

In Re September Public Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint Review
Board
September 18, 2024

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

-----X

CIVILIAN COMPLAINT REVIEW BOARD
PUBLIC HEARING
September 18, 2024
4:10 p.m.

-----X

HELD VIA VIDEOCONFERENCE/
100 Church Street, 10th Floor
New York, New York 10007

B E F O R E:
JONATHAN DARCHE, ESQ. - EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

COURT REPORTER:
Sabrina Brown Stewart

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PUBLIC MEETING AGENDA

=====

1. Call to Order
2. Remarks from the Executive Director
3. Presentation from Outreach on the CCRB
4. Public Comment
5. Old Business
6. New Business
7. Adoption of Minutes
8. Adjourn to Executive Session

In Re September Public Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint Review Board
September 18, 2024

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CCRB BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT:

=====

- 1. Patrick Smith - Board Member
- 2. Charlane Brown-Wyands, Esq. - Board Member
- 3. Herman Merritt - Board Member
- 4. Esmeralda Simmons, Esq. - Board Member
- 5. Joseph A. Puma - Board Member
- 6. AU Hogan - Board Member
- 7. Joseph Fox - Board Member
- 8. June Northern - Board Member
- 9. Frank Dwyer - Board Member
- 10. Kevin Jemmott - Board Member
- 11. John Siegal - Board Member

PRESENTERS:

MAROUA RIGHI - Deputy Director of Outreach and Intergovernmental Affairs of the Civilian Complaint Review Board

In Re September Public Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint Review
Board
September 18, 2024

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

S P E A K E R S :

Michael Meyers - President, NY Civil Rights
Coalition

Mari Moss - Taskforce Member - Mayors Task
force to End Gender and Domestic
Based Violence

In Re September Public Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint Review
Board
September 18, 2024

5

1 MS. ALVAREZ: Good evening, everyone.
2 Thank you for joining us. For those
3 utilizing ASL services, today's ASL
4 interpreters are Beth Zuriff and Veronica
5 Staehle. Instructions on how to pin their
6 video can be found on the chat. For those
7 utilizing closed captioning services, CART
8 services will be provided, and it can also be
9 found in the chat.

10 Thank you.

11 MR. DARCHE: Good afternoon, everyone.
12 My name is Jonathan Darche. I use he/him
13 pronouns, and I'm the Executive Director of
14 the CCRB. Thank you for joining us today.

15 Will the Board Members present in
16 person please introduce themselves now.

17 MR. SMITH: Pat Smith. Good afternoon,
18 the mayoral appointee.

19 MS. BROWN-WYANDS: Good afternoon.
20 Charlane Brown-Wyands, Police Commissioner
21 designee.

22 MR. MERRITT: Herman Merritt, City
23 Council designee from Brooklyn.

24 MS. SIMMONS: Esmeralda Simmons, Public
25 Advocate designee from Brooklyn.

In Re September Public Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint Review
Board
September 18, 2024

6

1 MR. PUMA: Good afternoon. I'm Joseph
2 Puma. I go by he/him pronouns. I'm the City
3 Council designee from Manhattan.

4 MR. HOGAN: AU Hogan, City Council
5 designee from Queens.

6 MR. FOX: Hi. Joe Fox, NYPD rep.

7
8 MR. DARCHE: So, Ms. June Northern is
9 joining us online today, but she's having
10 audio issues. So, I wanted to let you all
11 know that she's here, but she won't be able to
12 introduce herself. And I believe Frank --Mr.
13 Dwyer and Mr. Jemmott are online as well. If
14 you could introduce yourselves.

15 MR. DWYER: Frank Dwyer, Police
16 Commissioner designee. Thank you. Good to be
17 with you.

18 MR. JEMMOTT: Good evening. Kevin
19 Jemmott, mayoral appointee from Queens.

20 MR. DARCHE: So, we're going to hold off
21 on the minutes because we're expecting
22 Mr. Siegal to arrive shortly, and I'm going to
23 give my report.

24 I'll begin today's meeting by thanking
25 Kevin Jemmott for his service on the Civilian

In Re September Public Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint Review
Board
September 18, 2024

1 a member of the Board for nearly two years
2 and brought wisdom and integrity to every
3 complaint he voted on. On a personal note, I
4 benefited immensely from Kevin's insight into
5 the work we do and its importance.

6 Kevin, thank you for the help you've
7 given me over the last two years. I know I
8 speak for the entire staff when I say that
9 while we are sad to see you go, we wish you
10 luck on your future endeavors.

11 At our July meeting, the topic of
12 inclusion of civilian criminal histories and
13 case closing reports was introduced. In
14 addition to the issues of NYPD case retention
15 and complaints being closed by NYPD due to
16 proximity to the statute of limitations. We
17 are in the process of compiling and analyzing
18 data on these topics, and I will have an
19 update for the public and the Board at an
20 upcoming meeting.

21 Last week, the NYPD issued updates to
22 the Disciplinary Matrix, which is the set of
23 guidelines the Board uses for deciding what
24 level of discipline to recommend for members
25 of the NYPD the Board found committed

In Re September Public Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint Review
Board
September 18, 2024

1 misconduct. We are also in the process of
2 analyzing these changes, and I will have an
3 update at an upcoming meeting.

4 Our office is open for walk-in
5 complaints, but it is also possible to file
6 complaints online at nyc.gov/ccrbcomplaint.
7 By telephone at 1(800)341-2272 or by dialing
8 3-1-1 or by tagging the agency on Twitter,
9 Facebook, and Instagram. For those wishing
10 to speak during the public comment section of
11 today's meeting, we ask that you keep your
12 questions and comments to four minutes. If
13 anyone wishes to file a complaint tonight, we
14 have two investigators on hand ready to take
15 any new complaints. The investigators on
16 call this afternoon are Emma Stydahar and Rob
17 Bryan, and Brennia Feliciano is also here
18 from the Civilian Assistance Unit.

19 I just want to check if any members of
20 the Board have any questions for me at the
21 present time.

22 (No response).

23 MR. DARCHE: So, while we are waiting
24 for Mr. Siegal, we can't do any new business
25 or old business because we do not have a

In Re September Public Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint Review
Board
September 18, 2024

1 quorum.

2 Is there any other topic that a member
3 of the Board wishes to bring up at this time,
4 even though we cannot formally vote on it?

5 MR. SMITH: Mr. Darche, I have
6 something to say, which will not require a
7 vote, if I may?

8 Colleagues, members of the public,
9 earlier this month, a CCRB D-panel was
10 postponed because there were not enough CCRB
11 members to fill the panel and vote on the
12 cases. A brief explanation: Onto the
13 New York City Charter, the CCRB should have 15
14 members. Currently, there are only ten.

15 Kevin, I'm sorry. I've already written
16 you off. I'm sorry.

17 (Laughter).

18 MR. SMITH: Because the Mayor and the
19 City Council have not made appointments.
20 These members are divided into three-member
21 panels, each of which reviews 50 to 60 cases
22 a month by computer. Each panel meets
23 virtually once a month and votes to accept or
24 revise the recommendations of the CCRB staff
25 which has investigated the cases. Right now,

In Re September Public Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint Review
Board
September 18, 2024

1 there are three panels reviewing case,
2 instead of five. Hundreds of civilians are
3 waiting for justice, most for 15 months or
4 more because we're missing five CCRB members.

5 Each month, there is a D-panel, 50 or
6 60 cases in which CCRB staff investigators
7 have cleared the officers of the charges
8 against them. In 99 percent of these cases,
9 the three CCRB members on the D-panel vote to
10 accept the staff recommendations and the
11 officer is cleared. In many cases, charges
12 are made against several officers. So, now,
13 there are up to 100 officers whose names will
14 not be cleared because we did not have enough
15 CCRB members to do the job. Up to 100
16 officers who wake up every morning, often for
17 more than a year, wondering about the CCRB
18 case against them.

19 Some of these officers have pending
20 promotions which are delayed until the CCRB
21 case is cleared. Some officers have
22 transfers which are delayed until their names
23 are cleared. Our mayor and our City Council
24 must do their duty and appoint members to the
25 CCRB. We have a solemn obligation to our

In Re September Public Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint Review
Board
September 18, 2024

11

1 citizens and to our police officers to
2 administer justice in a timely manner.

3 Thank you.

4 MR. DARCHE: Thank you, Mr. Smith.

5 Does anyone else on the Board have
6 anything else to say?

7 Ms. Simmons.

8 MS. SIMMONS: Yes. I was not present
9 at the last meeting, so I just wanted to
10 express my appreciation for our former Chair,
11 Arva Rice. I thought she did a fantastic
12 job. All I can say is I have watched the
13 CCRB for many, many years, and she
14 accomplished things for the CCRB,
15 particularly around City Council support and
16 even mayoral support at times, that we were
17 not able to achieve in the past. I am very
18 sorry that she resigned. We will miss her
19 tremendous. I really don't know what we're
20 going to do next year when the budget rolls
21 around, but we'll do our best. We'll carry
22 on.

23 I just wanted to express that I was not
24 in the country at the time. I wanted to
25 express that I've known her for many years

In Re September Public Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint Review
Board
September 18, 2024

12

1 before she joined the CCRB. We've worked --
2 we've been colleagues, and she jumped into
3 this without a background in police work.
4 So, I want you to know that this was
5 truthfully an excellent service.

6 Thank you, Arva.

7 MR. DARCHE: So, at this time, I'm
8 going to turn it over to Yojaira for the
9 public comment portion of our meeting. Sorry.
10 I forgot something. I'm not going to turn it
11 over to Yojaira. I'm going to turn it over to
12 Maroua, our Deputy Director of Outreach and
13 Intergovernmental Affairs, Maroua Righi.

14 MS. RIGHI: Good afternoon all. The
15 Civilian Complaint Review Board is the
16 nation's largest independent oversight entity
17 over the largest police force in the country.
18 The CCRB investigates, mediates, and
19 prosecutes complaints of misconduct against
20 members of the NYPD. The agency is governed
21 by a 15-member board, with five seats
22 appointed by the Mayor, five appointed by the
23 City Council, three designated by the Police
24 Commissioner, one appointed by the Public
25 Advocate, and the Chair is appointed jointly

1 by the Mayor and City Council.

2 So, the CCRB investigates abuses of
3 force, authority, discourtesy, and offensive
4 language. How to report police misconduct:
5 You can file a complaint online at
6 nyc.gov/ccrbcomplaint, or you can call the
7 CCRB at 1(800)341-CCRB. Remember, if you see
8 footage of misconduct on social media or in
9 the news, you can file a complaint, even if
10 you weren't there in person. And our handle
11 is CCRB_NYC. In addition to that, you can
12 also file a complaint by visiting our office
13 at 100 Church Street. You could file a
14 complaint online at nyc.gov/ccrbcomplaint.
15 You can DM us on social media. We're on
16 Facebook, Twitter, and Instagram, and our
17 username is CCRB_NYC. You can mail a
18 complaint in to our office, or you can file a
19 complaint at your local police precinct.
20 NYPD is required to accept CCRB complaints at
21 any precinct, and you can also request a
22 complaint form and postage free envelope
23 there.

24 If you would like to request an
25 outreach presentation, you can reach out to

1 us at outreach@CCRB.nyc.gov, and please
2 follow us on social media. Again, we're on
3 Instagram, Twitter, and Facebook with the
4 username CCRB_NYC.

5 Thank you.

6 MR. DARCHE: We will now enter the
7 public comment portion of the meeting. We
8 will begin with those joining us virtually who
9 would like to make a comment, followed by
10 those who are joining us in person. For those
11 joining virtually, please use the raise-your-
12 hand feature. Everyone, please keep your
13 comments to four minutes.

14 Yojaira, would you please call on the
15 first person.

16 MS. ALVAREZ: Thank you, Jon.

17 We'll first be hearing from Michael
18 Meyers.

19 MR. DARCHE: Mr. Meyers actually -- has
20 he been promoted? Is he able to talk?

21 MS. ALVAREZ: Mr. Meyers, can you try
22 to unmute yourself.

23 MR. MEYERS: Testing one, two, three.

24 MS. ALVAREZ: Yes, we can hear you.

25 MR. MEYERS: This is Michael Meyers,

1 President New York Civil Rights Coalition. I
2 will limit my comments to less than
3 four minutes.

4 Five missing members of the CCRB. This
5 is an act of disrespect, an act of disrespect
6 to the people of New York who depend on a
7 quorum of the CCRB to have meetings, to have
8 adjudications of complaints against police
9 officers, and the blame must go to the Mayor
10 of the City of New York and the City Council
11 because they jointly make those appointments.
12 It is embarrassing, to say the least, that
13 the mayor and the City Council have not made
14 necessary appointments to keep this
15 organization busy and active. It's an act of
16 disrespect, and I resent it.

17 Also, we have to note, with esteem and
18 congratulations of the Police Commissioner's
19 resignation. This guy was a terrible police
20 commissioner, and I want to make that for the
21 record. He was a terrible police
22 commissioner and he will not be missed. So
23 long, sayonara, good luck in your next
24 endeavor, that the mayor backed him for as
25 long as he backed him is an embarrassment to

1 the City of New York, to the people of
2 New York who put that mayor in place. So,
3 it's now a matter of time before the other
4 people start rolling out, and we have to --
5 we got to start counting down because there
6 are so many people in the city government who
7 are under suspicion, who are under the
8 federal government's and prosecutor's eyes,
9 and we have to be wondering why. Why? And
10 why is this mayor so silent when he should be
11 vocal, when he should be making these people
12 accountable to the people of New York? This
13 guy is an embarrassment. We have to call --
14 "we," meaning "I," call upon him to be
15 accountable and responsible to the people of
16 New York. And if he can't be, he must resign
17 posthaste, immediately.

18 Thank you very much.

19 MR. DARCHE: Thank you, Mr. Meyers.

20 Before we continue with public comment,
21 Mr. Siegal, would you like to introduce
22 yourself?

23 MR. SIEGAL: Yes. Good afternoon.
24 John Siegal, mayoral appointee of the Board.
25 I apologize for my tardiness. I suppose I

In Re September Public Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint Review
Board
September 18, 2024

17

1 could blame the MTA, but that would be really
2 cheesy.

3 (Laughter).

4 MR. SIEGAL: So, I apologize for being
5 late.

6 MR. DARCHE: Yojaira, is there anyone
7 else online who wishes to make a statement?

8 MS. ALVAREZ: No, that concludes the
9 virtual public session.

10 MR. DARCHE: For those who are here in
11 person and would like to make a public
12 comment, please line up behind the podium, and
13 please keep your comments to four minutes.

14 MS. MOSS: Hello to the CCRB Board,
15 staff, community, all. My name is Mari Moss.
16 I would like to echo the sentiments of
17 Ms. Simmons on Arva Rice. She is greatly
18 missed, and she did a tremendous job, so I
19 know those are going to be big shoes to fill.
20 I'd also like to thank Board Member Smith on
21 acknowledging, letting the community know that
22 there's a responsibility to get five board
23 members appointed immediately, so that the
24 business of this body can be done.

25

1 As we approach domestic violence
2 awareness month in October, I would like to
3 invite the CCRB, which I was so proud to see
4 marching in the African-American parade on
5 Sunday. Love to have a representative at a
6 Chase Bank-sponsored discussion on domestic
7 violence because, as I come to these
8 meetings, I've been sharing the various
9 roadblocks, sometimes the gap, that exist
10 between domestic violence and police when it
11 comes to handling those cases in the best
12 manner possible, so I would love that.

13 The event will take place on
14 October 5th in Harlem Chase branch, which is
15 located at 55 West 125th Street. It will be
16 from 9:00 a.m. to 1:00 p.m. Brunch will be
17 provided, so nobody has to get breakfast or
18 lunch. You can come straight to the Chase
19 branch in Harlem and be fed. And there will
20 be some gifts as well for people who attend.

21 And I'm grateful that we have the first
22 deputy commissioner of the NYPD, Tania
23 Kinsella, attending as well, along with a lot
24 of other people from Safe Horizons and other
25 staff of the administration. So, thank you,

1 and I look forward to seeing some of you
2 there.

3 MR. DARCHE: Thank you for letting us
4 know about that, Ms. Moss. And if you could
5 give Prince all the details, we're going to
6 make sure someone from our outreach team is
7 there.

8 So, that appears to be all of the
9 public comment for today.

10 Would any of the board members who are
11 present here today like to make a motion to
12 approve the August Board Meeting minutes?

13 MR. PUMA: I vote to approve.

14 MR. DARCHE: Would one of the board
15 members like to second that motion?

16 MR. SIEGAL: Second.

17 MR. DARCHE: Are there any changes
18 corrections to the minutes?

19 (No response).

20 MR. DARCHE: Hearing no corrections, all
21 those in favor of approving the minutes, say
22 aye.

23 (Chorus of ayes).

24 MR. DARCHE: All those
25 opposed?(No response).

In Re September Public Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint Review
Board
September 18, 2024

20

1 MR. DARCHE: The minutes are approved.

2 I'd also like to ask one of the board
3 members who's present here today, move that
4 we break into Executive Session.

5 MS. BROWN-WYANDS: I move that we break
6 into Executive Session.

7 MR. DARCHE: The agenda for executive
8 session is the Board will consider four
9 cases -- four complaints. I will discuss
10 pending personnel actions, and the general
11 counsel will provide updates regarding
12 pending litigation.

13 Is there a second to Mr. Brown's
14 motion?

15 MR. HOGAN: Second.

16 MR. DARCHE: All in favor?

17 (Chorus of ayes).

18 MR. DARCHE: This meeting is adjourned
19 into Executive Session.

20 (TIME NOTED: 4:30 p.m.)

21

22

23

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

STATE OF NEW YORK)

:SS

COUNTY OF QUEENS)

I, Sabrina Brown Stewart, a Notary Public within and for the State of New York, do hereby certify:

That the witness whose examination is hereinbefore set forth was duly sworn and that such an examination is a true record of the testimony given by such a witness.

I further certify that I am not related to any of these parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am not in any way interested in the outcome of this matter.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand on this 26th day of September, 2024.

Sabrina Brown Stewart
Sabrina Brown Stewart