

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Meeting NYC - Taxi &
Limousine Commission
October 16, 2024

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

-----X
NEW YORK CITY
TAXI & LIMOUSINE COMMISSION
PUBLIC MEETING
-----X

33 Beaver Street
New York, New York
October 16, 2024
10:05 a.m.

H E L D B E F O R E:
DAVID DO - Chair/Commissioner
SHERRYL ELUTO - General Counsel

BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS:
COMMISSIONER PAUL BADER
COMMISSIONER KENNETH CHAN
COMMISSIONER SARAH KAUFMAN
COMMISSIONER KENNETH MITCHELL
COMMISSIONER THOMAS SORRENTINO
COMMISSIONER ELISA VELAZQUEZ

Sabrina Brown Stewart,
Court Reporter

LH Reporting Services, Inc.
Computer-Aided Transcription
(718)526-7100

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Meeting NYC - Taxi &
Limousine Commission
October 16, 2024

2

1 CHAIR DO: Good morning. I'm calling
2 this meeting to order at 10:05 a.m. I am
3 David Do, commissioner and chair of the TLC.
4 I'm joined today by our board of
5 commissioners; Commissioner Velazquez,
6 Commissioner Kaufman, Sorrentino, Mitchell,
7 Bader, and Chan. A few words before we get
8 into business:

9 I would like to thank all of our
10 speakers who participated in last week's
11 public comments hearing about the WAV rules
12 we'll be voting on today. We take public
13 comments very seriously at this agency; they
14 are critical to our rule-making process.
15 Last week, many medallion owners raised
16 concerns about the potential financial
17 difficulties that the federal court order,
18 requiring 100 percent of all new taxi
19 hack-ups to be wheelchair accessible, would
20 place on them. We heard you.

21 In response, we have added a one-time
22 six-month retirement extension for owners of
23 a single medallion who can demonstrate a real
24 hardship when it comes to hacking up
25 wheelchair accessible vehicles. I need to

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Meeting NYC - Taxi &
Limousine Commission
October 16, 2024

1 stress that this is not a get-out-of-WAV-free
2 card. Anyone requesting an extension will be
3 rigorously vetted. We are absolutely
4 committed to increasing accessibility, and we
5 are under a federal court order to institute
6 100 percent of wheelchair accessible vehicle
7 hack-ups until 50 percent of the active fleet
8 is wheelchair accessible. We are required by
9 law to make that a reality by March 31, 2025.

10 The order also requires that the entire
11 fleet be wheelchair accessible by 2028. It's
12 a stark decision that comes at a hard time
13 for the medallion industry. We fought in
14 court for more flexibility. We argued that
15 such a ruling would place yet another burden
16 on an industry that is still recovering from
17 the incredible disruptions caused by the
18 advent of ride shares, the medallion crisis,
19 and a global pandemic, as the industry is
20 still struggling to recover from all of this.

21 We pointed out that thanks to the TLC
22 rules, there is now unprecedented
23 accessibility for those requiring wheelchair
24 accessible vehicles, to get them at the push
25 of a cell phone button from the for-hire

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Meeting NYC - Taxi &
Limousine Commission
October 16, 2024

1 vehicle sector, 90 percent of them within
2 ten minutes or less. The vast majority of
3 those requiring wheelchair accessible
4 vehicles already use FHV's. When you factor
5 that in, we are the most wheelchair
6 accessible city in America. When it comes to
7 getting the vehicle you need, we're getting
8 more accessible by the day. We argued that
9 the spirit of the law is being satisfied, and
10 that this hard-hit medallion industry just
11 needs a little bit more time to reach the
12 letter of the agreement. We argued all of
13 this, and those arguments went unheeded. We
14 lost.

15 That said, make no mistake, this is an
16 agency that follows the letter of the court
17 order. We are 100 percent committed to just
18 following Judge Daniels' ruling. The people
19 requiring the ability to hail a wheelchair
20 accessible taxi have the right to the same
21 access as everyone else, period. They have
22 rightfully fought for wheelchair accessible
23 taxis for years. The TLC has always
24 supported accessibility. It is a core part
25 of our mission, and we are committed to

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Meeting NYC - Taxi &
Limousine Commission
October 16, 2024

5

1 honoring that right and the federal court
2 order.

3 As I also mentioned last week, we're
4 looking at ways to offset the cost of
5 implementing the court order, and we'll soon
6 be introducing the amendments to increase the
7 upfront taxi improvement fund grants, to help
8 get our medallion owners into a better
9 position to meet the requirements; stay tuned
10 for those. And I also want to just make a
11 quick correction, that it's 50 percent of the
12 authorized fleet by 2028, and not the entire
13 fleet.

14 Okay. Now, I would like to turn it
15 over to Sherryl Eluto, to go through the
16 agenda.

17 MS. ELUTO: Good morning.
18 Commissioners, the first item before you are
19 the minutes for the August 14, 2024,
20 Commission Meeting. I will call a vote now
21 to adopt those minutes.

22 All in favor of adopting, please raise
23 your hands.

24 (Hands raised).

25 MS. ELUTO: And the vote passes

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Meeting NYC - Taxi &
Limousine Commission
October 16, 2024

6

1 unanimously. Thank you.

2 I will now call on director of Base and
3 Business Services, Fabian Cancel, to present
4 the base license applications.

5 MR. CANCEL: Good morning,
6 Commissioners and attendees. My name is
7 Fabian Cancel. I'm the director of Base and
8 Business Operations at Long Island City Taxi
9 and Limousine Commission Office.

10 We've presented eight bases for review
11 and approval, and we're awaiting your
12 determination.

13 MS. ELUTO: Commissioners, could we
14 have a vote on adopting the base license --

15 COMMISSIONER BADER: Can I ask a
16 question on this?

17 MR. CANCEL: Certainly.

18 COMMISSIONER BADER: Are all of these
19 renewals, or are some of these first-time
20 applications?

21 MR. CANCEL: These are all renewals.

22 COMMISSIONER BADER: And they're
23 renewals for how many years?

24 MR. CANCEL: They are a three-year
25 license.

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Meeting NYC - Taxi &
Limousine Commission
October 16, 2024

7

1 COMMISSIONER BADER: They're all
2 three-year license.

3 Are there any differences among these,
4 relative to the service they provide, or they
5 all provide the same service?

6 MR. CANCEL: These are all livery
7 bases.

8 MS. ELUTO: Okay. Commissioners, could
9 we have a vote on adopting the base license
10 recommendations?

11 All in favor of adopting the
12 recommendations, please raise your hands.

13 (Hands raised.)

14 MS. ELUTO: And the vote is unanimous.
15 Thank you.

16 MR. CANCEL: Thank you, Commissioners.

17 MS. ELUTO: Commissioners, we'll now
18 turn to Item 5A on the agenda, the 100
19 percent wheelchair accessible vehicles for
20 taxis rule proposal package. The proposed
21 rules were published in the City Record on
22 September 10, 2024, for public comment. A
23 public hearing was held by the TLC on
24 October 10th. On October 11th, the final
25 version of the proposed rule was posted on

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Meeting NYC - Taxi &
Limousine Commission
October 16, 2024

8

1 our website and circulated to the
2 Commissioners, along with the hearing
3 transcript and all written comments that were
4 received.

5 Commissioners, may we move for a vote?
6 All those in favor of adopting the rules
7 amended, please raise your hand.

8 (Hands raised).

9 MS. ELUTO: The rules are adopted
10 unanimously.

11 Commissioners, we will now turn to Item
12 5B on the agenda; the statement of
13 substantial need for earlier implementation
14 of the rule you just adopted. This will
15 allow us to waive the 30-day period normally
16 provided for between the rules promulgation
17 and the time it goes into effect.

18 Commissioners, may we move for a vote?
19 All those in favor of adopting the need for
20 earlier implementation, please raise your
21 hand.

22 (Hands raised.)

23 MS. ELUTO: The proposal is adopted
24 unanimously. Thank you.

25 Commissioner Do, any additional

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Meeting NYC - Taxi &
Limousine Commission
October 16, 2024

1 business?

2 CHAIR DO: Are there any comments from
3 the dais, from any of our commissioners?

4 (No response).

5 CHAIR DO: All right. First and
6 foremost, thank you, everyone, for being here
7 today. This was a difficult vote, but a vote
8 that was needed because of a court order that
9 was agreed upon a decade ago. This is not
10 something that we took lightly, but something
11 that we had to do. But like I have said to
12 many of our advocates, that we will continue
13 to work to structure our funding, so that it
14 makes it easier for many of our drivers to
15 get a wheelchair accessible vehicle, and we
16 will continue to look for federal and state
17 grants to help ease that transition.

18 And at this point, the time is now
19 10:13, and I will conclude this meeting.

20 Thank you.

21 (TIME NOTED: 10:13 a.m.)

22

23

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

STATE OF NEW YORK)

:SS

COUNTY OF QUEENS)

I, Sabrina Brown Stewart, a Notary Public
within and for the State of New York, do hereby
certify:

I further certify that I am not related to
any of these parties to this action by blood or
marriage, and that I am not in any way interested in
the outcome of this matter.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my
hand on this 25th day of October, 2024.

Sabrina Brown Stewart
Sabrina Brown Stewart

**In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Meeting NYC - Taxi &
Limousine Commission**

October 16, 2024

11

& 3	agreement 4:12	base 6:2,4,7,14 7:9 (5)
10th 7:24	allow 8:15	bases 6:10 7:7
11th 7:24	along 8:2	beaver 6
25th 10:14	already 4:4	because 9:8
30day 8:15	also 3:10 5:3,10	before 2:7 5:18
5a 7:18	always 4:23	being 4:9 9:6
5b 8:12	am 8 2:2,2 9:21 10:9,11 (6)	better 5:8
ability 4:19	amended 8:7	between 8:16
about 2:11,16	amendments 5:6	bit 4:11
absolutely 3:3	america 4:6	blood 10:10
access 4:21	among 7:3	board 15 2:4
accessibility 3:4,23 4:24	another 3:15	brown 24 10:6
accessible 2:19,25 3:6,8,11,24 4:3,6,8,20,22 7:19 9:15 (13)	anyone 3:2	burden 3:15
action 10:10	applications 6:4,20	business 2:8 6:3,8 9:1 (4)
active 3:7	approval 6:11	button 3:25
added 2:21	are 2:14 3:3,5,8 4:5,17,25 5:18 6:18,19,21,24 7:3,6 8:9 9:2 (16)	c 10:1,1
additional 8:25	argued 3:14 4:8,12	call 5:20 6:2
adopt 5:21	arguments 4:13	calling 2:1
adopted 8:9,14,23	ask 6:15	can 2:23 6:15
adopting 5:22 6:14 7:9,11 8:6,19 (6)	attendees 6:6	cancel 6:3,5,7,17,21,24 7:6,16 (8)
advent 3:18	august 5:19	card 3:2
advocates 9:12	authorized 5:12	caused 3:17
agency 2:13 4:16	awaiting 6:11	cell 3:25
agenda 5:16 7:18 8:12	b 11	certainly 6:17
ago 9:9	bader 17 2:7 6:15,18,22 7:1 (6)	certify 10:8,9
agreed 9:9		chair 2:1,3 9:2,5 (4)

**In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Meeting NYC - Taxi &
Limousine Commission**

October 16, 2024

12

chaircommissioner 12	d 11	extension 2:22 3:2
chan 18 2:7	dais 9:3	f 11 10:1
circulated 8:1	daniels' 4:18	fabian 6:3,7
city 2 4:6 6:8 7:21 (4)	david 12 2:3	factor 4:4
comes 2:24 3:12 4:6	day 4:8 10:14	favor 5:22 7:11 8:6,19 (4)
comment 7:22	decade 9:9	federal 2:17 3:5 5:1 9:16 (4)
comments 2:11,13 8:3 9:2 (4)	decision 3:12	few 2:7
commission 3 5:20 6:9	demonstrate 2:23	fhvs 4:4
commissioner 17,18,19,20,21,22 2:3,5,6 6:15,18,22 7:1 8:25 (14)	determination 6:12	final 7:24
commissioners 15 2:5 5:18 6:6,13 7:8,16,17 8:2,5,11,18 9:3 (13)	differences 7:3	financial 2:16
committed 3:4 4:17,25	difficult 9:7	first 5:18 9:5
computeraided 25	difficulties 2:17	firsttime 6:19
concerns 2:16	director 6:2,7	fleet 3:7,11 5:12,13 (4)
conclude 9:19	disruptions 3:17	flexibility 3:14
continue 9:12,16	drivers 9:14	following 4:18
core 4:24	e 11,11,11 10:1,1 (5)	follows 4:16
correction 5:11	earlier 8:13,20	foremost 9:6
cost 5:4	ease 9:17	forhire 3:25
could 6:13 7:8	easier 9:14	fought 3:13 4:22
counsel 13	effect 8:17	fund 5:7
county 10:4	eight 6:10	funding 9:13
court 24 2:17 3:5,14 4:16 5:1,5 9:8 (8)	elisa 22	further 10:9
crisis 3:18	else 4:21	general 13
critical 2:14	eluto 13 5:15,17,25 6:13 7:8,14,17 8:9,23 (10)	get 2:7 3:24 5:8 9:15 (4)
	entire 3:10 5:12	getoutofwavfree 3:1
	everyone 4:21 9:6	getting 4:7,7
		global 3:19

**In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Meeting NYC - Taxi &
Limousine Commission**

October 16, 2024

13

go 5:15	improvement 5:7	like 2:9 5:14 9:11
goes 8:17	inc 25	limousine 3 6:9
good 2:1 5:17 6:5	increase 5:6	little 4:11
grants 5:7 9:17	increasing 3:4	livery 7:6
h 11	incredible 3:17	long 6:8
hacking 2:24	industry 3:13,16,19 4:10 (4)	look 9:16
hackups 2:19 3:7	institute 3:5	looking 5:4
hail 4:19	interested 10:11	lost 4:14
hand 8:7,21 10:14	into 2:8 5:8 8:17	majority 4:2
hands 5:23,24 7:12,13 8:8,22 (6)	introducing 5:6	make 3:9 4:15 5:10
hard 3:12	is 3:1,8,16,19,22 4:9,15,24 6:6 7:14 8:23 9:9,18 (13)	makes 9:14
hardhit 4:10	island 6:8	many 2:15 6:23 9:12,14 (4)
hardship 2:24	item 5:18 7:18 8:11	march 3:9
has 4:23	joined 2:4	marriage 10:11
heard 2:20	judge 4:18	matter 10:12
hearing 2:11 7:23 8:2	just 4:10,17 5:10 8:14 (4)	may 8:5,18
held 7:23	kaufman 19 2:6	medallion 2:15,23 3:13,18 4:10 5:8 (6)
help 5:7 9:17	kenneth 18,20	meet 5:9
here 9:6	l 11	meeting 4 2:2 5:20 9:19 (4)
hereby 10:7	last 2:10,15 5:3	mentioned 5:3
hereunto 10:13	law 3:9 4:9	minutes 4:2 5:19,21
honoring 5:1	less 4:2	mission 4:25
how 6:23	letter 4:12,16	mistake 4:15
i'm 2:1,4 6:7	lh 25	mitchell 20 2:6
implementation 8:13,20	license 6:4,14,25 7:2,9 (5)	more 3:14 4:8,11
implementing 5:5	lightly 9:10	morning 2:1 5:17 6:5

**In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Meeting NYC - Taxi &
Limousine Commission**

October 16, 2024

<p>most 4:5</p> <p>move 8:5,18</p> <p>ms 5:17,25 6:13 7:8,14,17 8:9,23 (8)</p> <p>my 6:6 10:13</p> <p>name 6:6</p> <p>need 2:25 4:7 8:13,19 (4)</p> <p>needed 9:8</p> <p>needs 4:11</p> <p>new 2,6,6 2:18 10:2,7 (6)</p> <p>no 4:15 9:4</p> <p>normally 8:15</p> <p>notary 10:6</p> <p>noted 9:21</p> <p>now 3:22 5:14,20 6:2 7:17 8:11 9:18 (7)</p> <p>o 11</p> <p>october 7:24,24 10:14</p> <p>office 6:9</p> <p>offset 5:4</p> <p>onetime 2:21</p> <p>operations 6:8</p> <p>order 2:2,17 3:5,10 4:17 5:2,5 9:8 (8)</p> <p>our 2:4,9,14 4:25 5:8 8:1 9:3,12,13,14 (10)</p> <p>out 3:21</p> <p>outcome 10:12</p> <p>over 5:15</p>	<p>owners 2:15,22 5:8</p> <p>package 7:20</p> <p>pandemic 3:19</p> <p>part 4:24</p> <p>participated 2:10</p> <p>parties 10:10</p> <p>passes 5:25</p> <p>paul 17</p> <p>people 4:18</p> <p>percent 2:18 3:7 4:1,17 5:11 7:19 (6)</p> <p>period 4:21 8:15</p> <p>phone 3:25</p> <p>place 2:20 3:15</p> <p>please 5:22 7:12 8:7,20 (4)</p> <p>point 9:18</p> <p>pointed 3:21</p> <p>position 5:9</p> <p>posted 7:25</p> <p>potential 2:16</p> <p>precent 3:6</p> <p>present 6:3</p> <p>presented 6:10</p> <p>process 2:14</p> <p>promulgation 8:16</p> <p>proposal 7:20 8:23</p> <p>proposed 7:20,25</p>	<p>provide 7:4,5</p> <p>provided 8:16</p> <p>public 4 2:11,12 7:22,23 10:6 (6)</p> <p>published 7:21</p> <p>push 3:24</p> <p>queens 10:4</p> <p>question 6:16</p> <p>quick 5:11</p> <p>r 11 10:1</p> <p>raise 5:22 7:12 8:7,20 (4)</p> <p>raised 2:15 5:24 7:13 8:8,22 (5)</p> <p>reach 4:11</p> <p>real 2:23</p> <p>reality 3:9</p> <p>received 8:4</p> <p>recommendations 7:10,12</p> <p>record 7:21</p> <p>recover 3:20</p> <p>recovering 3:16</p> <p>related 10:9</p> <p>relative 7:4</p> <p>renewals 6:19,21,23</p> <p>reporter 24</p> <p>reporting 25</p> <p>requesting 3:2</p> <p>required 3:8</p>
---	---	---

**In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Meeting NYC - Taxi &
Limousine Commission**

October 16, 2024

15

requirements 5:9	sherryl 13 5:15	taxi 3 2:18 4:20 5:7 6:8 (5)
requires 3:10	signature 10:17	taxis 4:23 7:20
requiring 2:18 3:23 4:3,19 (4)	single 2:23	ten 4:2
response 2:21 9:4	sixmonth 2:22	thank 2:9 6:1 7:15,16 8:24 9:6,20 (7)
retirement 2:22	so 9:13	thanks 3:21
review 6:10	some 6:19	them 2:20 3:24 4:1
ride 3:18	something 9:10,10	these 6:18,19,21 7:3,6 10:10 (6)
right 4:20 5:1 9:5	soon 5:5	they're 6:22 7:1
rightfully 4:22	sorrentino 21 2:6	thomas 21
rigorously 3:3	speakers 2:10	those 3:23 4:3,13 5:10,21 8:6,19 (7)
rule 7:20,25 8:14	spirit 4:9	threeyear 6:24 7:2
rulemaking 2:14	ss 10:3	through 5:15
rules 2:11 3:22 7:21 8:6,9,16 (6)	stark 3:12	time 3:12 4:11 8:17 9:18,21 (5)
ruling 3:15 4:18	state 9:16 10:2,7	tlc 2:3 3:21 4:23 7:23 (4)
sabrina 24 10:6	statement 8:12	today 2:4,12 9:7
said 4:15 9:11	stay 5:9	took 9:10
same 4:20 7:5	stewart 24 10:6	transcript 8:3
sarah 19	still 3:16,20	transcription 25
satisfied 4:9	street 6	transition 9:17
sector 4:1	stress 3:1	tuned 5:9
september 7:22	structure 9:13	turn 5:14 7:18 8:11
seriously 2:13	struggling 3:20	unanimous 7:14
service 7:4,5	substantial 8:13	unanimously 6:1 8:10,24
services 25 6:3	such 3:15	under 3:5
set 10:13	supported 4:24	unheeded 4:13
shares 3:18	t 10:1,1	
	take 2:12	

In Re Taxi and Limousine Commission Meeting NYC - Taxi &
Limousine Commission

October 16, 2024	
unprecedented 3:22	week's 2:10
until 3:7	went 4:13
up 2:24	wheelchair 2:19,25 3:6,8,11,23 4:3,5,19,22 7:19 9:15 (12)
upfront 5:7	when 2:24 4:4,6
upon 9:9	whereof 10:13
us 8:15	who 2:10,23
use 4:4	will 3:2 5:20 6:2 8:11,14 9:12,16,19 (8)
vast 4:2	within 4:1 10:7
vehicle 3:6 4:1,7 9:15 (4)	witness 10:13
vehicles 2:25 3:24 4:4 7:19 (4)	words 2:7
velazquez 22 2:5	work 9:13
version 7:25	would 2:9,19 3:15 5:14 (4)
very 2:13	written 8:3
vetted 3:3	x 1,5
vote 5:20,25 6:14 7:9,14 8:5,18 9:7,7 (9)	years 4:23 6:23
voting 2:12	yet 3:15
waive 8:15	york 2,6,6 10:2,7 (5)
want 5:10	your 5:23 6:11 7:12 8:7,20 (5)
wav 2:11	1005 8 2:2
way 10:11	1013 9:19,21
ways 5:4	2024 16 5:19 7:22 10:14 (4)
we'll 2:12 5:5 7:17	2025 3:9
we're 4:7 5:3 6:11	2028 3:11 5:12
we've 6:10	
website 8:1	
week 2:15 5:3	