Street with the Department of Housing and Community Renewal to explain how to apply for affordable housing. It is a complicated process.

Erica Overton, Office of Assembly Member Linda Rosenthal (67th District):

- On this “Equal Pay Day” [the day in a year when women catch up to the wages that men earned for the same work the year before] – the Assembly-Member’s equal pay bill has passed the Assembly.
- Rally 4/5 for the Assembly-Member’s “SWEAT” bill which would impose a lien on personal assets of employers who steal worker wages and leave behind judgment-proof empty corporate shells. The bill was intended to be included in the budget, but is being blocked in the State Senate.
- Assembly-Member is sponsoring a bill to increase access to feminine hygiene care in prisons and schools.

Chris Chu, Office of Assembly Member Daniel O’Donnell (69th District):

- Budget – fighting for affordable housing and schools and raising the age of criminal responsibility.
- State budget and legislative forum 4/19 at Goddard Riverside with Linda Rosenthal.
- SCRIE/DRIE enrolment event 4/19 – learn how to apply for these programs that freeze rent for seniors and the disabled.
- CPR training 4/27 with the Fire Department at Grosvenor House
- Healthy Kids Day 4/29 with the YMCA at Grosvenor House on West 105th Street and Amsterdam Avenue.

Emily Markowitz, Office of Assembly Member Richard Gottfried (75th District):

- Legislature missed the April 1st budget deadline, but passed an extension to keep the government running in the interim.
- Sponsor of the New York Health Act, which would implement a single-payer health care system for the State. The bill has been passed by the Assembly multiple times, and there was a rally today in Albany with 1000 people.
- The “Independent Democratic Caucus” and true Senate Democrats agree on the bill, but the IDC’s support of Republican leadership of the State Senate means that it still may not come to the floor for a vote despite co-sponsorship of a majority of the Senate.
- Medicaid support rally 4/6; Rally at 32BJ.
- Introducing Alek Metic, the new community liaison.

Tara Klein, Office of State Senator Brad Hoylman (27th District):

- Voting on the State Budget may start tonight.

- Free civil legal services on housing and tenants' rights 4/12 at Harbor View Terrace through the New York Legal Assistance Group.
- Sponsoring a bill to require at least one State Liquor Authority Board member to be a New York City resident.

George Damalas, Office of State Senator Jose Serrano (29th District):

- Creating awareness how to support vulnerable populations with GrowNYC and Project FIND.
- Office hours at the St. Agnes branch public library 4/6 and 4/20, joined by the New York State Department of Environmental Conservation.
- Bill to protect State parks and combat littering passed by the State Senate.

Brennan Ward, Office of State Senator Marisol Alcantara (31st District):

- Rally 4/6 against wage theft and oppose business reincorporation to avoid paying workers at Manhattan Valley restaurant, 2636 Broadway at West 100th Street.
- Rally 4/8 to support the single-payer health care bill at Fort Washington Avenue at West 168th Street.
Q: How could this bill ever reach the floor of the State Senate due to the Senator's caucusing with the "Independent Democratic Caucus?"
A: The IDC is a separate question. The Senator is fighting for this bill.

Elie Peltz, Office of U.S. House Member Jerrold Nadler (10th District):

- Town Hall Thursday 4/13 at 6 pm at Brandeis High School. Please RSVP and come early, as 750 people came last time. The Town Hall will be Q&A with the Congressman – plenty of chances to hear directly from him on a range of issues.

David Bailey, Office of U.S. House Member Adriano Espaillat (13th District):

- President Trump's "Affordable Health Care Act" was withdrawn when it became clear it lacked the votes to pass.
- Working to keep ICE (Immigration and Customs Enforcement) Agents out of public schools and out of courtrooms. Victims of abuse (regardless of documentation status) are afraid to complain or testify because fear of exposure to ICE.
- Scheduled to speak at Three Parks Democratic Club 4/12.
- Special Election 5/23 to fill the open seat in the 30th State Senate District.

Michael Stinson, NYC Comptroller Scott M. Stringer's Office:

- The Comptroller's report on aging has been released. With 1.1 million New Yorkers over 65 years old, there is a growing concern for services and a need to invest.
- Eligible seniors should automatically be enrolled in SCRIE (senior citizen rent increase exemption).
- Proposing a raise to \$50,000 for eligibility for the homeowner tax credit.
- Upper West Side Town Hall 4/6 at Goddard Riverside.

Renee Woodberry, Manhattan DA Cyrus Vance's Office:

- Providing \$15 million in new funding to enhance existing reentry services and add new programming. CJII.org.
- Kids against Hate poster contest – grades K-5.
- Hate Crime information session with palm cards with information on what is a hate crime and how to report it.

Business Session:

TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE

Andrew Albert and Howard Yaruss, Co-Chairpersons

Resolutions Re:

1. New M79 Select Bus Service (SBS) route.

Presentation by Andrew Albert:

- The Department of Transportation (“DoT”) will present the complex proposal, including illustrative images and slides.

DoT Presentation by Robert Thompson (NYC Transit) and Julie Schipper (DoT):

- The M79 crosstown route will be converted to Select Bus Service (“SBS”). SBS is a form of bus rapid transit.
- 12 SBS routes in New York City, including the M86, have improved speed, reliability and ridership on the route.
- Speed increases by 10-30%, making service more reliable. SBS receives a 95% customer satisfaction rating.
- Coupled with DoT improvements to the SBS routes, the program results in fewer crashes.

- M79 identified as possible SBS route, based on requests from CB7, CB8 and elected officials.
- M79 is a heavily used route, with daily ridership of 18,000 people.
- A key aspect of SBS is off-board fare collection, allowing passengers to enter the bus using any of 3 doors on the articulated bus. This speeds boarding and therefore service.
- A modest investment in installing the SBS kiosks for off-board fare collection, combined with other street improvements, yields big returns.
- Eliminating 1 stop on the current route at Amsterdam Avenue and West 81st Street because the sidewalk is too narrow for fare collection kiosks. That stop is only 2 blocks from an existing stop.

Street improvements:

- Broadway at West 79th Street:
 - Current issues include overlapping turns from northbound/southbound Broadway – end up crossing each other, which is dangerous for pedestrians and for turning vehicles.
 - Solution includes (a) a protected northbound turn lane for left turns to westbound West 79th Street; and (b) banning a left turn from southbound Broadway onto eastbound West 79th Street.

- Amsterdam at West 79th Street – has already received modifications of its turn bays and signal timing.

- Columbus Avenue at West 79th Street:
 - Current issues include heavy turns onto and off of Columbus Avenue, and a dangerous condition with pedestrians crossing at same time as turning vehicles.
 - This intersection feeds to an entrance to the American Museum of Natural History.
 - Solution includes (a) creating two new protected turn phases, with separate green arrows for each of southbound Columbus Avenue and eastbound on West 79th Street; and (b) a “Barnes Dance” (red light for all vehicles in all directions / walk light in all directions for pedestrians).

- Columbus Avenue at West 81st Street:

- Current issues include heavy congestion eastbound on West 81st Street before crossing Columbus Avenue, due to narrow travel lanes and poor visibility; and the need for the eastbound bus once across Columbus Avenue to move from the curb to the eastbound travel lane, which is frequently heavily congested.
- Solution includes widening travel lanes on West 81st Street west of Columbus Avenue to reduce congestion and improve visibility. To do so, must remove parking on West 81st Street west of Columbus Avenue. Since the M79 stop at Amsterdam Avenue and West 81st Street is being eliminated, it will amount to a swap of parking spots from one end of the block to the other.
- West 81st Street between Columbus Avenue and Central Park West:
 - Current issues include long traffic cues in both directions, especially due to double-parked vehicles, especially service vehicles, on the north (westbound) side, but also including congestion on the south (eastbound) side due to a combination of car and truck volume, express bus traffic, and school buses parked or waiting in line to provide school field trips access to the Museum.
 - Solutions proposed: (a) creating an eastbound curbside bus-only lane running the length of the block from Columbus Avenue to Central Park West, in effect from Monday-Friday from 7 am to 7pm, with parking permitted all other times; and (b) creating no-standing zones on the north (westbound) side for service vehicles.
- American Museum of Natural History (“AMNH”):
 - Current issues focused on congestion from school buses for field trips laying over on the streets surrounding the Museum, and standing elsewhere in the neighborhood, especially as they are queuing up to return to the Museum at the end of the students’ visit.
 - Proposed Solution is to creating a bus layover space on Central Park West on the northbound side between West 79th and West 81st Streets, with the spaces reserved Monday through Friday from 9 am to 2pm, with parking permitted all other times.
- Looking to complete improvements by late Spring.

Responses by presenters to CB7 Questions:

- The time saved on similar SBS service on West 86th Street is about 10% on average, with the greatest time savings at the times of highest demand.
- Snow removal needs to adapt to ensure access to off-board fare collector kiosks.
- Enforcement will be needed to adjust food carts/trucks currently operating on or at the curb of Central Park West that would interfere with the proposed bus layover zone.
- Concern that the implementation of SBS service is proceeding without CB7 approval or determination.
A: DoT presented the first outline of an SBS proposal at CB7’s Transportation Committee in October 2016, without detail and without seeking a resolution.
- DoT is working with AMNH staff on managing the layovers of school buses, but has not conducted a formal traffic study of West 77th Street as a layover venue.
- The proposed Barnes Dance at West 79th Street and Columbus Avenue would be 23 seconds out of a 90 second cycle.
- Concern for flow of layover buses returning to AMNH from the Central Park West spots – it will require lots of left turns to get back to the Museum – would DoT consider using southbound CPW as a layover location instead.
- A: Will address the left-turn flow issue by having AMNH dispatchers help facilitate buses making the loop; will investigate use of southbound CPW as well.

Community Comment:

Deborah Bottle – Theodore Roosevelt Park Neighborhood Association:

- Typical school day on West 81st Street between Central Park West and Columbus Avenue includes heavy congestion with school buses and service vehicles.
- The neighborhood was promised in October 2016 that the West 81st Street Block Association would be involved in the discussion about changes to the block – feels blind-sided by the Committee Agenda in March 2017.
- Must not implement the proposed changes on the West 81st Street CPW-Columbus Avenue block without more study and engagement.

Steve Anderson – Theodore Roosevelt Park Neighborhood Association and West 81st Street Block Association [with additional time ceded by John Phufas, Michael Franzo and others]:

- The West 81st Street Museum block is a crazy block that presents a unique challenge which the Block Association has been trying to resolve for years, including through a series of meetings with DoT, CB7 and AMNH.
- Introducing more buses to the area is simply not reasonable as it would exacerbate an already-bad condition.
- No changes should be made on this block until a thorough traffic and congestion study exploring the proposal and other options is completed for the entire block and surrounding area.
- This is a residential block adjacent to a well-loved Museum, not a traffic/transit hub.
- The proposal would turn the block and the adjacent CPW expanse into a bus depot.
- It is not reasonable to expect AMNH's attendants to take control of CPW or manage the buses there.
- With the proposed Gilder Center on Columbus Avenue, more cars, buses and people will be coming.
- The only rational approach is a professional study on how to address these congestion issues.
- The series of left turns for buses to return to the Museum from the CPW layover spaces will cripple the street.
- AMNH's attendants cannot commandeer the street – NYPD enforcement is needed every day, which is unrealistic.
- The proposed bus lane is not reasonable as it would eliminate needed parking, and would attract more buses.
- SBS is a great idea which can be implemented without the dedicated bus lane. All elements of the proposal other than the SBS service should await a complete study of all changes and conditions on the block and adjacent CPW.
- Parking is rare and important to the neighbors on the block. Saving 2 minutes is not a reasonable trade-off.
- Block Association will pay Sam Schwartz's fee for a traffic /congestion study.

Jonathan Lipnick – West 81st Street Block Association:

- School buses returning to the Museum already make dangerous, impossible turns creating congestion.
- SBS bus lane will create havoc since the turn from the bus lane into the cobblestone driveway will be too tight, forcing buses to make wide turns into traffic and creating a new danger.
- These proposals cannot be implemented on a "see what happens" basis.

Committee Chairs' Summary:

- M79 is frequently blocked for long periods by double-parked service vehicles and school buses.

- Buses zig-zagging into the travel lane on the Museum block is very unsafe.
- The DoT proposals are not cast in stone, and will be re-evaluated and changed as needed.
- The Museum block proposal in particular must have heightened traffic enforcement attention in the first month.
- The purpose of the dedicated bus lane on the Museum block is to keep all buses moving, not just the M79.

DoT Recap:

- The Museum block bus lane would keep all buses moving, not just the M79.
- The turn from the bus lane into the Museum driveway is tough but doable.
- The bus lane would vastly improve everyone's experience on the block.

Dan Slippen – AMNH:

- Former bus layover on Columbus Avenue consumed by the protected bike lane.
- The DoT proposals would enable AMNH to better manage and dispatch buses dropping off and picking up from field trips. Radio dispatch allows for staggered arrivals.
- The west (southbound) side of CPW is already congested, and students are dismissed in the garage for security reasons, so bus access to the curb is irrelevant.

CB7 Comments: One or more CB7 members expressed the following concerns, comments and suggestions:

- The dedicated bus lane on the West 81st Street Museum block makes good sense.
- The loss of parking spaces in the proposals, including on the Museum block for the bus lane, is reasonable and necessary.
- Four of the District's most dangerous intersections based on crash data are addressed by this proposal.
- The West 81st Street Museum block will have more efficient through-put as a result of the plan.
- The bus layover location is a separate issue that should not delay the implementation of SBS or the proposals to keep traffic moving and address congestion.
- The proposal addresses the existing chaos; should not delay addressing a crisis for a study.
- Creation of service vehicle loading zones on the westbound (north) side of the Museum block makes sense.
- Concern that DoT, with the Borough Commissioner, met only once with the Museum Block Association in advance of the Committee meeting.
- The complexity of the Museum block and the difficulty of adapting to changing patterns dictates that there should be a single, well-researched and systematic solution, not a one-off that can be tweaked as issues arise.
- A comprehensive traffic and congestion study makes sense.
- Any plan that relies on the Museum's private employees to manage a congested City street is deeply problematic.
- The series of left turns, including across all travel lanes on West 81st Street to return buses to the Museum from the layover location, is flawed and should be studied and re-thought.
- The net gain from a 10-30% average time savings is only a few minutes.
- Having buses lay over on the west (southbound) side of CPW is safer for students as well as traffic.
- West 77th Street should be explored as a bus layover alternative.

- Should eliminate item 8 (regarding bus layover locations) from the proposal pending study, and approve the balance.
- Eliminating the bus stop at Amsterdam Avenue and West 81st Street creates an unnecessarily long walk – should relocate the stop onto Amsterdam Avenue at the same corner.
- Amendment (accepted as friendly) to request that DoT investigate and report back to CB7 within six months on alternative bus layover locations.

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** the proposal was adopted.

VOTE: 27-6-6-0.

2. Secondary Street naming of West 94th Street (Columbus to Amsterdam Avenues.)

Presentation by Andrew Albert:

- The proposed intersection currently has a secondary street name for James Garst.
- Proposal is to add the name of his wife, Voltarine Garst.

CB7 Comments:

- Should be named for “Rina” Garst – no one knew her as Voltarine.
- Amendment accepted as friendly to change resolution to approve a secondary street renaming for “James and Rina Garst.”

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.

VOTE: 36-1-0-0.

3. Proposed legislation to increase the number of food street vendor licenses.

Sean Kazinsky and Matthew Shapiro – advocates for Street Vendors:

- The resolution concerns proposed City Council legislation that would increase the number of food vendor permits, which has been frozen for decades.
- The ability to obtain a permit would bring economic relief to low-wage workers who could then work for themselves.
- Currently, the limit on the number of permits and the arrogation of permits in the hands of a few existing licensees means that would-be entrepreneurs, many of them recent immigrants, are forced to rent licenses on the black market from others at exorbitant prices exceeding \$20,000, which is a huge sum to a low-wage earner.
- Request that the resolution be sent back to the committee so it could hear from the vendor community.
- The Street Vendor Project is part of the Urban Justice Center, and is an organization of 2,000 working immigrants.
- The Project has worked successfully with Community Board across the City to resolve issues.
- The resolution contains false statements.

Presentation by Andrew Albert:

- The proposed resolution concerning Intro 1303 focuses on the absence of any limitation or specification of where a vendor may operate. All permits for vending should specify a location, which in turn should be the result of consultation with the community through the Community Board.

CB7 Comments:

- Concern that bill would pass in the interim without CB7 comment.
A: Legislative staff confirm that the Intro is not expected to be up for a vote before CB7's next full Board meeting.
- The CB7 Business and Consumer Affairs Committee seeks to participate with the Transportation Committee in a new discussion.

After deliberation, the resolution to **disapprove unless the specified issues are addressed** was **Withdrawn**, and the issue will be placed on the April 11, 2017 Transportation Committee agenda.

VOTE: WITHDRAWN

HOUSING COMMITTEE

Jeannette Rausch, Chairperson

Resolutions Re:

4. Public Housing Funding.

Presentation by Jeannette Rausch:

- The resolution addresses emergency concerns regarding funding cuts to Public Housing based on the anticipated federal budget for fiscal year 2018 and beyond. The CB7 Public Housing Task Force supports this resolution.
- The Housing Committee will meet 4/24 joint with Public Housing Task Force and representatives from other CBs.
- Fiscal Year 2018 cuts will be devastating.

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.

VOTE: 36-0-0-0.

5. Mitchell-Lama Housing Cooperatives.

Presentation by Jeannette Rausch:

- Law permits Mitchell-Lama co-ops to vote to convert from operating under Article II to Article XI. Article XI allows conversion that enables residents to sell their units at market rate.
- Such conversions would remove an inventory of affordable units.
- There are over 1,000 residents in Mitchell-Lama buildings in CB7's District.
- Such conversion would leave residents, especially seniors, at risk.
- Resolution calls for more information to residents, and to prohibit conversion.

CB7 Comments:

- Current law empowers co-op boards to opt out of the program.
- Affordable housing is at risk, and once lost cannot be replaced. Must preserve the inventory, including by encouraging co-ops to stay in the program.

- Preserving affordable housing is our mission.
- Those who bought into Mitchell-Lamas knew what they were getting.
- Families who put down roots in an area that at one time was far riskier than it is today should be entitled to reap the benefits of having built the community into a place of value.
- Should not interfere with a shareholder’s ability to realize the value she/he helped create.
- East River Houses converted from limited equity to full market rate, and it was calamitous for the community: they lost economic diversity as neighbors were pushed out.
- Mitchell-Lama was envisioned as middle-class affordable housing. That need is as current today as at any previous time. This is essential to preserve a middle class.
- The residents who built a dangerous community into an enviable one have already reaped the benefit of their investment in community while living here.

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.

VOTE: 24-5-7-0.

BUSINESS & CONSUMER ISSUES COMMITTEE

Michele Parker and George Zeppenfeldt-Cestero, Co-Chairpersons

Resolutions Re:

6. Applications to the SLA for new two-year liquor licenses:

- **139-141 West 69th Street** (Broadway) Noi Due Carne Inc., d/b/a To be Determined.
- **322 Columbus Avenue** (West 75th Street) Da Capo Corp, d/b/a To be Determined.
- **416 Amsterdam Avenue** (West 80th Street) AINJUPITER LLC, d/b/a To be Determined.
- **483 Columbus Avenue** (West 83rd Street) Michel GE Inc, Bellini.

Presentation by George Zeppenfeldt-Cestero:

- All applicants have other restaurants in the City – no objections were raised as to any of these applications.

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.

VOTE: 35-0-0-0.

7. 21 West End Avenue (West 61st Street) Application to the SLA for a new two-year liquor license by Café 21, d/b/a Café 21.

Presentation by George Zeppenfeldt-Cestero:

- Disapproval – applicant failed to appear.
- The resolution is a straight disapproval, dropping the prior practice of including the phrase “without prejudice.”

After deliberation, the resolution to **disapprove** was adopted.

VOTE: 36-0-0-0.

8. **1018 Amsterdam Avenue** (West 110th Street) Alteration application by Madrel LLC, d/b/a Marlow Bistro, to the SLA for an existing liquor license serial number 1296187.

Presentation by George Zeppenfeldt-Cestero:

- Alteration application – changing interior of the establishment.
- Change in configuration requires new license because the floor area will change.

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.

VOTE: 35-0-0-0.

9. **New Unenclosed Sidewalk Cafés:**

- **273 Columbus Avenue** (West 73rd Street.) New application #1482-2017-ASWC to the Department of Consumer Affairs by Zucker’s Columbus LLC, d/b/a Zucker’s Bagels, for a four-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 12 tables and 27 seats.
- **353 Amsterdam Avenue** (West 77th Street.) New application #1423-2017-ASWC to the Department of Consumer Affairs by Westside Donut Amsterdam Ventures LLC, d/b/a Dunkin Donuts, for a four-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 4 tables and 8 seats.
- **473 Columbus Avenue** (West 83rd Street.) New application #1824-2017-ASWC to the Department of Consumer Affairs by ACS Columbus LLC, d/b/a Lokal, for a four-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 7 tables and 14 seats.
- **1018 Amsterdam Avenue** (West 110th Street.) New application #1147-2017-ASWC to the Department of Consumer Affairs by Madrel LLC, d/b/a Marlo Bistro, for a four-year consent to operate an unenclosed sidewalk café with 18 tables and 36 seats.

Presentation by George Zeppenfeldt-Cestero:

- No electric bikes are used at any of these locations.

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.

VOTE: 35-0-0-0.

10. **228 West 72nd Street** (West End Avenue – Broadway.) New/change of ownership application #5193-2016 ASWC to the Department of Consumer Affairs and NY City Planning Commission by MTGebhard, LLC, d/b/a Gebhard’s Beer Culture, for a four-year consent to operate an enclosed sidewalk café with 8 tables and 16 seats.

Presentation by George Zeppenfeldt-Cestero:

- Since 1983.
- No concerns from neighbors.
- Smaller footprint than others like Artie’s.

CB7 Comments:

- This site is problematic because neither the current operator nor its predecessors fulfilled its obligation to clear the sidewalk after a snowfall. The recent experience was particularly dangerous.
- The objection to this enclosed café is in addition to certain Board members’ standing objection to enclosed cafés due to a perception that they provide an inadequate return to the public for the use of the sidewalk.
- Also, this café is ancient, and does not conform to current size or construction guidelines.

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.
VOTE: 24-12-0-0.

Next B2B – Steve Cuozzo keynote May 1st – nature of hospitality business
At Lincoln Center – Lincoln Center Kitchen Room.

PRESERVATION COMMITTEE

Jay Adolf and Gabrielle Palitz, Co-Chairpersons

Resolutions Re:

11. **91 Central Park West** (West 69th Street.) Application to the Landmarks Preservation Commission for the reorganization of some of the stained glass on the 16th floor and the 17th floor of Penthouse A.

Elimination of the leaded glass and the reorganization of some of the stained glass in the proposed replacement windows and doors on the 16th floor and the 17th floor of Penthouse A.

Presentation by Jay Adolf:

- This application was considered by CB7 last month – it involved replacing leaded glass with clear glass in windows and doors on a penthouse.
- Committee considered it inappropriate, and the majority of the Board adopted a resolution to disapprove.
- Applicant returned with a fresh design that adopted CB7’s recommendations to keep leaded glass but make clear/transparent, with one minor modification to one window to reduce transom.

CB7 Comments:

- Resolution includes withdrawal of previous CB7 resolution.

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.
VOTE: 34-0-1-0.

12. **150 Riverside Drive** (West 87th Street.) Application to the Landmarks Preservation Commission for an entrance canopy; two signage panels at the 87th Street corner, and replacement of wall sconces at the entrance.

Presentation by Jay Adolf:

- CB7 approved the canopy and wall sconces in a resolution last month, but disapproved the sign on the façade of the building at the corner of Riverside Drive.
- Applicant returned to Committee with a new design that adopted our suggestions for a more modest sign.
- The modified design is appropriate, and the Committee appreciates the applicant adopting our suggestions.

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.
VOTE: 34-0-0-0.

13. **225 West End Avenue** (West 70th Street.) Application to the Landmarks Preservation Commission to alter the West 70th Street areaway, and install a H.C access chair lift, signage and period appropriate lighting.

Presentation by Jay Adolf:

- Modification to a gate and fence to accommodate a handicap lift – with modifications to the storefront infill at the base of the areaway. The storefront is used for community facility purposes.

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.

VOTE: 34-0-0-0.

14. **277 West End Avenue** (West 72nd-73rd Streets.) Application to the Landmarks Preservation Commission for window replacement.

Presentation by Jay Adolf:

- Window master plan. Original windows were 6:1; none remain. All were replaced years before designation.
- Retaining the current configurations will allow continuity of appearance as residents replace windows.

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.

VOTE: 33-0-0-0.

15. **269 Columbus Avenue** (West 73rd Street.) Application to the Landmarks Preservation Commission to legalize the 3 lighted signs at the sidewalk café.

Presentation by Jay Adolf:

- Application concerns AG Kitchen Restaurant on east side of Columbus Avenue at West 73rd Street.
- Orange signs inside the outdoor café were the subject of a violation.
- Application is to legalize the signs. The operator was of the mistaken view that were as of right.
- Research demonstrates that the orange signs were similar in character to previous signage used at this location.

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.

VOTE: 30-2-2-0.

16. **270 West 73rd Street** (Broadway-West End Avenue.) Application to the Landmarks Preservation Commission for a new three-story rear yard addition, a stair bulkhead, façade restoration, and replacement of windows.

Presentation by Jay Adolf:

- The application concerns a townhouse renovation, involving restoring the façade; demolishing an existing L rear-yard extension and replacing it with a shallower, full-width extension; and installing a roof stair bulkhead.
- Extension will be common red brick.
- Rear fenestration with tall thin windows on first 3 floors with transoms whose proportions are well within the style and configuration routinely found appropriate by CB7.
- Recommendation to increase size of mullions on front window replacement.

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.

VOTE: 33-0-0-0.

PARKS & ENVIRONMENT COMMITTEE

Klari Neuwelt, Chairperson

Community Board 7/ Manhattan

Resolutions Re:

17. Renovation of The Belvedere Castle.

Presentation by Klari Neuwelt:

- Laine Adinizio from the Central Park Conservancy:
- Objective is to make the view from the Belvedere Castle accessible to mobility challenged park users.
- The Great Lawn, which lies to the north of the Belvedere Castle, was constructed on the former site of one of 2 reservoirs in the Park. This reservoir was a rectangular block with retaining walls, one of which included the Belvedere's Vista Rock, which was integral to the retaining wall.
- Belvedere constructed on Vista Rock while reservoir still there.
- The original Belvedere consisted of the masonry castle-like structure plus a wooden open pavilion and an adjoining tower. The tower lasted less than 2 years – another masonry tower was planned and the wood tower was removed, then the economic crash of 1873 eliminated funding for the project.
- The original plaza was of blue stone in a diamond pattern; the current hex pavers were installed in the 1980s.
- The Reservoir walls included a promenade.
- The Reservoir was decommissioned in 1929; the Great Lawn was created in 1934.
- The castle roof was removed to allow the weather bureau to install equipment, and windows were added ca. 1919.

- The wooden open-air pavilion was recreated in the 1980s.
- The castle windows were replaced with a diamond pattern metal grille windows for safety.

- The scope of the current proposed work will include: Masonry restoration; Recreating the lost wooden tower; and replacing the existing windows with clear paned glass.

- Accessibility is a challenge since Belvedere is at a high point in the Park.
- There is a 54-foot grade change from the West Drive to the Belvedere. Creating access from the west would obliterate the Shakespeare Garden, which is not an option.
- The grade change from the East Drive is a more manageable 25 foot rise and a longer run.
- The current path from the East Drive was installed in 1934 – not quite straight, but not curvilinear.
- Historically the paths to the Belvedere included the reservoir promenade and a straight path called "Lovers Lane" between the promenade wall and the transverse.
- Looking to history for cues on accessibility.
- Also sought to avoid eliminating old growth trees.
- Proposing a straight path with an accessible grade that solves the steep rise at the end by infilling and raising the path in the middle of the run. The proposal will require using retaining walls and a parapet wall.
- Recreates the effect of the Reservoir promenade.
- Result is that everyone would have access to the view from the Belvedere plaza.
- The proposed retaining walls would be of stone to match the Belvedere, and will blend in.
- Would not change circulation to other parts of the Park.

- Clip from Met Museum silent film with actors in armor shot with the Belvedere Castle as backdrop.

CB7 Comments:

- Will new path connect elsewhere?
- A: Same as current.

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.

VOTE: 32-0-0-0.

18. Reconstruction of the East 67th Street / Billy Johnson Playground.

Presentation by Laine Adinizio:

- This proposal is part of the Conservancy's "Plan for Play" program – renovating playgrounds throughout the Park.
- The goals include safety and making playgrounds have an integrated relationship with the Park.
- Proposal will modernize play structures, update water features, and bring the playground into compliance with modern safety standards.
- This is the first playground renovated by the Conservancy in the 1980s.
- The original design was by Upper West Side architect M. Paul Friedberg, who is consulting on the renovation.
- One of the main features of the playground is a large granite slide that will be updated and modified in keeping with its current configuration, including adding a second, smaller granite slide.
- Proposal will be similar to the current conditions but with new infrastructure, more space for safety around swings.
- Friedberg is helping to create a rope net climber.

CB7 Comments:

- ADA swings?
A: 1 out of 4

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.

VOTE: 33-0-0-0.

19. Reconstruction of the East 108th Street / Bernard Playground.

Presentation by Laine Adinizio:

- This playground is located at the Northeast corner of the Park – adjacent to the Harlem Meer.
- It is intended for very young children.
- Integrates well (rebuilt by Conservancy in 1990s).
- No major changes, but will be made ADA accessible by removing granite block pavers.
- A user-activated water feature will replace the current one.
- Increasing space for safety around play structures. Need to increase footprint to meet safety standards. Swings will now face the Harlem Meer.

After deliberation, the resolution to **approve** was adopted.

VOTE: 32-0-0-0.

The meeting was **adjourned** at 10:25 pm.

Present: Roberta Semer, Jay Adolf, Andrew Albert, Linda Alexander, Richard Asche, Isaac Booker, Tina Branham, Elizabeth Caputo, Christian Cordova, Kenneth Coughlin, Louisa Craddock, Mark Diller, Robert Espier, Miki F. Fiegel, Sheldon Fine, Paul Fischer, Sonia Garcia, Marc Glazer, Sarina Gupta, Benjamin Howard-Cooper, Meisha Hunter Burkett, Madelyn Innocent, Audrey Isaacs, Brian Jenks, Genora Johnson, Blanche E. Lawton, Lillian Moore, Klari Neuwelt, Michele Parker, Jeannette Rausch, Seema Reddy, Richard Robbins, Suzanne Robotti, Madge Rosenberg, Peter Samton, Susan Schwartz, Ethel Sheffer, Polly Spain, Mel Wymore, Howard Yaruss, George Zeppenfeldt-Cestero, Dan Zweig **Absent:** Steven Brown, Page Cowley, Catherine DeLazzero, Gabrielle Palitz.

LAND USE COMMITTEE

Richard Asche and Page Cowley, Co-Chairpersons

April 2017

Present: Richard Asche, Co-Chair, Page Cowley, Co-Chair, Louise Craddock, Jeannette Rausch, Seema Reddy, Peter Samton, Sheldon J. Fine, Ethel Sheffer. Absent: Tina Branham.

CB7 Board Members Present: Roberta Semer, Chair CB7, and Mark Diller.

The Meeting was called to order at 7:00 pm and was adjourned at approximately 8:30 pm.

The following matters were discussed and actions taken:

- 1. 340 West 85th Street (between West End Avenue & Riverside Drive).** West Side Federation of Senior Supportive Housing (WSFSSH) briefing on their newest project at this address, aka "The Brandon." Currently a SRO residence for women.

Paul Freitag, Executive Director of West Side Federation of Senior Supportive Housing (WSFSSH) gave a summary of the project as follows:

The existing building is currently an SRO for women only with private rooms and shared bathrooms. The 16 current residents will be relocated to the same floor. The building contains an Auditorium (now used for presentations and as a social space), a commercial Kitchen and a Dining Room. There are also office on the ground and second floors.

Long-Range Plan:

Mr. Freitag explained that the long-range plan will be to operate the building as transitional housing in the same way as other WSFSSH sites are operated. There are 125 rooms that will continue to serve adults that are 50 years or older. The long-range plan includes providing a second elevator and an ADA ramp to the front entrance. No other upgrading of the interior rooms or spaces was mentioned.

Short Term Plan:

As the 108th Street project is proceeding with new a new building to replace the present Valley Lodge structure, the plan is that The Brandon will become a temporary residence for those currently housed at the Valley Lodge building. The relocation is expected to be approximately three years and at that time, the Valley Lodge residents will be returned to the new building on 108th Street.

Additional Information about the building that was not disclosed at the meeting provided below:

The building was built between 1926 and 1927 and designed by George B. de Gersdorf (1866 - ?) who attended Harvard and the Ecole Des Beaux Arts and worked briefly for Mckim Mead & White before starting his own firm. The building was designed as a clubhouse and dwelling for the Three Arts Club of New York. The Club was founded in 1904 by Jane Harris Hall for women studying music, drama and the fine arts. In 1953, the Volunteers of America purchased the building the year this organization was established and used the building for their administrative offices and initially as a residence for business women. The building is part of the Riverside-West End Historic District Extension I designated in June, 2012

The following questions were raised:

1. Mr. Tom Newman, a neighbor of the The Brandon stated that he had attended a recent meeting and that there were no facts presented until now. There was concern about re-populating the building with 125 people that were formerly homeless and in transition, particularly where there is likely to be loitering, as this is a dead-end block. Mr. Newman asked about the extent of care and social services that were to be provided both long and short-term.

Response: Mr. Freitag stated that the population would be 50% men and 50% women segregated on different floors. Those that are to be transferred from Valley Lodge comprise 92 formerly homeless do receive physical and mental health support.. There are approximate 40 staff members that attend to these residents/patients with a 24/7 manned front desk. Mr. Feitg's colleague added that there are 3 psychiatrists, a medical team consisting of a doctor and nurse that are available during the week, 6 social workers that work with residents providing physical education, music, art and other supportive classes. The night staff is always 4 people on duty, one of which is a shift supervisor. The persons that are relocated to a WSFSSH are carefully screened.

2. Karen Hardart, also a neighbor, commented that there is particular sensitivity for mornings and evenings as there are several schools and pre-school programs near The Brandon, including numerous commuters to the subway and Broadway bus. This population may pose a risk to children, particularly with outdoor smokers. Ms. Hardart mentioned that it was not only residents, but at the rear of the property where there is a rear yard that has access to the kitchen area and kitchen staff often uses the rear yard as a smoking area that is a problem to neighbors.

Response: Mr. Freitag stated that smoking was not permitted and they have programs to help smokers quit. He said he did not know about the kitchen staff and rear yard smoking issue and would look into it.

3. Page Cowley asked questions related to the delivery of food, laundry etc., transportation arrangements for residents, adequacy of security, and deterrent measures to prevent loitering.

Response: Deliveries are twice a week, primarily food. All residents are given responsibilities and duties; residents can come and go as necessary, travel is usually by public transport and often accompanied with a social worker.

4. Ethel Sheffer asked about the timetable for the project.

Response. Mr. Freitag said that the ASFSSH will become the owner on May 15, 2017. Volunteers of America will be moved out by early in 2018. Valley Lodge residents will be relocated to this site for a three-year period and then the building will become a permanent shelter.

5. Peter Samton asked if there was any opportunity for a roof top garden/ outdoor space.

Response: There is a question of safety and surveillance. The roof is neither secure at the present nor is there a plan to convert the roof to resident use.

6. Lousia Craddock asked about the relocation of the Valley Lodge residents and the current resident/patient program. Will they continue for the 3 years that Valley Lodge residents are at The Brandon? And what is the nature of the program envisioned when the residents return, and new residents are taken in?

Response: The same type of program will continue as has been developed at Valley Lodge.

7. Seema Reddy asked what level of building improvements, if any, are planned when the Valley Lodge residents are returned to 108th Street?

Response: The population for The Brandon will be 50% men and 50% women and the rooms will continue to private single occupancy with shared bathrooms. The floors will be men or women only, no mixed floors.

8. Roberta Semer offered the following general comment regarding the reputation of WSFSSH group and that they operate well run programs and building.
9. Mark Diller added that perhaps addition security cameras could be installed to monitor the entrance and building boundaries.

Response: There is already a single camera positioned and there is a 10 o'clock curfew, unless late entry is pre-approved. If residents abuse the privileges and rules, management has the right to transfer them out of the program.

No action was taken and none was required.

2. Review of CB7's FY2018 District Needs Statement and priorities for the NYC Capital & Expense Budgets, and updates for FY2019.

Roberta Semer than introduced this item and explained how every committee was working with the same questions and list of requirements / recommendations so there would a uniform and comprehensive set of responses for each committee moving forward. Ms. Semer acknowledged that there were certain committee's were capital funding is necessary and part of the committee work, but each and every committee could tailor their actions and statements accordingly to suit new issues and changes taking place in our district. Ms. Semer proceeded to review the five questions with the committee.

There was some dissent about how we could possibly undertake this exercise without adequate preparation. Ms. Semer reassured our committee that the process does work and that this is the first step. With some reassurance by Ms. Semer, the review took place with all committee members offering suggestions.

Below are the questions and the committee's responses with the understanding that each committee member will be assigned a question / issue to be presented and reviewed at the May Land Use Meeting.

- 1a. What is/are the central theme(s) of your section of the FY18 DNS?

By consensus the following were agreed to be concerns (not listed in order of priority):

- BSA Reform
- Super Talls / TDR / Lack of Height Limitations
- Proliferation of Multiple Construction Projects
- DOB Enforcement and permitted Construction Working Hours

- Coordination with other Infrastructure Projects
- Affordable Housing
- Sidewalk Bridges and Scaffolding
- Columbus Avenue beautification (87th to 95th Street)
- Inadequate Public Trash / Recycling Receptacles and Locations
- Use of Sidewalks
- POPS

- 1b: Will this change in the FY19DNS? Yes
- 2a. Are Community needs in FY18 current? Not applicable
- 2b. List any district needs that are missing: Not applicable
- 3a Do the FY18 Budget Priorities correspond to community needs? Not applicable
- 3b. List any budget priorities that are missing: Not applicable

4. Which needs and/or priorities would be enhanced if you had data and/or trend data?

- Number of DOB Applications submitted for new construction
- Number of those requiring Special Permits or Waivers
- Number of those considered as-of-right”
- Number of new construction permits issued
- Number of permits issued that include affordable housing
- Number of Sanitation / Recycling Collection locations for public use (cans and “Big Bellies”
- Number, location and duration of Infrastructure projects for utility, road re-surfacing etc. per year anticipated and actual
- Number of new construction permits issued

5. Which Community groups / organizations could inform your section of the DNS and Budget Priorities? List and indicate if you consult with them now on community issues:

- Department of City Planning: Yes
- Department of Buildings: No
- Housing Preservation Department: Yes
- Landmark West! Yes

- Municipal Arts Society Yes
- Block Associations Yes
- Other Community Boards Sometimes

It was agreed that for the next Land Use Meeting, each committee member will each review one of the questions being asked in order to develop a more complete response. Please bring your comments and suggestions to the next meeting. The assignments for the three questions are as follows.

Question 1a: Richard Asche, Page Cowley and Tina Branham

Question 4: Louise Craddock and Jeannette Rausch, Ethel Sheffer

Question 5 : Seema Reddy, Peter Samton, Sheldon J. Fine

3. New Business:

Peter Samton asked that there be additional feedback and support to advance the Columbus Avenue Beautification concept that he had presented last year and be presented to the our Council Members and the Borough President.

The meeting was adjourned.

Respectfully submitted by Page Cowley

PARKS & ENVIRONMENT COMMITTEE

Klari Neuwelt, Chairperson

April 17, 2017

Present: P&E Committee Members: Steven Brown, Meisha Hunter Burkett, Ken Coughlin, Klari Neuwelt, Susan Schwartz. Absent: Brian Jenks, Sarina Gupta. Non-committee Board Member: Mark Diller.

Meeting Start: 7:09 pm

1. Review of CB7's FY2018 District Needs Statement and priorities for the NYC capital and expense budgets, and updates for FY2019.

Mark Diller, co-chair of CB7's Strategy and Budget committee, explained the new format for the CB's District Needs Statement (DNS) for FY 2019, which begins July 1, 2018. Committee members reviewed last year's DNS and relevant budget priorities and suggested additional central themes and community needs. The DNS is to be filed with the City on August 1.

2. Presentation by The Broadway Mall Association on the Joy Brown sculpture exhibition to be installed on the Broadway Malls in May 2017 and run for 6 months.

Deborah Foord, a board member of the Broadway Mall Association, presented plans for the installation on the Mall next month of sculptures by artist Joy Brown, four of which will be located in CB7 – on the malls at 72nd Street, 79th Street, 96th Street and 103rd Street. The installation will be paid for by the artist's gallery, Morrison Gallery of Kent, Connecticut. The sculptures will be exhibited for six months, with a possible three-month extension. Installation begins at 72nd Street in mid-May.

Brown's sculptures will be larger-than-life, human-like figures cast in bronze. Foord said that they have proved highly popular in other cities where they have been installed.

In light of the sculptures' size – one will be 2,500 pounds – committee member Meisha Hunter Burkett asked Foord to ensure that their impact on existing infrastructure be addressed.

Foord said that the installation does not require approval of the Public Design Commission because it is temporary, but that it will go through the Parks Department's approval process.

Committee Chair Klari Neuwelt noted as an aside that for the first time in about seven years, Riverside Park South will not this spring be playing host to a new set of sculptures in partnership with the Art Students League. The agreement with the League for sculptures at the seven locations in Riverside Park South has expired, though CB7 had asked in a prior resolution that it be continued. This year the League's new sculptures will be installed to the north; they will still be in Riverside Park, but not in our district. However, two of the seven locations in Riverside Park South have been designated for some kind of continued temporary sculpture program.

Resolution to approve the Broadway Mall Association's exhibition of the Joy Brown sculptures in CB7:

Committee: 5-0-0-0. Non-committee board members: 1-0-0-0.

3. Theodore Roosevelt Park. Introduction by NYC Department of Parks & Recreation of upcoming study regarding potentially opening Theodore Roosevelt Park lawns for intermittent public use.

Sarah Neilson, the Department of Parks & Recreation's Chief of Policy and Long-Range Planning, outlined the plans for a study of how Theodore Roosevelt Park might fit into the Department's Parks Without Borders initiative. Neilson was assisted by Katerina Athanasiou, the study's Project Manager.

The Parks Without Borders program seeks to make parks more open, welcoming, and beautiful by improving entrances, edges, and park-adjacent spaces. With regard to Theodore Roosevelt Park, the Department will be taking a "holistic" look at the lawns on both the park's north and south sides. All these lawns are currently closed to public.

The study's scope of work will include a usership analysis (an observational study of how people are using the park), a site analysis, public engagement, and recommendations. CB7 will be the vehicle for general community

input, and the Department plans two more meetings at CB7, the second of which will be to present the study's final recommendations in the fall of 2017. Funding to implement whatever recommendations there are has not yet been identified.

Neilson and Athanasiou stressed that the Department is approaching the study with open minds, and that the results are by no means a foregone conclusion.

Committee members questioned the reason for a study of the park at this time. Chair Neuwelt asked whether the planned addition to the American Museum of Natural History, which the park surrounds, played a role. Neilsen said that it did not, and that the study had its origins in a recent visit of Parks Commissioner Mitchell Silver to the park.

Board member Mark Diller inquired about what looks to him like a contradiction: while the Department says that it is embarking on the study with no preconceived notions, the Parks Without Borders effort does seem to have a preconceived agenda attached to it. Neilson said that every site is different, and that the Department does not know everything about Theodore Roosevelt Park. What the study recommends depends on what the problems are.

Diller then suggested that the proposed study could negate the careful community work already done by the current working group consisting of representatives of DPR, the Museum, the Friends of Roosevelt Park and neighborhood constituents with regard to the areas of the park adjacent to the proposed new addition to the Museum. Neilson replied that that previous work will be absorbed into the study, and that the study is an opportunity to look at the entire park area. Neilson assured Diller that the current planned changes to the park would be preserved, and that the study's recommendations, whatever they are, will be "supplemental."

Community member Peter Wright, Chair of Friends of Roosevelt Park, welcomed the idea of a study and fact-gathering, but warned that if the lawns are opened to the public, maintenance costs will double, noting that the Department's budget for Theodore Roosevelt Park has not increased in 17 years.

Community member Steve Anderson, of the Theodore Roosevelt Park Neighborhood Association, which represents residents of the West 81st Street block opposite Theodore Roosevelt Park, said there is a need for a vision for the whole park, but questioned the Department's ability to keep park users from abusing the privilege of using the park space. He said that congestion is his association's principal concern. They want an open park, but a managed park as well. He suggested that perhaps the Museum could contribute to maintenance and enforcement.

Barbara Adler, President of the Columbus Avenue Business Improvement District, said the BID has long wanted the park's fences to come down on the Columbus Avenue side. She said that the park's frontage on Columbus could be even better utilized so that it serves "a real market function."

Peter Wright cautioned that a working group addressing design elements of the park almost two decades ago (both he and Neuwelt had been members) had concluded that the park should be devoted to quiet uses (possibly inconsistent with adding commercial or similar activities along Columbus Avenue).

New Business.

Dan Cohen, President of Friends of Anibal Aviles Playground, located on 108th Street between Columbus and Amsterdam avenues, announced that the playground received a \$1,000 grant from the City Parks Foundation for "It's My Park Day." Festivities will run from 11 am to 2 pm on May 7 and will include a puppet show. Cohen also noted that the entire park has been repainted.

Chair Neuwelt brought the committee up to date on developments at Lincoln Center's Damrosch Park, which has been the focus of community complaints, culminating in a legal settlement, regarding the use of city parkland for commercial purposes.

Neuwelt said that the Big Apple Circus has been sold out of bankruptcy to a for-profit entity, and that it will be back this fall/winter taking space in the park, this time for a somewhat longer period than in prior years.

Meanwhile, Lincoln Center will also have a large tent in the park for three private events in September. Though those events will take place within about a week of each other, Lincoln Center has told DPR that set-up and removal of the tent facility will consume that park space for more than month, a time period recently pared

back by just three days per an inquiry from DPR. Committee member Steven Brown suggested that CB7ask Lincoln Center officials to provide comparative information about the number of days that the park has been closed to the public over the last three years.

Committee member Meisha Hunter Burkett expressed concerns about the promised restoration of the fabric of the park and questioned what restoration work has occurred.

Mark Diller observed that May and September are the ideal months to enjoy the park.

It was decided to invite both Lincoln Center and the neighborhood group concerned with the park's use to the Committee's May or June meeting.

Meeting ended 9:45 pm

PRESERVATION COMMITTEE MINUTES

Jay Adolf and Gabrielle Palitz, Co-Chairpersons

April 13, 2017

The meeting was called to order at 6:30 pm.

Present: Jay Adolf, Gabrielle Palitz, Louisa Craddock, Mark Diller, Miki Fiegel, and Peter Samton. **Absent:** Meisha Hunter Burkett.

The following matters were considered and actions taken.

267 Columbus Avenue (West 72-73 Streets). Application for the replacement of a cast iron vault light structure.

Presentation by Mary B. Dierickx, Preservation Consultant.

- Building constructed ca. 1888-89 as a flats building with commercial units on the ground floor.
- Applicant's storefront on the east side of Columbus is believed to be the former entrance to the residential units above.
- Store had cast iron vault lights, which allowed light to penetrate through glass in an iron enclosure to the vault below.
- Vault lights collapsed through no fault of the contractor during façade and store renovations – iron work was rusted through.
- Vault light ironwork was set inside a granite border. Both the iron work and the granite collapsed into what remained of the vault.
- The granite border continues south in front of adjoining storefronts except for the Dakota Bar at the corner of West 72nd Street.
- It appears that the vault below has been at least partially filled-in, which is not uncommon for surviving vaults.

- Few if any vault lights are found in the immediate historic district.
- Research for this application included a Word search in the designation report for the Upper West Side/Central Park West Historic District, with no mention of sidewalk vaults or vault lights turning up in the search results.
- Sidewalk vault lights are a familiar part of SoHo historic districts, not the Upper West Side.

- Proposal is to replace both the vault lights and the granite border with concrete.
- Concrete would be tinted to match the granite that borders the main façade.

- The only way to restore the vault lights would be to fabricate new iron work with glass vault lights – the existing materials are beyond saving.
- Expense of new iron panels and vault lights is considerable (greater than \$60,000), and matching granite to the border with the neighboring stores would also be quite dear.

Committee Discussion:

Comments supporting the restoration and preservation of the vault lights:

- Research reveals the history of sidewalk vault lights and their role in providing natural light to basement spaces.

- LPC has design guidelines for sidewalk vault covers, which call for restoration either with glass vault lights or diamond plates.
- Should use either of those options, although restoring the vault lights would be preferable.
- Expense is a factor, but is not the only consideration.
- Perhaps the expense could be mitigated by selecting the diamond-pattern covers rather than vault lights per the options in the LPC Guidelines.
- Diamond plate is more affordable.
- Vault lights are a part of the fabric of this building. Would hate to have this to disappear.
- We owe it to the community to replace this feature, even if unusual.
- Can't give up on this design effect just because it is modest in size at this location.
- Just because it is unusual in our District, we should honor the design choices actually made.

Comments supporting the application to replace with concrete:

- The same vault extends in front of other stores in this row without vault lights.
- The existing vault lights did not cover a huge amount of area. The question of preservation of the vault lights might be more appropriate if they were a more prominent feature of this building and block.
- Had the building entrance remained at the location of the subject storefront, and the vault lights were an effect associated with the main entrance, the appropriateness of preserving the vault might feel different.
- These vault lights are an anomalous remnant that is not of defining importance in our District.
- These vault lights are a nice effect, but the preservation cost-benefit analysis the store owners and applicants too far.
- Vault lights are not a feature of this District
- With or without these vault lights, this façade has a mottled effect.
- The design choice of vault lights followed a function of illuminating the vault space which has now been eclipsed.
- Switching to a different design such as diamond pattern metal is not preservation – that a different design choice could have been made a century ago is irrelevant and is certainly not preservation.
- Concern for expediting approval so that the store, which is otherwise ready, could open.

Resolution to disapprove:

After deliberation, the resolution to disapprove the application was adopted.

VOTE: 3-2-0-0.

Adjourned at 7:15 pm.