

In Re November Public Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint Review  
Board  
November 20, 2024

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

-----X

CIVILIAN COMPLAINT REVIEW BOARD  
PUBLIC MEETING  
NOVEMBER 20, 2024  
4:00 P.M.

-----X

HELD AT 100 CHURCH STREET, 10TH FLOOR  
NEW YORK, NEW YORK  
AND  
VIA WEBEX VIDEOCONFERENCE

B E F O R E:  
ESMERALDA SIMMONS, ESQ., BOARD MEMBER  
JONATHAN DARCHE, ESQ., EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

Transcribed by:  
Julia M. Speros

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

PUBLIC MEETING AGENDA

=====

1. Call to Order
2. Adoption of the Minutes
3. Remarks from the Executive Director
4. Presentation from Outreach on the CCRB
5. Public Comment
6. Old Business
7. New Business
8. Adjourn to Executive Session

In Re November Public Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint Review Board  
November 20, 2024

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT

=====

- 1. Esmeralda Simmons, Esq., Board Member
- 2. Joseph A. Puma, Board Member
- 3. Pat Smith, Board Member
- 4. Herman Merritt, Board Member
- 5. AU Hogan, Board Member
- 6. Joe Fox, Board Member
- 7. Charlane Brown, Esq., Board Member
- 8. June Northern, Board Member
- 9. Frank Dwyer, Board Member
- 10. Dr. Mohammad Khalid, Board Member

Presenters:

Maroua Righi - Deputy Director of Outreach  
and Intergovernmental Affairs  
New York City Civilian Complaint Review Board

In Re November Public Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint Review  
Board  
November 20, 2024

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

SPEAKERS

=====

1. Emmanuel Ashurov, John Jay College Student
2. MoSiao Fang, John Jay College Student
3. Shaniel Douglas, John Jay College Student
4. Lottie Almonte
5. Mari Moss, Task force Member, Mayors Task force to End Gender and Domestic Violence
6. Michael Myers, President and Executive Director New York Civil Rights Coalition
7. Vera Khramova, Civilian
8. Ms. Jennings, Civilian

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

PROCEEDINGS

MR. ROSE: Good evening, everyone.  
Thank you for joining us.

For those utilizing ASL interpretation services, our interpreters today are Lisa Dennett and Beth Zuriff. Their names are displayed on the screen as "ASL Interpreter, SignNexus, Lisa" and "ASL Interpreter, SignNexus, Beth".

For instructions on how to pin their videos, or access to CART services, can be found in the chat.

MS. SIMMONS: Good afternoon, everyone. My name is Esmeralda Simmons. I am -- I use she/her pronouns.

I joined the Board in 2020 as an Appointee of the Public Advocate, Jumaane Williams. I am the third most senior CCRB member -- Board member. That's pretty sad -- but now I'm not. I'm the fourth most senior -- and I will be leading today's meeting since we do not as yet have a Chair.

Thank you for joining us. I mean

In Re November Public Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint Review  
Board  
November 20, 2024

6

1 that. Thank you for coming, and for  
2 those of you that are online, thank you  
3 for coming.

4 I would like to call the CCRB  
5 meeting -- November Public Board Meeting  
6 to order.

7 Today is Transgender Day of  
8 Awareness, and in the spirit -- I'd like  
9 to begin this meeting by taking a moment  
10 to remember all of those who have lost  
11 their lives to anti-trans-violence this  
past year.

12 (Moment of Silence Observed.)

13  
14 MS. SIMMONS: Thank you.

15 Before I pass it to our Board  
16 members to introduce themselves, I would  
17 like to first welcome Dr. Mohammad  
18 Khalid back to the Civilian Complaint  
19 Review Board.

20 Dr. -- yeah, right.

21 Dr. Khalid previously served on this  
22 Board from 2005 to 2014 as a seasoned  
23 veteran. I'm sure he will prove to be a  
24 great asset to us again, bringing wisdom  
25 and integrity to each case he reviews.

In Re November Public Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint Review  
Board  
November 20, 2024

1 Will the Board members please  
2 introduce themselves, starting with you,  
3 Dr. Khalid.

4 DR. KHALID: It is -- it is a great  
5 pleasure and I'm very excited to be  
6 appointed again at the CCRB by the  
7 Speaker of the City Council and the  
8 delegates from the Staten Island -- the  
9 City Council delegates -- and it's a  
10 tremendous honor for me.

11 I have served already close to 10  
12 years and I'm very excited that I have  
13 such a -- I met first time some of them.  
14 Mr. Puma is the one with me many years  
15 ago, but I'm looking forward to working  
16 with -- with all the Board members, my  
17 colleagues, all the staff, and reading  
18 all the cases that we need to read and  
19 make sure that everything is done  
20 properly.

21 And I look forward to working to the  
22 best of my ability, reading all the  
23 cases in a very fair way, so I can make  
24 a better decision with my colleagues.

25 Thank you very much for welcoming me

In Re November Public Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint Review  
Board  
November 20, 2024

8

1 back.

2 MS. SIMMONS: You're truly welcome.

3 And we'll start now with Joe.

4 MR. PUMA: Good afternoon, everyone.

5 My name is Joseph Puma. I go by he/him

6 pronouns. I'm the City Council Designee

7 from Manhattan.

8 And welcome back, Dr Khalid. I look

9 forward to working with you on this

10 Board going forward.

11 MR. DWYER: Good afternoon. I'm

12 Frank Dwyer. I'm a Police Commissioner

13 Designee.

14 DR. KHALID: I'm sorry. I forgot to

15 say that I'm a City Council Designee

16 from Staten Island -- I forgot to say

17 that.

18 MS. SIMMONS: No, you didn't.

19 (Laughter.)

20 MR. FOX: Joe Fox, Police

21 Commissioner Designee.

22 Welcome, Dr. Khalid.

23 DR. KHALID: Thank you, sir.

24 MR. DARCHE: Jonathan Darche, he/him

25 pronouns, Executive Director.



In Re November Public Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint Review  
Board  
November 20, 2024

9

1 MS. NORTHERN: June Northern,  
2 Mayoral Appointee from Brooklyn.

3 MR. MERRITT: Herman Merritt, City  
4 Council Designee from Brooklyn.

5 MS. BROWN: Good afternoon.  
6 Charlane Brown, Police Commissioner  
7 Designate.

8 And, again, welcome to the --  
9 welcome back to the Board, Doctor.

10 MR. SMITH: Good afternoon. Pat  
11 Smith, Mayor's Designee.

12 Dr. Khalid, welcome and good luck.

13 MR. HOGAN: AU Hogan, City Council  
14 Designee from Queens.

15 MS. SIMMONS: Thank you -- Thank  
16 you, members.

17 We'll now turn to administerial  
18 tasks -- adoption of minutes.

19 In regards to the September minutes,  
20 Board member -- Public Board Meeting  
21 minutes, are there any changes or  
22 corrections to the minutes?

23 (No response.)

24 MS. SIMMONS: Hearing none, all  
25 those in favor of approving the minutes,

In Re November Public Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint Review  
Board  
November 20, 2024

10

1 please indicate by saying, "aye".

2 (Chorus of "Ayes".)

3 MS. SIMMONS: Any opposed?

4 (No response.)

5 MS. SIMMONS: The minutes are  
6 approved.

7 We'll now turn to the October  
8 minutes.

9 Any changes or corrections?

10 (No response.)

11 MS. SIMMONS: Hearing, none, all  
12 those in favor, indicate by saying  
13 "aye".

14 (Chorus of "Ayes".)

15 MS. SIMMONS: All those approving,  
16 say "nay" -- all those opposed. All  
17 those opposed, say "nay".

18 (No response.)

19 MS. SIMMONS: The minutes are  
20 approved.

21 We'll now turn to the Executive  
22 Director, Jonathan Darche, who will give  
23 us a report on the agency.

24 MR. DARCHE: Good afternoon,  
25 everyone.

1           As of this month, the CCRB's Racial  
2           Profiling and Bias-Based Policing Unit  
3           has been investigating cases for two  
4           years.

5           The Racial Profiling and Bias-Based  
6           Policing Unit investigates complaints of  
7           profiling, biased-policing by uniformed  
8           members of the NYPD based on 10  
9           protected categories, including race,  
10          religion, gender identity, and sexual  
11          orientation.

12          As of October 23, 2024, the CCRB  
13          received 636 complaints of profiling and  
14          bias-based policing and we have closed  
15          362 of those complaints. Of these, 28  
16          resulted in at least one substantiated  
17          allegation of profiling or bias-based  
18          policing.

19          In December, the Administrative  
20          Prosecution Unit expects to begin its  
21          first trial of a member of service that  
22          includes a profiling specification.

23          In 2021, the agency testified at a  
24          public safety hearing indicating that we  
25          would need 50 staff members to

1           adequately investigate complaints  
2           related to racial profiling and  
3           biased-policing.

4           The City Council and former Mayor  
5           budgeted funding for an additional 33  
6           people in the Racial Profiling Unit, but  
7           today the Racial Profiling Unit only has  
8           17 staff members, including two data  
9           analysts.

10          Due to budget constraints, the CCRB  
11          implemented a strategic resource  
12          allocation directive. This program was  
13          designed to enable the CCRB to  
14          concentrate its resources to effectively  
15          investigate the complaints that we are  
16          able to. There are certain allegations  
17          that we just cannot investigate at this  
18          time.

19          Since implementing this policy on  
20          January 1, 2024, the CCRB has closed  
21          1,516 complaints without investigation.  
22          Of these, at least 194 would have been  
23          investigated by the Racial Profiling  
24          Unit. We hope to resume investigating  
25          these cases as soon as possible.

1                   In the meantime, our Investigator  
2                   Training Unit is working diligently to  
3                   bring our new class of investigators up  
4                   to speed. We will have further updates  
5                   on this matter soon.

6                   In other news, our Data and Policy  
7                   Unit published the Administrative  
8                   Prosecution Unit's third quarter report,  
9                   which is available on our website.

10                  Lastly, on a personal note, I'd like  
11                  to welcome Dr. Khalid back to the Board.  
12                  We're grateful for your resumed service  
13                  and I'm confident you will bring the  
14                  same level of care and dedication to the  
15                  work as you did during your first  
16                  tenure.

17                  DR. KHALID: Thank you.

18                  MR. DARCHE: Our office is open to  
19                  -- for walk-in complaints, but it is  
20                  also possible to file complaints online  
21                  at [nyc.gov/ccrbcomplaint](https://nyc.gov/ccrbcomplaint), by telephone  
22                  at 1-800-341-2272, by dialing 311, or by  
23                  tagging the agency on Twitter, Facebook,  
24                  and Instagram.

25                  For those wishing to speak during

In Re November Public Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint Review  
Board  
November 20, 2024

14

1 the public comment section of today's  
2 meeting, we ask that you keep your  
3 questions and comments to four minutes.

4 If anyone wishes to file a complaint  
5 right now, we have two investigators  
6 on-hand ready to take any new  
7 complaints. The investigators on-call  
8 this afternoon are Emma Stydahar and Rob  
9 Bryan, and Amy O'Sullivan is also here  
10 from the Civilian Assistance Unit.

11 MS. SIMMONS: Are there any  
12 questions to the Executive Director from  
13 the Board?

14 (No response.)

15 MS. SIMMONS: Okay. We'll continue.  
16 We'll now hear from the Deputy  
17 Director of Outreach and  
18 Intergovernmental Affairs, Maroua Righi.

19 MS. RIGHI: Good afternoon,  
20 everyone. My name is Maroua Righi. I'm  
21 the Deputy Director of Outreach and  
22 Intergovernmental Affairs at the CCRB.

23 And the Civilian Complaint Review  
24 Board is the nation's largest  
25 independent oversight entity of the

1 largest police force in the country.  
2 The CCRB investigates, mediates, and  
3 prosecutes allegations of misconduct  
4 against members of the NYPD.

5 The agency is governed by a  
6 15-member Board, which -- with five  
7 seats appointed by the Mayor, five  
8 appointed by the New York City Council,  
9 three designated by the Police  
10 Commissioner, one appointed by the  
11 Public Advocate, and the Chair is  
12 appointly (sic) -- appointed jointly by  
13 the Mayor and City Council.

14 The CCRB investigates abuses of  
15 force, authority, discourtesy, and  
16 offensive language.

17 How to report police conduct:

18 You can file a complaint online by  
19 visiting [nyc.gov/ccrbcomplaint](https://nyc.gov/ccrbcomplaint) or you  
20 can call the CCRB at 1-800-341-CCRB.

21 Remember, if you see footage of  
22 misconduct on social media or in the  
23 news, you can file a complaint, even if  
24 you weren't there in-person -- and our  
25 social media handle is @CCRB\_nyc.

1           You can also file a complaint by  
2           visiting us at our office at 100 Church  
3           Street on the 10th Floor, New York, New  
4           York 10007.

5           You can also file a complaint at any  
6           police precinct. The NYPD is required  
7           to accept CCRB complaints at any  
8           precinct or you can also request a  
9           complaint form and postage-free envelope  
10          at any precinct.

11          The CCRB's Youth Advisory Council  
12          applications are live. The CCRB's YAC  
13          is a group of young leaders -- young New  
14          Yorkers who are committed to criminal  
15          justice issues and improving police  
16          community relations.

17          Members advise the CCRB staff in its  
18          efforts to engage young new workers, and  
19          they serve as ambassadors to their  
20          communities for the agency, and they  
21          also join in team-building activities.

22          So, any young people in New York  
23          City between the ages of 10 and 18 are  
24          eligible to apply to participate in our  
25          Youth Advisory Council.



1           The application deadline is Tuesday,  
2           December 31, 2024 and on the right-hand  
3           side of the screen is a picture from our  
4           most recent Speak Up, Speak Out Youth  
5           Summit. It was last Thursday and young  
6           people from all across the City joined  
7           us to share their experiences and  
8           insight on policing in their communities  
9           and they also participate in a panel  
10          discussion and fun educational  
11          activities.

12           So, if you want more information  
13          about the YAC, please email us at  
14          yac@ccrb.nyc.gov.

15           If you'd also like to request a  
16          presentation, please reach out to us at  
17          outreach@ccrb.nyc.gov, and, again,  
18          please follow us on social media. We're  
19          on Instagram, Twitter, and Facebook, and  
20          our handle is @ccrb\_nyc.

21           Thank you.

22           MS. SIMMONS: Thank you so much.

23           Are there any questions from Board  
24          members to Ms. Righi?

25           (No response.)

In Re November Public Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint Review  
Board  
November 20, 2024

18

1 MS. SIMMONS: Thank you.

2 MS. BROWN: Actually, I do  
3 have a question.

4 MS. SIMMONS: Go ahead.

5 MS. BROWN: How many young  
6 people were in attendance?

7 MS. RIGHI: It was over 55 attendees  
8 in-person and online, we had 20.

9 MS. BROWN: Thank you.

10 MS. BROWN: How did the  
11 invitation go out; how was it  
12 publicized?

13 MS. RIGHI: So, we sent out email  
14 blasts. We called organizations within  
15 our network, schools, teachers,  
16 after-school programs. We reached out  
17 to them. We also did social media  
18 blasts.

19 We did some canvassing in the  
20 neighborhood where the event took place  
21 in Harlem -- yeah -- and we also sent  
22 out news -- newsletters as well about  
23 the event, as well as the Youth Advisory  
24 Council 2025 application.

25 MS. SIMMONS: And who is the liaison

In Re November Public Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint Review  
Board  
November 20, 2024

19

1 between the Board and the Youth Advisory  
2 Council?

3 MS. RIGHI: Me.

4 MS. SIMMONS: Yay. (Laughter.)

5 MS. RIGHI: Thank you.

6 MS. SIMMONS: Thank you.

7 MR. FOX: I've been involved  
8 in organizing events. That's a very  
9 good turnout.

10 MS. RIGHI: Thank you.

11 MR. FOX: Very good

12 MS. SIMMONS: Any other questions?  
13 (No response.)

14 MS. SIMMONS: Thank you again for  
15 your service.

16 MS. RIGHI: Thank you.

17 MS. SIMMONS: We will now move to  
18 the public comment portion of the  
19 meeting.

20 We will begin with those joining us  
21 virtually who would like to make a  
22 comment, followed by those who are  
23 joining us in-person.

24 For those who are joining us  
25 virtually, please use the raise your

In Re November Public Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint Review  
Board  
November 20, 2024

20

1 hand feature. Please keep your comments  
2 to four minutes.

3 Jahi, would you please call on the  
4 first person?

5 MR. ROSE: So far there aren't any  
6 hands raised virtually.

7 MS. SIMMONS: Nobody?

8 MR. ROSE: Okay. Someone just  
9 raised their hand.

10 We have Emmanuel Ashurov.

11 MS. SIMMONS: Go ahead, sir.

12 (No response.)

13 MS. SIMMONS: Sir, we're listening.

14 (No response.)

15 MS. SIMMONS: Go ahead, sir. We're  
16 listening.

17 MR. ROSE: Bear with us for one  
18 moment. We may have some technical  
19 difficulties.

20 MS. SIMMONS: Okay. I'm going to  
21 give it a few moments.

22 Well, we can come back to this --

23 MR. ASHUROV: Can you hear me?

24 MS. SIMMONS: You're here? Oh,  
25 yes -- go ahead.

1                   Your name, sir.

2                   MR. ASHUROV: Hello. My name is  
3 Emmanuel Ashurov and I am a John Jay  
4 College student -- John Jay Criminal  
5 Justice College student interested in  
6 the work of the CCRB and the current  
7 state of police corruption occurring in  
8 New York.

9                   In 2018 the New York Civil Liberties  
10 Union reported a survey which showed 618  
11 officers being implicated in sexual  
12 misconduct cases within the year. The  
13 number could have been larger if it  
14 wasn't for the un-inclusivity that  
15 derives from only one in three women  
16 generally reporting sexual assault  
17 cases. This was reported by the NYCLU  
18 in 2018.

19                   As we approach 2024, with the CCRB  
20 2024 Semi-Annual Report showcasing a  
21 sexual misconduct related reports, which  
22 fall under the abuse of authority,  
23 accumulated to a very minimal number of  
24 all reports received, I want to ask what  
25 can be attributed to the lack of sexual

1 assault reports being received by the  
2 CCRB?

3 And, furthermore, what can be done  
4 to ensure more people report police  
5 sexual misconduct to the CCRB?

6 MS. SIMMONS: Well, I'm going to ask  
7 the Executive Director to respond to  
8 that.

9 MR. DARCHE: So, generally speaking,  
10 sexual misconduct and sexual assault are  
11 crimes that have very low reporting  
12 rates, and so it is not shocking that  
13 the -- the rate of reporting of that  
14 type of incident to the CCRB is low  
15 because it is generally low.

16 That said, the CCRB investigates  
17 those allegations when we receive them  
18 and makes every effort to do so using  
19 trauma-informed interview techniques to  
20 make sure that the victims of sexual  
21 misconduct can feel comfortable coming  
22 to the agency and making those  
23 complaints.

24 When individuals are victims of  
25 sexual misconduct, we only have those

1 cases -- we only have complaints of  
2 sexual misconduct investigated by  
3 individuals who we've sent for special  
4 training and enhanced training in  
5 trauma-informed interviewing.

6 But one of the things since we have  
7 -- since the agency has been  
8 investigating sexual misconduct cases,  
9 we have taken the lessons we've learned  
10 in trauma-informed interview techniques  
11 and spread them throughout the agency  
12 and -- so that our investigators, even  
13 if they haven't received the special  
14 training they need for sexual misconduct  
15 investigations, do have the basic  
16 trauma-informed interview skills that we  
17 think are essential to conduct  
18 interviews of civilians and members of  
19 service without re-traumatizing them.

20 MS. SIMMONS: I would also like to  
21 add that we spread the word to the  
22 public about our jurisdiction covering  
23 these types of offenses so that anyone  
24 alleging, or thinks that they have been  
25 a victim of such acts, will come forward

1 and file a complaint.

2 But it is very, very new  
3 jurisdiction for us, and most of the  
4 public still views it -- still -- I  
5 believe are still not widely aware of  
6 this jurisdiction. So, we're working on  
7 that and we're certainly -- our units  
8 are out there telling people about it,  
9 but it takes a while for the -- for the  
10 public to get acquainted with the fact  
11 that our jurisdiction has been enlarged.

12 I'm thank -- I thank you for your  
13 interest and I hope that if you do any  
14 studies of this agency and our work that  
15 you will at least share them with us so  
16 that any recommendations that you make,  
17 or any insights that you have, can be  
18 put to good use.

19 Good luck to you.

20 Is there another speaker?

21 MR. ROSE: Yes, MoSiao Fang  
22 (phonetic) is our next speaker.

23 MS. SIMMONS: Go ahead.

24 MR. FANG: Hello. Can you hear me?

25 MR. DARCHE: Yes.



1 MS. FANG: Okay. So, hello,  
2 everyone. I'm also one of the John Jay  
3 student.

4 So, we actually currently are  
5 conducting some research, try to enhance  
6 the police transparency, and also try to  
7 prompt the relationship between our NYC  
8 citizen and maybe CCRB and the NYPD.

9 So, based on our research results,  
10 we found our -- one interesting method  
11 that has to use in different states,  
12 which is the virtual inspection way that  
13 could be conduct before, like,  
14 in-person -- really in-person  
15 inspection, especially in the traffic  
16 stop cases.

17 This method actually, based on our  
18 research, has to -- had to use in one of  
19 the police department in Florida and the  
20 other one is in San Francisco, as we  
21 know.

22 So, I want to -- because I had read  
23 the report from the CC -- annual CCRB  
24 report that actually our government is  
25 sadly cutting budgets to -- like, from

1 the CCRB -- and, also, we also have a  
2 lot of complaint cases enhancing, like,  
3 each year based on your statistical data.

4 So, what's the opinion about, like,  
5 virtual inspection toward, like, NYPD  
6 officer conducting -- we think, like --  
7 cause I also read the NYPD's inspection  
8 procedure, specifically in the traffic  
9 stop -- we think maybe the Level 1  
10 situation.

11 Would that be possible or be  
12 beneficial for this kind of technique to  
13 involve and help the complaint cases,  
14 because if you do these kind of video  
15 record, everything will be, like,  
16 transparent, and, you know, like, record  
17 at the moment as evidence, who could  
18 also enhance the efficiency of the  
19 complaint cases investigation and also  
20 protect the NYPD's officer when they  
21 conduct this kind of traffic stop  
22 complaint?

23 Thank you.

24 MS. SIMMONS: First of all, I am  
25 just delighted that we have not one, but

1 two John Jay students that are  
2 interested in the work of the CCRB --  
3 and not just this CCRB, but CCRB and  
4 similar organizations and institutions  
5 across the country.

6 My request is that, please not only  
7 share your resulting research, but  
8 please do share the research questions  
9 that you were looking at, even if you  
10 abandon some of them, so that we know  
11 where your interest is.

12 And I'm going to ask the Executive  
13 Director to respond a little bit  
14 directly to what you're saying -- what  
15 you're asking, but I would like to say  
16 that I did not completely understand  
17 everything you were saying, so I hope he  
18 did.

19 MR. DARCHE: So, to echo Ms.  
20 Simmons, thank you for your interest.

21 With regard to using technology to  
22 investigate complaints of misconduct  
23 during traffic stops, the NYPD is  
24 supposed to be using their body-worn  
25 cameras when they are conducting traffic

1 stops, and so we have access to  
2 body-worn camera footage that is -- that  
3 is recorded by members of service when  
4 they are conducting a traffic stop.

5 It requires activation by the member  
6 of service, so it is not foolproof that  
7 we will have footage, but it does give  
8 us -- when we are conducting  
9 investigations with body-worn camera  
10 footage, as well as other videos, such  
11 as cellphone video or surveillance video  
12 from a nearby location, it gives the  
13 agency a much better chance of making  
14 determinations on the merits of a  
15 particular allegation, rather than being  
16 unable to come to a conclusion and  
17 having to make a determination of  
18 un-substantiation about a particular  
19 allegation.

20 Un-substantiation means we couldn't  
21 say whether misconduct -- whether the  
22 conduct that occurred was misconduct by  
23 a preponderance of the evidence, and a  
24 preponderance of the evidence is  
25 slightly more than 50 percent.

1 MS. SIMMONS: Thank you again, and  
2 we will ask you, and your colleague as  
3 well, to please share your research  
4 recommendations, and your final reports  
5 or papers with us. And any ideas you  
6 have on improvement, be in touch with  
7 our office so that we can put you in  
8 touch with staff that would be more than  
9 interested to speak with you.

10 Thank you again for your interest  
11 and for your most intelligent question.

12 Any other people online?

13 MR. ROSE: Yes, our next speaker is  
14 Shaniel Douglas.

15 MS. SIMMONS: Go ahead, ma'am.

16 MS. DOUGLAS: Hello. Good  
17 afternoon. I'm also a John Jay student.

18 MS. SIMMONS: We're on a roll.

19 MS. DOUGLAS: So, about three years  
20 ago the CCRB Chief on NYPD disciplines  
21 testified at a City Council Public  
22 Safety Committee Hearing.

23 They -- you -- the CCRB was asking  
24 for final authority on CCRB discipline  
25 and the outcome of that hearing was that

1 the City Council is asking the State  
2 Legislator, which is where the authority  
3 now lies for making the change.

4 So, I'm wondering if there are any  
5 updates on that situation.

6 MS. SIMMONS: It's exactly where it  
7 was before, unfortunately, in my  
8 opinion. I'm not speaking for the  
9 entire Board. I'm speaking for myself.

10 So, no, it has not been changed the  
11 jurisdiction of -- I'm sorry -- the  
12 jurisdiction to actually make final  
13 determinations on cases that come before  
14 the CCRB still lies with the Police  
15 Commissioner.

16 Are you still there, ma'am?

17 MS. DOUGLAS: Yeah, I'm sorry --  
18 yeah.

19 MS. SIMMONS: Okay -- fine. Okay.

20 And I urge you to stay watch -- keep  
21 close watch, as we all are, because, as  
22 we all know, things are changing very,  
23 very quickly in government -- state,  
24 federal, and city.

25 So, let's see what happens in this

1 year to come. But this is not the first  
2 time that -- that that request has been  
3 made to the State Legislature. Our  
4 hopes always remain high, but thus far,  
5 the State Legislature, in their wisdom,  
6 has not determined that that is the  
7 direction they want to go.

8 And, again, I'm speaking for myself,  
9 not for the entire Board.

10 Thank you for your interest. I have  
11 a question.

12 Who is your professor that has  
13 turned you on to the CCRB? We want to  
14 know who that advocate -- who our  
15 advocate is at John Jay. John Jay is a  
16 school part of the City University of  
17 New York and I spent most of my career  
18 working for CUNY.

19 So, I would like to just reach out  
20 to that professor and tell them we  
21 appreciate -- or her -- and tell them we  
22 appreciate their interest and turning  
23 you on to this wonderful field.

24 So, could you tell us who your  
25 professor was that encouraged you to do

1 this work?

2 MS. DOUGLAS: It's not -- it's not  
3 really a specific professor. We're  
4 actually a part of a project and we're  
5 collaborating with the Safe Stops Mobile  
6 app on finding a solution on how we can  
7 help the CCRB in improving police  
8 oversight.

9 MS. SIMMONS: All right. Well,  
10 thank you very much and please continue  
11 your work even after you graduate.  
12 Appreciate it.

13 MS. DOUGLAS: Thank you.

14 MS. SIMMONS: Any other questions?

15 (No response.)

16 MS. SIMMONS: Can we have the next  
17 speaker, please?

18 MR. ROSE: The next speaker is  
19 Lottie Almonte.

20 MS. SIMMONS: Please go -- please go  
21 forward.

22 (No response.)

23 MS. SIMMONS: Ms. Almonte, please go  
24 forward.

25 MS. ALMONTE: A Question I wanted to



1 piggyback on --

2 MS. SIMMONS: I'm sorry, we can  
3 barely hear you.

4 MS. ALMONTE: I just wanted to  
5 ask -- do you hear me now?

6 MS. SIMMONS: Yes -- yes.

7 MS. ALMONTE: Okay.

8 MS. SIMMONS: And we see you.

9 MS. ALMONTE: Yeah -- well, it said  
10 "turn on your camera", so I did.

11 MS. SIMMONS: Yay.

12 MS. ALMONTE: Well, good afternoon  
13 and thank you for all the work that you  
14 do and for being here.

15 I just wanted to piggyback on the  
16 response from the Executive Director to  
17 the young man who asked about the -- the  
18 cameras and I just wanted to understand,  
19 what is that -- what does that look  
20 like -- the -- like, the policy?

21 Do they turn -- do they have to ask  
22 permission to turn on their camera or do  
23 they just turn on their camera; Like,  
24 what does that look like for civilians?

25 And thank you.

1 MR. DARCHE: So, members of the NYPD  
2 have certain times when they are  
3 required to turn on their cameras and  
4 certain times when they are required not  
5 to have their cameras activated, and if  
6 ever there is a conflict between  
7 activation and not activation, they are  
8 required to activate their camera.

9 And it is -- they don't have to ask  
10 for permission from the civilian in  
11 order to do so.

12 MS. ALMONTE: Thank you.

13 MS. SIMMONS: You're welcome.

14 Do We have any further comments or  
15 questions online?

16 MR. ROSE: Currently, there are no  
17 additional hands raised. That will  
18 conclude the virtual portion.

19 MS. SIMMONS: All right. It's with  
20 great pleasure that I ask anyone that is  
21 present -- thank you for coming -- that  
22 has a comment or a question to please  
23 approach the podium.

24 You have four minutes.

25 Hello, again.

1 MS. SIMMONS: Hello.

2 MS. MOSS: Hello. My name is Mari  
3 Moss. I spent three terms on Manhattan  
4 Community Board 10 as (indiscernible)  
5 leader after I got my Master's Degree in  
6 Public Administration. So, I now serve  
7 on the Community Action Board for Region  
8 learning, which covers East Harlem and  
9 central Harlem, and we give federal  
10 funding to nonprofit organizations.

11 I need to say again -- I'm echoing  
12 many of the Board members -- welcome to  
13 Mr. Mohammad Khalid, and I want to say,  
14 again, thank you to the CCRB for  
15 standing up for domestic violence.

16 Last month, we had a forum with  
17 Chase Bank and First Deputy Commissioner  
18 Tania Kinsella was there, and I'm  
19 greatly -- I just greatly appreciate the  
20 focus on domestic violence in that  
21 regard.

22 I want to also say thank you to the  
23 CCRB for hearing the youth because they  
24 are our future and I used to always  
25 bring my -- I call them "my three little

1 Harlem girls" -- but my daughters with  
2 me to meetings, and my eldest daughter,  
3 who is now 14, Kalia (phonetic), would  
4 always get up and ask a question.

5 So, that is giving us encouragement  
6 and it gives us foresight on how to be  
7 proactive for young people's futures and  
8 I think that's important.

9 And now I want to say, we're on  
10 Church Street, and this is not church,  
11 but I'm going to go to church for a few  
12 minutes because I want to think about  
13 Dr. Martin Luther King -- and he's one  
14 of my favorite leaders who was always  
15 about peace -- but even he said that a  
16 threat to justice anywhere is a threat  
17 to justice everywhere, and I look at the  
18 CCRB as upholding justice in our  
19 communities, and in order to do that,  
20 you have to realize that all politics is  
21 local.

22 All the decisions that you all make,  
23 that is how the ripple-up happens, and  
24 although we learned just today that our  
25 Commissioner was recommissioned from the

1 Sanitation Department to now the  
2 Commissioner of the NYPD, one thing that  
3 I must point out is that we've had an  
4 amazing woman leading this body -- Arva  
5 Rice -- and she could not -- I mean, she  
6 was the Interim Chair -- I know this is  
7 going to be echoed again.

8 She was the Interim Chair for  
9 several months -- I think even over a  
10 year -- years, and it took one day for  
11 us to get a new Commissioner of the  
12 NYPD, which I thought CCRB was consulted  
13 about that, being that there are  
14 appointees from the City Council and the  
15 Commissioner.

16 So, I just -- I think that that is  
17 something that we need to look at, that  
18 maybe there needs to be some dialog  
19 between City Hall, the Mayor's Office,  
20 and the CCRB before appointees are made  
21 to get some kind of feedback between the  
22 bodies -- and that is of concern to me.

23 And then the last thing I want to  
24 say that is a concern to me is  
25 motherhood -- protection of motherhood

1 in our City. I don't know what is going  
2 on; why we treat -- while we allow our  
3 women to be disrespected by domestic  
4 violence, sexual assault.

5 You know, our bodies are supposed to  
6 serve and protect and that is of concern  
7 to me when our police are extra  
8 volatile.

9 When I heard about the cameras, you  
10 know, I stood up here a few months ago  
11 and explained, you know, that I went  
12 through some police brutality. You  
13 know, as a domestic violence victim,  
14 I've called the police and asked them to  
15 intervene on situations.

16 No one wants to stand up and say,  
17 "I've been a victim of domestic  
18 violence", but when it happens -- when a  
19 woman stands up for herself, she stands  
20 up for other women -- so said Maya  
21 Angelou -- and this is an opportunity  
22 for us to get some things right.

23 We have got to -- and I serve on a  
24 task force -- the Mayor's Task Force --  
25 to train domestic violence -- I mean, to

1 train police officers for domestic  
2 violence.

3 But the point is that I'd like to  
4 see justice in handling in how we handle  
5 these situations going forward and  
6 making sure that, you know, when we see  
7 young people that are watching our  
8 police, that they are upholding their  
9 standards at the highest degree that  
10 respects our country and our City.

11 Thank you.

12 MS. SIMMONS: Thank you so much for  
13 your attendance, and for your comments,  
14 and for following our activities.

15 We have duly-noted, as we mentioned  
16 before, in regard to special protocols  
17 and special training that's given to our  
18 investigators and now -- and now, almost  
19 across the board, to all of our  
20 investigators, so that they handle  
21 trauma-related instances with the  
22 sensitivity that they need to.

23 Of course, we can always do more.  
24 So, we recommend -- we thank you for  
25 your recommendation and I also -- I'm

1 just talking personally now about, you  
2 know, when people see officers engaging  
3 in violence, whether it is justified or  
4 not, it does have a traumatic effect on  
5 people, and particularly youth.

6 So, we appreciate the sensitivity  
7 that you bring to that subject, and  
8 every member of this Board is very  
9 sensitive to it, whether they -- whether  
10 complaints are filed or not. We only  
11 see the ones when they're filed, but we  
12 understand that there -- it occurs every  
13 day and that our communities need to  
14 know that policing is being done with  
15 the utmost respect for human rights and  
16 human-beings.

17 Thank you.

18 MR. DARCHE: Madam Chair, before we  
19 go to the next speaker, Ms. Moss  
20 reminded me of something.

21 MS. SIMMONS: One minute. I'm  
22 just -- I'm suffering from spring  
23 allergies in the fall, folks. So, just  
24 excuse me. I'm dripping and blowing my  
25 nose.



1 Please go ahead.

2 MR. DARCHE: Okay. The -- so, the  
3 thing I wanted to bring up was -- well,  
4 Ms. Moss brought up the need for showing  
5 respect to women and mothers.

6 Today is also the Trans Day of  
7 Visibility and it is also possible for  
8 trans folk, and just men, to be victims  
9 of sexual misconduct as well.

10 And so I just -- while the -- while  
11 our agency is committed to investigating  
12 allegations of sexual misconduct against  
13 women, we will also investigate  
14 allegations of sexual misconduct against  
15 men and sexual misconduct against trans  
16 folks as well.

17 MS. SIMMONS: Thank you.

18 Next speaker, please.

19 MR. MYERS: I'm Michael Myers,  
20 President of New York Civil Rights  
21 Coalition.

22 I really didn't expect to be here  
23 today, except I learned that Esmeralda  
24 Simmons was going to be the temporary  
25 acting Chair, and out of respect for

1 Esmeralda Simmons -- and she doesn't  
2 believe this -- that's the only reason  
3 that I came here today because I would  
4 get to speak first if I were outside on  
5 those -- on those other things you got  
6 that don't work for me. The website  
7 doesn't work for me. So, here I am.

8 I want to congratulate Esmeralda  
9 Simmons personally for your leadership,  
10 and for your clarity, and for your  
11 determination against all odds. So, I  
12 want you to know that for the record.

13 MS. SIMMONS: Thank you, Mr. Myers.

14 MR. MYERS: Secondly, has anyone  
15 inquired -- well, he's still the Mayor,  
16 right -- has anyone inquired -- inquired  
17 -- inquired of Mayor Adams, or the new  
18 Deputy Mayor -- whatever her name is --

19 MS. SIMMONS: The new Commissioner.

20 MR. MYERS: No, no, not the  
21 Commissioner, the Deputy Mayor -- either  
22 the Mayor or the Deputy Mayor, who the  
23 new -- the newest one who gets all the  
24 press now -- has anybody inquired of  
25 them about why it's taking so long to

1 make a permanent Chair of the Civilian  
2 Complaint Review Board? Has anybody  
3 inquired; has anybody inquired of the  
4 Mayor and his people why it's taking so  
5 long?

6 Now, we've had an Interim Chair for  
7 at least a year or maybe two years. It  
8 was great, but she was kicked out.  
9 Despite the rhetoric of the other  
10 previous meeting, she was kicked out and  
11 she was kicked out by Mayor Eric Adams.

12 Now, there has to be some  
13 accountability my friends when one of  
14 your own gets kicked out -- kicked  
15 out -- and then we have a very good  
16 Mayor. We don't even know what happened  
17 and she came here out of respect and,  
18 professionally speaking, she let it go.  
19 She let it go -- and I give that to her.  
20 I give her credit for that.

21 But I wouldn't have let it go -- but  
22 I'm still not going to let it go because  
23 she's a civil rights leader. She's a  
24 decent person. She's a professional and  
25 she's one of yours. You People sit

1           around here and everyone is quiet. I  
2           haven't seen any letters going to the  
3           Mayor yet protesting how one of your own  
4           was kicked out.

5           So, I always say, you know, you're  
6           next. When there's silence -- when  
7           there's no concern -- when there's no  
8           dissent, you're next.

9           So, welcome, Mr. Dr. Mohammed back.  
10          (Laughter.) You're next.

11          So, no letter, I assume, has been  
12          sent from the CCRB Board to the Mayor  
13          and/or Deputy Mayor about getting a  
14          Chair of this Commission.

15          Moving on because I know my time is  
16          limited.

17          The website -- that worked for them.  
18          It doesn't work for me. I don't know if  
19          it's my technology or my equipment, but  
20          it doesn't work for me. So, I come here  
21          to make sure we're heard because I think  
22          a voice of civil rights has to be heard  
23          directly at these meetings.

24          So, I hope that we had some report  
25          from the Executive Director about the

November 20, 2024

45

1 status of the website. I thought we're  
2 going to maybe get a new vendor. I hope  
3 so because this other vendor, I don't  
4 have any interest in, like, stopping it.  
5 It ain't working for me and it doesn't  
6 work on my end.

7 Also, I asked the Executive Director  
8 two months ago -- I'm not going to bring  
9 it up -- for a report. I'm not going to  
10 bring it up. Next month, I'm going to  
11 bring it up.

12 MR. DARCHE: Yes, sir.

13 MR. MYERS: Okay. I think we're  
14 entitled to that report because I wanted  
15 to make my presentation on that report  
16 today. I don't -- I can't give a  
17 presentation on it because I don't have  
18 the report.

19 Now, in -- the temporary  
20 transition -- or whatever he is --  
21 Police Commissioner -- have we asked --  
22 "we" meaning you -- have you asked for a  
23 meeting with the -- with the Police  
24 Commissioner?

25 You know, there was a time the

1 Police Commissioners met with the  
2 Board -- the CCR (sic) Board -- the CCRB  
3 Board. There was a time the CCR (sic)  
4 Board was willing to meet with the  
5 Police Commissioner because you had  
6 something to tell him, especially when  
7 they write -- not this guy, because he's  
8 brand new -- when they write and dissent  
9 from which you have recommended.

10 What kind of nonsense is this coming  
11 from a professional -- coming from the  
12 Police Commissioner of New York City --  
13 and he only does that in disrespect --  
14 in disrespecting you because the Mayor  
15 disrespects you.

16 MR. DARCHE: Mr. Myers, there were  
17 reports earlier today that the Mayor  
18 announced the new Police Commissioner --

19 MR. MEYERS: Another one?

20 MR. DARCHE: Yes -- so, it's --

21 MR. MYERS: So, who's that?

22 MR. DARCHE: -- that's going to be  
23 the current Commissioner of the  
24 Department of Sanitation, Jessica Tisch.

25 MR. MYERS: Jessica Tisch?

In Re November Public Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint Review  
Board

November 20, 2024

47

1 MR. DARCHE: Yes.

2 MR. MYERS: Oh, lord. I'm not going  
3 to say, "never mind", but it's -- my  
4 comments are for the record. I mean,  
5 this Mayor is so ridiculous. I mean,  
6 really ridiculous.

7 So, we're now going to have another  
8 place without -- I hope you're going to  
9 ask for a meeting with the brand new  
10 Police Commissioner, Jessica Tisch.

11 Is she related to the Tisches --  
12 that Tisch?

13 MS. SIMMONS: Which Tisch -- oh, she  
14 is?

15 MR. MYERS: Mm-hmm -- I'm sure she  
16 is. I'm sure -- I knew that already.

17 Now, in terms of the feedback from  
18 the youth -- the youth -- the Youth  
19 Forum, how many feedback --

20 MS. SIMMONS: So, please watch your  
21 time cause you're over.

22 MR. MYERS: Yeah, I know -- I know.

23 And I just -- I'm glad that we had a  
24 forum for the youth, but I'm telling  
25 you, 50 or 55 people from Harlem ain't a

1 lot of people. But I do want to know if  
2 it's online or if there's some feedback  
3 from the -- from the session from the  
4 young people cause I would love to read  
5 it. I would love to hear it; I would  
6 love to see it online.

7 And so -- in the old days, we used  
8 to get 200 people to a CCRB meeting -- a  
9 meeting -- a public meeting session  
10 because a lot of people have problems.  
11 They have complaints and it's not that  
12 they don't have complaints anymore.  
13 They do have complaints, but some people  
14 just don't have the patience and we are  
15 running out of patience.

16 MS. SIMMONS: Thank you.

17 Are there any other speakers or  
18 comments?

19 Welcome.

20 MS. KHRAMOVA: Good afternoon,  
21 Board. I'd like to start with  
22 something --

23 MS. SIMMONS: Your name, please.

24 MS. KHRAMOVA: My name is Vera.

25 MS. SIMMONS: Spell that -- I'm



In Re November Public Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint Review  
Board  
November 20, 2024

49

1                   sorry. I didn't hear you.

2                   MS. KHRAMOVA: Vera -- Vera,  
3                   V-E-R-A.

4                   MS. SIMMONS: V-E-R-A, Vera --  
5                   what's your last name?

6                   MS. KHRAMOVA: K-H-R-A-M-O-V-A.

7                   MS. SIMMONS: Okay. Go ahead.

8                   MS. KHRAMOVA: I'd like to start  
9                   with something that I didn't anticipate.

10                  I felt very unwelcome arriving at  
11                  the meeting today by the woman in blue.  
12                  I was nervous, standing next to my seat.  
13                  She could have politely told me to sit  
14                  down and explain the rules that,  
15                  apparently, you're not allowed to stand  
16                  down -- to stand up here in this area.

17                  Instead, she was very rude to me,  
18                  and then she called in this man, and  
19                  behind my back, proceeded to tell him,  
20                  "get this woman to sit down", even  
21                  though I was just pacing next to my seat  
22                  because I was nervous and because the  
23                  room was practically empty. I wasn't in  
24                  anyone's way.

25                  MS. SIMMONS: Before the meeting?

1 MS. KHRAMOVA: Yeah.

2 MS. SIMMONS: Okay.

3 MS. KHRAMOVA: So, if this woman in  
4 blue and this man who started telling me  
5 that I'm a troublemaker -- that he's  
6 going escort me out -- well, you  
7 shouldn't have been rude to begin with,  
8 you know -- or if you have such strict  
9 rules, put a note outside saying "no  
10 standing allowed". You should be  
11 perfect to work for police with such  
12 attitude.

13 I'm sorry about this. This is not  
14 the attitude I hoped for. It is just, I  
15 was made to feel this way coming in  
16 here.

17 I'd like to start with -- with this  
18 Civilian Assistance Unit. (Indicating.)  
19 This is a brochure I just picked up in  
20 that area outside. This is the --  
21 apparently, it offers social services,  
22 mental health services, and potentially  
23 legal service.

24 This is the first time I'm hearing  
25 about this. So, why didn't my

1 investigator notify me of this? Why are  
2 people -- I mean, this is completely by  
3 chance that I found out about -- that  
4 you have a special unit.

5 Maybe you should do a better job  
6 of -- if someone already has a case with  
7 you -- an investigation that is  
8 started -- then perhaps it is the job of  
9 the investigator to notify, "Hey, by the  
10 way, we have this -- based on the  
11 details of your case, this is something  
12 that you could benefit from". Otherwise  
13 how are people supposed to find out  
14 about it.

15 Another point that I've noticed in  
16 interactions with my investigator at  
17 least, that it takes a very long time  
18 for me to hear back from her. I don't  
19 know if she's still my investigator or  
20 not.

21 But, for example, just the latest  
22 interaction I had with her over email,  
23 it took me -- for me to send a second  
24 email to her to ask, "Can I please get a  
25 simple acknowledgement that you at least

1 received my letter", and finally, after  
2 almost a week, she -- she responds with  
3 no apology, no explanation; just saying,  
4 "Okay. Yes, I received your -- this  
5 will be noted".

6 So, I don't think it should take a  
7 client of CCRB to follow-up, you know,  
8 and -- and -- and possibly a week to get  
9 -- to get a simple reply. This -- This  
10 wasn't about anything that required an  
11 extensive amount of work on her part.  
12 It just -- it was just for her to say,  
13 "Okay. Noted".

14 Well, I don't think I have the time  
15 to cover the other things I hoped to  
16 cover due to this situation that  
17 completely unbalanced me, but maybe to  
18 reply to what Ms. Moss mentioned --  
19 CCRB's involvement -- involvement with  
20 DV.

21 If -- if Ms. Moss have seen that in  
22 her experience, that's great. But my  
23 case has to do with DV and -- for  
24 example, I have not seen any interest,  
25 or any questions, or any help, or any

1 guidance from CCRB in that regard. So,  
2 I'm not sure how involved CCRB are with  
3 DV.

4 I don't know if you have a special  
5 person, maybe who can help victims of DV  
6 -- or a special department -- but maybe  
7 that is something that you could look  
8 into and -- because DV complicates  
9 things a little bit when you're dealing  
10 with police.

11 MS. SIMMONS: Do you want to  
12 respond?

13 MR. DARCHE: So, Ms. Simmons, I will  
14 look into the -- to the communication  
15 lag between Ms. Vera and her -- and her  
16 investigator, as well as why she was not  
17 informed of the Civilian Assistance  
18 Unit, and I'll report back to the Board  
19 at the next Executive Session.

20 MS. SIMMONS: Okay. Thank you for  
21 raising your issues

22 J MS. JENNINGS: Can you hear me?

23 MS. SIMMONS: Yes -- thank you.

24 MS. JENNINGS: Mr. Darche, I tried  
25 to reach Marly (phonetic). I can reach

1 her.

2 MS. SIMMONS: Can you please give us  
3 your name?

4 MR. DARCHE: Mrs. Jennings.

5 MS. JENNINGS: Ms. Jennings. It's a  
6 stalking issue, but you know about it.

7 You have designees from the Mayor's  
8 Office and from the Police Commissioner,  
9 Dwyer -- Fox, is it -- Fox -- that I  
10 reached out to many, many years ago --  
11 cause it's a stalking issue that started  
12 in 2006, but you know about that.

13 Ms. Charlane, I tried to reach you  
14 at the school. Are you still at a  
15 school? Yeah -- many calls, but I don't  
16 know where the calls go -- over the  
17 summer. No idea where the calls go and  
18 it's extremely urgent.

19 And then there was a -- also a -- I  
20 can't think of his name. He's with a  
21 known law firm -- and Ms. Simmons, I  
22 tried to reach you 10, 15 years ago at  
23 your law school for some advice about  
24 this that started 16 years ago.

25 What I don't understand is that you

1 don't handle stalking here. I  
2 understand that, but I reached out to  
3 people here -- especially Mr. Fox when  
4 he was a Transit Police -- I reached out  
5 years ago. I reached out to Minnie  
6 (phonetic) -- her name was -- what's her  
7 name? She was running for Mayor de  
8 Blasio.

9 MS. SIMMONS: Maya Wiley.

10 MS. JENNINGS: What was her name?

11 MS. SIMMONS: Former Commissioner,  
12 Maya Whalen.

13 MS. JENNINGS: I reached out to all  
14 these wonderful people. I don't get  
15 anything. Okay. Let me enlighten you  
16 and I'll make it quick.

17 February, I reached out to Mr.  
18 Darche because I thought I was having a  
19 stroke. No, it was a sonic attack from  
20 the person over me. I had pain across  
21 here. (Indicating.) I couldn't move  
22 for one hour -- one hour couldn't move.

23 The Mayor, the Governor -- most of  
24 all, the White House -- got emails and  
25 it's in everybody's letter they get

1 about that.

2 February the 5th, I went to the  
3 emergency room thinking I was having a  
4 stroke. June the 25th, I had a heart  
5 attack -- what do you call it -- from  
6 the man over me doing something with  
7 sonic weaponry or something he's got  
8 going up there cause now I stay nauseous  
9 and dizzy. By 4 o'clock, I'm sick.

10 But I reached out to everybody who's  
11 anyone and I said just what I'm saying  
12 now to all in the emails. See, I  
13 wouldn't have had the second heart  
14 attack if you would have dealt with this  
15 drama of now 2006 -- what's this -- 18  
16 years.

17 Yeah, if you would have dealt with  
18 the drama, it would have been ended,  
19 but, you know, I don't know -- and I'm  
20 gonna enlighten you before I leave.

21 Three presidents got letters from  
22 Ms. Jennings. Every camera I've ever  
23 passed seen those letters. Mr. Darche  
24 knows about it. The CEOs names are on  
25 the top of the letters, and as of Trump



1 coming in, it's going to be taken to the  
2 (indiscernible) on the top of those  
3 letters to the White House.

4 I don't understand any of this  
5 cause, see, you come from the Police  
6 Department and you come from the Mayor,  
7 so you must know what's what. If I've  
8 come here for years and reached out for  
9 help -- you don't handle stalking. You  
10 don't, but her name is Lisa Lee and  
11 she's the customer service at MTA.

12 She just got a call from me at Booth  
13 310 on 149th, I'm lying and we know I  
14 don't lie. The amount of people that  
15 went through that don't pay  
16 (indiscernible) -- I don't know why.  
17 Oh, it gets better.

18 From 11 o'clock to 3 a.m. the staff  
19 in the emergency room at North Central  
20 marched and no one helped me. No one  
21 helped me as I was having a heart  
22 attack. It went to 216 over 109. Mr.  
23 Darche knows about it cause I'm sure I  
24 brought that to his attention. I don't  
25 understand any of this.

1           You don't handle stalking, but  
2           you've heard from me way before COVID --  
3           you've heard from me and nobody's  
4           reaching out to the Mayor, the different  
5           Police Commissioners. The lady says  
6           she's sending letters to the White  
7           House -- 3,000 plus. That's not looking  
8           good for New York. It's looking real  
9           bad.

10           I was chased in here. I go out once  
11           a week. You all know every move I make  
12           because you all just texting all day  
13           long. You never move. You know that --  
14           you know it's drug related. My  
15           (indiscernible) doesn't do drugs and the  
16           person over me is now trying to kill me.  
17           So, I'm very concerned about this.

18           Now, you all figure out what you  
19           could do. I wanted to speak to you  
20           again, but I couldn't get to reach to  
21           you. I left messages. If you could  
22           find time, we could have a little talk  
23           again. If you can, we appreciate. I  
24           can't reach Wiley.

25           Anybody here know a Kathleen Powell,

November 20, 2024

59

1 Fordham University -- anybody? Cause I  
2 had reached out to her in the beginning  
3 of the year when she was at the White  
4 House and I can't seem to reach her.

5 Anybody? Yeah, you all are  
6 professors at -- were professors,  
7 right -- yeah. (Indiscernible) -- very  
8 urgent.

9 So, I greatly need some help if  
10 somebody could figure out what to do. I  
11 have no idea. I don't know what to do.  
12 I fear for my life and safety. I don't  
13 go out anymore because I don't know  
14 who's near me. I see hands coming at  
15 me. It's very scary.

16 You notice me sit there and not make  
17 a move, just watch, cause that's what I  
18 do now. I've done it now for 20 years.  
19 I don't understand this.

20 Let me enlighten you. This is about  
21 drugs, originally -- huge cartel.

22 MS. SIMMONS: Ma'am, I appreciate  
23 that you have a very urgent --

24 MS. JENNINGS: See what you all can  
25 do for me.

In Re November Public Meeting NYC - Civilian Complaint Review  
Board  
November 20, 2024

60

1 MS. SIMMONS: Thank you so much.

2 MS. JENNINGS: Thank you.

3 MS. SIMMONS: Are there any other  
4 persons present that would like to make  
5 comments or ask a question?

6 (No response.)

7 MS. SIMMONS: All right. Seeing  
8 none, we'll turn to old business.

9 Do we have any old business to come  
10 before the Board -- I'm asking Board  
11 members.

12 (No response.)

13 MS. SIMMONS: Hearing, none -- okay.  
14 We'll move to new business. Do we have  
15 any -- yes, do we have any new business  
16 to come before the Board?

17 MR. FOX: Can I please ask the  
18 Executive Director if we can -- there's  
19 a program mediation where sometimes --  
20 when complaints come in, complainants  
21 are given an option of mediating with  
22 the officer and maybe we can get an  
23 overview of that?

24 We've discussed that a little bit  
25 here and there.

1 MR. DARCHE: Sure. Thank you, Mr.  
2 Fox.

3 I think certainly by January, if not  
4 at the December meeting, I'll invite the  
5 Director of the Mediation Units to come  
6 and make a presentation and we'll  
7 probably do it instead of -- either in  
8 addition to or instead of the Outreach  
9 Report.

10 MR. FOX: Thank you.

11 MR. DARCHE: Thank you.

12 MS. SIMMONS: Well, so everybody  
13 understands what that's about, we  
14 actually allow cases to go into  
15 mediation, and complainants are offered  
16 the opportunity, generally, to go to  
17 mediation, and that's a quicker process  
18 and full investigation.

19 They don't have to -- they can  
20 decline and we're asking about what's  
21 happening with that unit.

22 Okay. Any other new business?

23 (No response.)

24 MS. SIMMONS: Mr. Merritt, any new  
25 business?

1 Yes, sir.

2 DR. KHALID: I know when I was back  
3 on CCRB, and at that time, we had  
4 discussion and I proposed that every  
5 borough -- we should have the monthly  
6 meeting in every borough. That will be  
7 a good outreach for the boroughs' people  
8 and -- but I don't know if that has been  
9 happening. That was when I was on CCRB.

10 So, if that's a good thing to go for  
11 outreach, maybe we -- the Board can have  
12 monthly meeting in a different borough  
13 each time and get more people to know  
14 what CCRB is all about.

15 MS. SIMMONS: Well, your wonderful  
16 suggestion was actually in effect.  
17 Until last year, we were going from one  
18 borough to the next, including Staten  
19 Island, for our monthly meetings, and we  
20 had to cease and desist due to budget  
21 expenses.

22 It costs a lot more money to go to  
23 the boroughs and we have not been able  
24 to pick it up as yet. This -- we're in  
25 the new budget year now, but we're still

1 very tight. But it has been an  
2 excellent manner to get outreach and we  
3 get a lot of people that come out from  
4 the boroughs.

5 When we go to the boroughs  
6 themselves, come to the meetings, and  
7 sometimes we're there till 10, 11  
8 o'clock at night listening to folks and  
9 that's great -- that's great. That's  
10 what we're here for.

11 So, yes, it's a wonderful idea.  
12 It's a wonderful practice. I will ask  
13 you to take it up with the Executive  
14 Director in terms of, you know, how the  
15 budget looks now, about whether we can  
16 get this done.

17 I know the outreach team loved it  
18 and was encouraging it, and it was very,  
19 very good for community members, and I'd  
20 say we had -- we would have twice as  
21 many people that are in this room when  
22 we went -- at least -- - when we went to  
23 Board meetings -- and I think the  
24 biggest one was Queens, right?

25 MR. DARCHE: I don't know which

1 is -- there were a bunch of --  
2 especially in the -- in Brooklyn, we had  
3 a bunch of folks, they came out -- and  
4 Staten Island had big meetings too.

5 MS. SIMMONS: Yes, Staten Island was  
6 huge.

7 So, thank you for making that  
8 recommendation again and it's not like  
9 we don't want to do it. We want to do  
10 it. I hope we can afford to do it.

11 MR. DARCHE: So, we -- the borough  
12 meetings are -- take a lot of planning  
13 and effort, in addition to being  
14 expensive.

15 So, right now, we are definitely not  
16 going to do them for the first half of  
17 2025, but we are looking for the second  
18 half of 2025 resuming the program.

19 DR. KHALID: Sure.

20 MS. SIMMONS: Okay. Any other new  
21 business?

22 (No response.)

23 MS. SIMMONS: Okay. Hearing none,  
24 I'm going to move that we break into  
25 Executive Session.



1                   The agenda for the Executive  
2                   Session, the Board will consider three  
3                   full Board cases. The Executive  
4                   Director will discuss pending personnel  
5                   actions and the general counsel will  
6                   provide updates regarding pending  
7                   litigation.

8                   Is there a motion to adjourn to  
9                   Executive Session?

10                  MR. SMITH: So moved

11                  MS. SIMMONS: Thank you.

12                  Do we have a second?

13                  MS. BROWN: Second.

14                  MR. FOX: Second.

15                  MS. SIMMONS: It has been moved and  
16                  seconded. Those in favor?

17                  (Chorus of "Ayes".)

18                  MS. SIMMONS: We move to Executive  
19                  Session. Thank you, all. See you next  
20                  month.

21                  (Time noted: 5:05 p.m.)

22  
23  
24  
25

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

CERTIFICATION

I, JULIA M. SPEROS, a Notary Public for and within the State of New York, do hereby certify:

That the witness whose testimony as herein set forth, was duly sworn by me; and that the within transcript is a true record of the testimony given by said witness.

I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand this 20th day of November, 2024.

  
Julia M. Speros